

Notes on the Study of Later Kabbalah in English

THE SAFED PERIOD & LURIANIC KABBALAH

Don Karr

© Don Karr, 1985-2005; revised 2006; enlarged 2006-2017

Email: dko618@yahoo.com

All rights reserved.

License to Copy

This publication is intended for personal use only. Paper copies may be made for personal use. With the above exception, no part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopy, without permission in writing from the author. Reviewers may quote brief passages.

The original version of this paper appeared in *Collected Articles on the Kabbalah*, vol. 2 by D. Karr (Ithaca: KoM #6, 1985): pp. 23-31.

THE SMALL GALILEAN TOWN of Safed (also Tzefat or Zfat) flourished in the sixteenth century as a center of Jewish ideals and spirituality in all of their expressions: law, ethics, philosophy, and mysticism. This community was home to great teachers and thinkers whose works and ideas have proven some of the most influential in all of Judaism.

Luminaries of the great Safed period include Joseph Karo (1488-1575), the renowned legalist, whose codification of Jewish law, *Shulhan Arukh* (THE SET TABLE), is authoritative to this day, and Elijah de Vidas, author of the popular kabbalistic ethical treatise, *Reshith Hokhmah* (THE BEGINNING OF WISDOM). Moses Cordovero (1522-70) was a late exponent of the classical *kabbalah*; a prolific writer, Cordovero succeeded in systematizing a vast and disparate body of kabbalistic lore.

Dominant among these figures was Isaac Luria (1534-1572). Though Luria wrote very little himself, his developments of the *kabbalah*, primarily as recorded by his chief disciple Hayyim Vital, shaped later Kabbalism and, ultimately, Hasidism. To quote Gershom Scholem,

The Lurianic Kabbalah was the last religious movement in Judaism the influence of which became preponderant among all sections of Jewish people and in every country of the Diaspora, without exception. (*Major Trends in Jewish Mysticism*, 3rd edition [London: Thames & Hudson, 1955], pages 285-6)

It should be noted at the outset that there is still a woeful lack of translated material from this period. For example, we have seen but fragments of Cordovero's *Elimah Rabbati* (THE GREAT ELIM) and *Ohr Yakar* (PRECIOUS LIGHT—a commentary on the Zohar) in English. A full translation of *Pardes Rimmonim* (ORCHARD OF POMEGRANATES), Cordovero's ranging—and ultimately quite popular—compilation of *kabbalah*, from Providence University (translator: Elyakim Getz) was underway but now seems to have been left incomplete. Some Lurianic works, such as those compiled by Hayyim Vital, have found their way into English in recent years, but these renderings are far from complete.

OVERVIEWS & PRE-LURIANIC

Safed

Bension, Ariel. “The Centres of Sepharadi Mysticism after Leaving Spain” = CHAPTER XIV, in *The Zohar in Moslem & Christian Spain* (New York: Hermon Press, 1974).

Biale, David. “Jewish Mysticism in the Sixteenth Century,” in *An Introduction to the Medieval Mystics of Europe*, edited by Paul Szarmach (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1984).

Dan, Joseph. “Mystical Ethics in Sixteenth-Century Safed” = CHAPTER 4 of *Jewish Mysticism and Jewish Ethics* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1986).

Elior, Rachel. “Messianic Expectations and Spiritualization of Religious Life in the Sixteenth Century,” in *Revue des Études juives*, CXLV (1-2) (Paris: [janv.-juin] 1986); reprinted in *Essential Papers on Jewish Culture in Renaissance and Baroque Italy*, edited by David Ruderman (New York – London: New York University Press, 1992).

Faiersstein, Morris M. “Safed Kabbalah and the Sephardic Heritage,” in *Sephardic & Mizrahi Jewry: From the Golden Age of Spain to Modern Times*, edited by Zion Zohar (New York: New York University Press, 2005); also in Faiersstein’s collection of papers, *From Safed to Kotsk: Studies in Kabbalah and Hasidism* (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2013).

Fine, Lawrence. “New Approaches to the Study of Kabbalistic Life in 16th-Century Safed,” in *Jewish Mysticism and Kabbalah: New Insights and Scholarship*, edited by Frederick E. Greenspahn (New York – London: New York University Press, 2011).

_____. *Safed Spirituality. The Rules of Mystical Piety: The Beginning of Wisdom* [THE CLASSICS OF WESTERN SPIRITUALITY] (Ramsey: Paulist Press, 1984).

Fine’s introduction gives historical and religious background to his presentation of “The Rules of Mystical Piety” as codified by Cordovero, Luria, Karo, and others, and practiced by Safed mystics.

Garb, Jonathan. “The Psychological Turn in Sixteenth Century Kabbalah,” in *Les mystiques juives, chrétiennes et musulmanes dans l’Égypte médiévale (VII^e-XVI^e siècles)*, edited by Guisepppe Cecere, mireille Loubet, and Samuela Pagani (Cairo: Institut Français d’Archéologie Orientale, 2013), pages 109-124.

Giller, Pinchas. “Recovering the Sanctity of the Galilee: The Veneration of Relics in Classical Kabbalah,” in *The Journal of Jewish Thought and Philosophy*, vol. 4 (Harwood Academic Publishers GmbH, 1994).

Gutwirth, Israel. *The Kabbalah and Jewish Mysticism* (New York: Philosophical Library, 1987).

Brief discussions of topics and personalities, including “The Holy City of Safed, Cradle of Kabbalah,” “Ari the Saint: A Star That Shone with a Light of Its Own,” “Rabbi Chaim Vital: The Faithful Disciple of the Ari Hakodosh,” “Rabbi Yeshayahu Halevi Horvitz: Shela the Saint” and “Rabbi Joseph Caro: Compiler of the *Shulhan Arukh*.”

Hoffman, Lawrence A. (ed.) *My People’s Prayer Book: Traditional Prayers, Modern Commentaries*, volume 8: KABBALAT SHABBAT – WELCOMING SHABBAT IN THE SYNAGOGUE (Woodstock: Jewish Lights Publishing, 2005).

Idel, Moshe. “On Mobility, Individuals and Groups: Prolegomenon for a Sociological Approach to Sixteenth-Century Kabbalah,” in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Three, edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 1998).

_____. “Revelation and the ‘Crisis of Tradition’ in Kabbalah,” in *Constructing Tradition: Means and Myths of Transmission in Western Esotericism*, edited by Andreas B. Kilcher (Leiden – Boston: Brill: 2010).

§ 4. *A Zohar for the Shekhinah according to Moses Cordovero*

§ 5. *R. Joseph Karo and the Revelation of the Feminine Divine Powers*

§ 6. *R. Isaac Luria Ashkenazi: Revelation as Source of Kabbalah*

Kaplan, Aryeh. “Safed” = CHAPTER 5, in *Meditation and Kabbalah* (York Beach: Samuel Weiser, 1982).

_____. *Meditation and the Bible* (New York: Samuel Weiser, 1978).

Kaplan includes quotes from Cordovero’s *Pardes Rimmonim* and Vital’s *Sha’arei Qedusha* shedding light on biblical techniques of meditation.

Koch, Patrick B. *Human Self-Perception: A Re-Assessment of Kabbalistic Musar-Literature of Sixteenth-Century Safed* (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2015).

Pachter, Mordechai. “Kabbalistic Ethical Literature in Sixteenth-Century Safed,” in *Binah*, vol. 3: JEWISH INTELLECTUAL HISTORY IN THE MIDDLE AGES, edited by Joseph Dan (Westport: Praeger Publishers, 1994).

Putzu, Vadim. *BOTTLED POETRY / QUENCHER OF HOPES: WINE AS A SYMBOL AND AS AN INSTRUMENT IN SAFEDIAN KABBALAH AND BEYOND* (Ph.D. diss., Jerusalem: Hebrew Union College – Jewish Institute of Religion, 2015).

Chapter 3. Joseph Karo

Chapter 4. Solomon Halevi Alqabetz

Chapter 5. Moses Cordovero

Rossoff, Dovid. *Safed – The Mystical City* (Jerusalem: Sha’ar Books, 1991).

Schechter, Solomon. “Safed in the Sixteenth Century—A City of Legalists and Mystics,” in *Studies in Judaism*, SECOND SERIES (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 1908), pages 202-285; and (*idem*) *Studies in Judaism*, A SELECTION (Cleveland: Jewish Publication Society, and The World Publishing Company, 1958), pages 231-297.

Schechter’s article is considered a classic, but now see

Wolfson, Elliot R. “Asceticism, Mysticism, and Messianism: A Reappraisal of Schechter’s Portrait of Sixteenth-Century Safed,” in *The Jewish Quarterly Review*, Vol.106, No. 2 (Philadelphia: Herbert D. Katz Center for Advanced Judaic Studies, Spring 2016), pages 166-177.

Scholem, Gershom. *Kabbalah* (articles from *ENCYCLOPEDIA JUDAICA*) (Jerusalem and New York: Keter Publishing House and Times Books, 1974; rpt. New York: Meridian, 1978; rpt. New York: Dorset Press, 1987):

pp. 67-79: “The Kabbalah after the Expulsion from Spain and the New Center in Safed”

Shamir, Yehudah. *The Spider and the Raven: Six Kabbalists of Sixteenth Century Safed* (Austin: I. D. A. Press, 1971).

Source material from Solomon Alkabez (*Ayeleth Ahayim*), Moses Cordovero (*Pardes Rimmonim*), Moses Alshekh (*Shoshanath Ha’Amakim*), Abraham Galante (*Kinath Setarim*), Hayyim Vital (*Sefer HaGilgulim*), and Israel ben Moses Najara (*Zemiroth Yisrael*).

Silberman, Neil Asher. “A Mystical City” = CHAPTER 5 of *Heavenly Powers: Unraveling the Secret History of the Kabbalah* (New York: Grosset/Putnam, 1998).

Silberman’s is one of the better popular books on Kabbalah.

Twersky, Isadore. “Talmudists, Philosophers, Kabbalists: The Quest for Spirituality in the Sixteenth Century,” in *Jewish Thought in the Sixteenth Century*, edited by Bernard Cooperman (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1983).

Weinstein, Roni. *Kabbalah and Jewish Modernity* (Oxford – Portland: The Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2016).

“This book examines kabbalah’s passage from the esoteric to the public domain. Few aspects of Jewish life and religious practice were not touched, commented upon, and eventually changed as a result of the spread of kabbalah.” (Weinstein, page 3) The *kabbalah* Weinstein speaks of is that developed in Safed in the sixteenth century. Thus, we find references to Joseph Karo, Moses Cordovero, and, more prominently, Isaac Luria, with his primary follower, Hayyim Vital.

_____. “Kabbalistic Innovation in Jewish Confraternities in the Early Modern Mediterranean,” in *Faith’s Boundaries: Laity and Clergy in Early Modern Confraternities*, edited by Nicholas Terpstra, Adriano Prosperi, and Stefania Pastore [EUROPA SACRA, Volume 6] (Turnhout [Belgium]: Brepols, 2012) pages 234-247.

Werblowsky, R. J. Zwi. “The Safed Revival and Its Aftermath,” in *Jewish Spirituality II: FROM THE SIXTEENTH-CENTURY REVIVAL TO THE PRESENT* [Volume 14: WORLD SPIRITUALITY], edited by Arthur Green (New York: The Crossroad Publishing Company, 1987); hereafter *Jewish Spirituality II*.

NOTE: *Abraham Galante: A Biography* by Albert Kalderon (New York: Sepher Hermon Press, Inc., 1983) is frequently listed among works on kabbalists of sixteenth-century Safed. This book is not about Abraham ben Mordecai Galante (d. 1560), student of Cordovero and author of kabbalistic commentaries, but rather a more recent member of the same family, Abraham Galante (1873-1961), journalist, historian, and Turkish nationalist, who “served as a deputy in the Grand National Assembly of Turkey” and “a professor at the University of Istanbul.”

Joseph Karo

Alexander, Philip S. *Textual Sources for the Study of Judaism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990).

§ 5.2 THE SHULHAN ARUKH (pages 90-95)—translated excerpts: § 5.2.1. *Hoshen Mishpat* 26:1-6 – Prohibition against resorting to non-Jewish courts; § 5.2.2. *Yoreh De'ah* 335:1-10 – Laws regarding visiting the sick; § 5.2.3. *Qizzur Shulhan Arukh* 36:1-28 – Laws regarding the salting of meat.

Gaster, Moses. “The Origin and Sources of the Shulchan Arukh,” in *Studies and Texts in Folklore, Magic, Medieval Romance, Hebrew Apocrypha, and Samaritan Archaeology* (London: Maggs Brothers, 1928; rpt, New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1971).

Gordon, Hirsch Loeb. *The Maggid of Caro: The Mystic Life of the Eminent Codifier Joseph Caro as Revealed in his Secret Diary* BASED ON UNPUBLISHED MANUSCRIPTS (New York: Pardes Publishing House, Inc./The Shoulson Press, 1949).

Idel, Moshe. “Revelation and the ‘Crisis of Tradition’ in Kabbalah,” in *Constructing Tradition: Means and Myths of Transmission in Western Esotericism*, edited by Andreas B. Kilcher (Leiden – Boston: Brill: 2010):

§ 5. R. Joseph Karo and the Revelation of the Feminine Divine Powers

Jaacov, Even Chen. *Mara: Rabbi Joseph Karo: Life Story*. (Jerusalem: Haktav Institute, 1992).

Jacobs, Louis. “The Communication of the Heavenly Mentor to Rabbi Joseph Karo” = CHAPTER 10 of *Jewish Mystical Testimonies* (New York: Schocken Books, 1977).

Six passages from *Maggid Mesharim*.

Karo, Rabbi Yosef. *A Maggid [Preacher] of Righteousness*. Edited by Rabbi Yechiel Bar Lev; translated by K. Skaist (Petach Tikva: Rabbi Yechiel Bar Lev [Yedid Nefesh], n.d. [released June 2009]).

An English translation of *Maggid Mesharim*.

Putzu, Vadim. BOTTLED POETRY (noted fully above, page 3).

Chapter 3, Joseph Karo

Segol, Marla. "Performing Exile in Safed School Kabbalah," in *Magic, Ritual, and Witchcraft*, volume 7, issue 2 (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, Winter 2012), pages 131-163.

Werblowsky, R.J. Zwi. *Joseph Karo: Lawyer and Mystic* (Oxford: Oxford University Press [at the Clarendon Press], 1962 [SCRIPTA JUDAICA • IV] / Philadelphia: The Jewish Publication Society of America, 1962; rpt. JPS 1977).

Karo not only wrote *Shulhan Arukh* (THE SET TABLE) but also kept a diary of his conversations with a celestial mentor. This diary, *Maggid Mesharim*, is the focus of Werblowsky's study.

Chapter 4 of *Joseph Karo* is a particularly good survey of ideas and practices in pre-Lurianic Safed. This chapter was printed separately as "Mystical and Magical Contemplation: The Kabbalists in Sixteenth-Century Safed," in *History of Religions*, vol. 1, no. 1 (University of Chicago Press, Summer 1961).

Moses Cordovero

Ben-Shlomo, J. "Moses Cordovero," in Gershom Scholem, *Kabbalah* [articles from *ENCYCLOPEDIA JUDAICA*] (Jerusalem – New York: Keter Publishing House and Times Books, 1974; rpt. New York: Meridian, 1978; rpt. New York: Dorset Press, 1987), pp. 401-4.

Bland, Kalman. "Neoplatonic and Gnostic Themes in R. Moses Cordovero's Doctrine of Evil," in *The Bulletin of the Institute of Jewish Studies*, volume III (London: Institute of Jewish Studies, 1975).

Bokser, Ben Zion. *The Jewish Mystical Tradition* (New York: The Pilgrim Press, 1981):

Ch. 12. Moses Cordovero: selections from *Tomer Devorah* and *Or Ne'erav*

Cordovero, Moses. *Moses Cordovero's Introduction to Kabbalah: An Annotated Translation of His OR NE'ERAV* [SOURCES AND STUDIES IN KABBALAH, HASIDISM, AND JEWISH THOUGHT, vol. III]. Translated and annotated by Ira Robinson (New York: The Michael Sharf Publication Trust of the Yeshiva University Press, 1994).

Or Ne'erav (THE PLEASANT LIGHT) "constituted an epitome of Cordovero's great systematic theology of Kabbalah entitled *Pardes Rimmonim* (THE ORCHARD OF POMEGRANATES)." (Robinson's Introduction, page xi)

_____. *The Palm Tree of Deborah* [*Tomer Debhorah*] translated by Louis Jacobs (London: Vallentine, Mitchell & Co. Ltd., 1960; rpt. New York: Sepher-Hermon Press, 1974).

_____. *The Palm Tree of Deborah* [A TARGUM TORAH CLASSIC] translated and annotated by Rabbi Moshe Miller (Jerusalem – Spring Valley: Targum Press/ Feldheim Publishers, 1993).

Tomer Deborah is a kabbalistic ethical treatise on the doctrine of the imitation of God as expressed in the ten *sefirot*. The edition from Targum Press/Feldheim Publishers shows the Hebrew and English on facing pages. *The Palm Tree of Deborah* also appears in *An Anthology of Jewish Mysticism* by Raphael Ben Zion (New York: The Judaica Press, 1981; originally published as *The Way of the Faithful* in 1945).

_____. *Pardes Rimmonim: Orchard of Pomegranates, Parts 1-4*. Integral edition in English, Hebrew, and Aramaic. Translated by Elyakim Getz (Belize City: Providence University, 2007).

_____. *Pardes Rimmonim: Orchard of Pomegranates, Parts 5-8:5*. Integral edition in English, Hebrew, and Aramaic. Translated by Elyakim Getz (Belize City: Providence University, 2007).

_____. *Pardes Rimmonim: Orchard of Pomegranates, Parts 8:6-26*. Integral edition in English, Hebrew, and Aramaic. Translated by Elyakim Getz Getz (Belize City: Providence University, 2007).

_____. *Pardes Rimmonim: Orchard of Pomegranates, Parts 9-12*. Integral edition in English, Hebrew, and Aramaic. Translated by Elyakim Getz Getz (Belize City: Providence University, 2007).

The preceding four works have been reprinted, each “tome” (part) individually (*i.e.*, “Tome 1 of 12,” “Tome 2 of 12,” etc.), as grotesquely expensive (\$209.00), though cheaply produced, hardbacks: ©David Smith, LLC, October 1, 2016.

Dan, Joseph. “No Evil Descends from Heaven’: Sixteenth-Century Concepts of Evil,” in *Jewish Thought in the Sixteenth Century*, edited by B. Cooperman (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1983); also in Dan’s *Jewish Mysticism*, Volume III [THE MODERN PERIOD] (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson Inc., 1999).

Idel, Moshe. “Ascensions, Gender and Pillars in Safedian Kabbalah,” in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, vol. 25, edited by D. Abrams (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2011).

_____. “R. Moses ben Jacob Cordovero’s View” = Chapter 12 of *Golem: Jewish Magical and Mystical Traditions on the Artificial Anthropoid* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1990).

_____. “Revelation and the ‘Crisis of Tradition’ in Kabbalah,” in *Constructing Tradition: Means and Myths of Transmission in Western Esotericism*, edited by Andreas B. Kilcher (Leiden – Boston: Brill: 2010):

§ 4. A Zohar for the Shekhinah according to Moses Cordovero

Koch, Patrick B. “Approaching the Divine by *Imitatio Dei*: Tzelem and Demut in R. Moshe Cordovero’s *Tomer Devorah*,” in *Visualizing the Jews through the Ages: Literary and Material Representations of Jewishness and Judaism*, edited by Hannah Ewence and Helen Spurling (London – New York: Routledge, 2015), pages 48-68.

_____. “*Şelem and Demut: Self-Transformation and Imitatio Dei* = CHAPTER 3 of *Human Self-Perception: A Re-Assessment of Kabbalistic Musar-Literature of Sixteenth-Century Safed* (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2015).

“Chapter three focuses on the concept of *imitatio dei* in Moshe Cordovero’s *Tomer Devorah*.” (FOREWORD, page iv)

Meltzer, David (ed). *The Secret Garden: An Anthology in the Kabbalah* (New York: The Seabury Press, 1976).

A passage from *Pardes Rimmonim*, pages 199-201.

Putzu, Vadim. BOTTLED POETRY (noted fully above, page 3).

Chapter 5. Moses Cordovero

Raviv, Zohar. *Decoding the Dogma within the Enigma: The Life, Works, Mystical Piety and Systematic Thought of Rabbi Moses Cordoeiro (aka Cordovero; Safed. Israel, 1522-1570)* Saarbrücken: Verlag Dr. Müller, 2008

[= FATHOMING THE HEIGHTS, ASCENDING THE DEPTHS—DECODING THE DOGMA WITHIN THE ENIGMA: THE LIFE, WORKS AND SPECULATIVE PIETY OF RABBI MOSES CORDOEIRO (SAFED 1522-1570) (PhD dissertation, Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan, 2007)]

The goals of Raviv's dissertation are (1) to offer "a more precise biography of RaMaK, his family and overall community in order to shed new light on certain biographical uncertainties and to correct some erroneous data that have infiltrated modern scholarship; (2) "to broaden J. Ben-Shlomo's important analysis of RaMaK's metaphysics (1965) and to deepen our appreciation of RaMaK's highly complex theoretical edifice—especially the relations between metaphysical and theosophical concerns"; (3) "by offering a broader phenomenological canvas as the backdrop to RaMaK's intellectual command, this monograph challenges the premature tendency to underplay the intricate affinities between RaMaK's theoretical aptitude and devotional slant" building upon B. Sack's "stupendous articulation of RaMaK's devotional piety."

Chapter 3 offers a useful survey of Cordovero's writings. "The fourth chapter, which is devoted to RaMaK's *Sefer Gerushin*, examines in depth a composition to which no serious attention had hitherto been given in scholarship."

(All quotes are from Raviv's PREFACE.)

"J[osef] Ben Shlomo... (1965)" refers to Ben-Shlomo's *Mystical Theology of Moses Cordovero* (Jerusalem: Mosad Byalik); "B[racha] Sack's stupendous articulation" refers to Sack's *Kabbalah of Rabbi Moshe Cordovero* ([Be're Sheva': Universitat Ben-Guryon ba-Negev, 1995). Both of these works are in Hebrew, making Raviv's dissertation the only substantial discussion of Cordovero in English.

Robinson, Ira. "Moses Cordovero and Kabbalistic Education in the Sixteenth Century," in *Judaism: A Journal of Jewish Life and Thought*, vol. 39 (New York: American Jewish Congress, 1990).

Sack, Bracha. "The Influence of Cordovero on Seventeenth-Century Jewish Thought," in *Jewish Thought in the Seventeenth Century*, edited by Isadore Twersky and Bernard Septimus [CENTER FOR JEWISH STUDIES HARVARD JUDAIC STUDIES, VI] (Cambridge - London: Harvard University Press, 1987).

_____. "Some Remarks on Rabbi Moses Cordovero's *Shemu'ah be-'Inyan ha Gilgul*," in *Perspectives on Jewish Thought and Mysticism*, edited by A. Ivry. E. Wolfson, A. Arkush (Amsterdam: Harwood Academic Publishers, 1998).

Segol, Marla. "Performing Exile in Safed School Kabbalah," in *Magic, Ritual, and Witchcraft*, volume 7, issue 2 (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, Winter 2012), pages 131-163.

Elijah de Vidas – Reshith Hokhmah

Benyosef, Simhah H. (trans.) *The Beginning of Wisdom*. Unabridged Translation of the GATE OF LOVE from Rabbi Eliahu de Vidas' *RESHIT CHOCHMAH* (Hoboken: Ktav Publishing House, Inc., 2001).

Benyosef translates a significant portion of de Vidas' kabbalistic ethical classic and provides a full introduction.

Fine, Lawrence. *Safed Spirituality. The Rules of Mystical Piety: The Beginning of Wisdom* [THE CLASSICS OF WESTERN SPIRITUALITY] (Ramsey: Paulist Press, 1984).

Safed Spirituality includes a translation of a condensed version of Elijah de Vidas' popular *Reshith Hokhmah* (THE BEGINNING OF WISDOM).

Meltzer, David (ed). *The Secret Garden: An Anthology in the Kabbalah* (New York: The Seabury Press, 1976).

A passage from *Reshith Hokhmah*, pages 207-209.

WHICH LURIANIC KABBALAH?¹

Don Karr

ON PAGES 143-144 of *Kabbalah*,² Gershom Scholem lists notable works in which “the basic tenets of Lurianic *kabbalah* are systematically and originally presented”:

- Joseph Solomon Delmedigo’s *Novelot Hokhmah* (Basle [actually Hanau]: 1631)
- *Ma’amar Adam de-Azilut*, which is included in Moses Pareger’s *Va-Yakhel Moshe* (Dessau: 1699)
- Moses Hayyim Luzzatto’s *Keleh Pithei Hokhmah* (Koretz: 1785)
- Jacob Meir Spielmann’s *Tal Orot* (Lvov: 1876-83)
- Isaac Eisik Haver’s *Pithei She’arim* ([Warsaw:] 1888)
- Solomon Eliashov’s *LeShem Shevo ve-Ahlahamah* ([Piotrkow:] 1912-48)
- Yehudah Lev Ashlag’s *Talmud Eser Sefirot* ([Jerusalem:] 1955-67)

The word “originally” in the quote should evoke caution; Scholem gives no indication of the variations and layers upon Lurianic *kabbalah* which these works represent.³

Scholem adds (—*Kabbalah*, page 144), “Well-known expositions of Lurianic Kabbalah by Abraham Herrera and Joseph Ergas were greatly influenced by their tendency to reconcile or at least correlate the Lurianic system with the teachings of Cordovero, as can be seen in Ergas’ allegorization of the Lurianic doctrine of *tzimtzum*.” Scholem allows that Luria was mixed with Cordovero but does not mention the many other stresses and influences on Ergas and, especially, Herrera.⁴

¹ My sincere thanks to David Solomon (University College London), whose helpful comments (*via* email: 03/14/2006—05/29/2006) prompted this essay.

The reader can compare the first portions of my account of the spread of Lurianic *kabbalah* with that presented in DovBer Pinson’s introduction to Naftali Hertz’ *Mystic Tales from the EMEK HAMELECH* (Brooklyn: IYYUN Center for Jewish Spirituality, 2015), pages 6-16.

See also Joey Rosenfeld, “A Tribute to Rav Shlomo Elyashov...,” § INTERPRETATIONS OF THE LURIANIC SYSTEM, which identifies “four primary approaches towards Kabbalat Ha-Ari,” namely the schools of R. Moshe Hayyim Luzzatto, the Gaon of Vilna, R. Shalom Sharabi, and the Baal Shem Tov; online at <http://seforim.blogspot.com/2016/03/a-tribute-to-rav-shlomo-elyashiv-author.html?m=1>.

² Gershom Scholem, *Kabbalah* [articles from *ENCYCLOPEDIA JUDAICA*] (Jerusalem and New York: Keter Publishing House and Times Books, 1974; rpt. New York: Meridian, 1978; rpt. New York: Dorset Press, 1987).

³ Of these, only Luzzatto’s and Ashlag’s have been translated into English:

- Luzzatto, R. Moses C. *138 Openings of Wisdom* [QL”Kh PiTKheI HoKhMaH], translated by Avraham Yehoshua Greenbaum (Jerusalem: Azamra Institute, 2005).
- Ashlag, R. Yehuda. *Ten Luminous Emanations*. Volume 1: TEN LUMINOUS EMANATIONS, CONTRACTION AND LINE OF LIGHT (1969); Volume 2: CIRCLES AND STRAIGHTNESS (1973) (Jerusalem: Research Centre of Kabbalah).

These volumes represent the first two parts of *Talmud Eser Sefirot*: TZIMTZUM AND KAV and IGULIM AND YOSHER.

Parts 1-8 and 16 of Ashlag’s *Talmud Eser Sefirot* in English can be viewed online at the website for BNEI BARUCH KABBALAH EDUCATION AND RESEARCH INSTITUTE, founded by Rabbi Michael Laitman, at <http://www.kabbalah.info/eng/content/view/frame/32695/?eng/content/view/full/32695&main>.

⁴ Herrera’s “well-known exposition,” *Puerto del Cielo*, has been put into English: *Gate of Heaven*, translated from the Spanish with Introduction and Notes by Kenneth Krabbenhoft [STUDIES IN EUROPEAN JUDAISM, VOL. 5] (Leiden: Brill, 2002).

The fact is that “an uneven array of multiple versions dots the literary landscape of Lurianic kabbalah.”⁵ We must conclude that a simple reference to “Lurianic *kabbalah*” is inadequate.

Defining Lurianic *kabbalah* presents several problems, not the least of which is that ISAAC LURIA (1534-1572) wrote very little and did not leave a systematic exposition of his own teachings. Among the first—and certainly the most important—to do so was Luria’s student in Safed, HAYYIM VITAL (1542-1620), a kabbalist and occultist of some experience and reputation before becoming Luria’s pupil.

Vital purportedly based his major work, *Etz Hayyim* (TREE OF LIFE), on the notes which he took during his direct contact with Luria. However, the abstract to Orna Triguboff’s paper, “Who Contributed More to Lurianic Cosmology: Isaac Luria or Hayyim Vital?”⁶ begins,

It is generally opined amongst Kabbalistic scholars that Isaac Luria was the main fountain-head of the ideas of late sixteenth and early seventeenth century Lurianic Kabbalah. Scholem makes regular reference to Luria and Lurianic Kabbalah even though the works quoted were actually mainly written by Vital. Examination of the writings of Luria and the work of his disciples suggests that in fact the greatest contribution came from Hayyim Vital, who was not restricted to a post mortem revelation of Luria’s

On Ergas, see Ira Robinson, “Keeping the Faith: The Popularization of Lurianic Kabbala in the Eighteenth Century as Reflected in Rabbi Yosef Ergas’ *Shomer ‘Emunim*,” in *From Antiquity to the Modern World: Contemporary Jewish Studies in Canada*, edited by Daniel Maoz and Andrea Gondos (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2011), pages 129-138.

⁵ Daniel Abrams’ description of the “detailed map of manuscripts” in Yosef Avivi’s three-volume study, *Kabalat ha-AR”I* (Jerusalem: Ben Zvi Institute, 2008 [Hebrew]), appears in *Kabbalistic Manuscripts and Textual Theory: Methodologies of Textual Scholarship and Editorial Practice in the Study of Jewish Mysticism* (revised and expanded edition: Jerusalem – Los Angeles: The Magnes Press – Cherub Press, 2014), page 711.

Jonathan Garb notes, “As Yosef Avivi has recently demonstrated at great length, the very Safedian corpus that has reached us is indelibly marked by the effect of later copying and editing, not to mention interpretation, after the heyday of Safed and in other locations, in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries.” Garb adds, “This is not only true of the Lurianic corpus, where it is very difficult to separate ‘original’ and ‘later’ versions of any given work, but even of the texts of the rival major school, that of R. Moshe Cordovero (1522-70), which were mostly printed in later periods and more significantly were mediated by extensive summarizing, quotation, and simplification by seventeenth-century exegetes.”—Garb, *Yearnings of the Soul: Psychological Thought in Modern Kabbalah* (Chicago – London: The University of Chicago Press, 2015), page 28.

For a review (in English) of Avivi’s *Kabalat ha-AR”I*, see Morris M. Faienstein, “Texts of Lurianic Kabbalah: Texts and their Histories,” in *Jewish Quarterly Review*, Vol. 103, No. 1 (Herbert D. Katz Center for Advanced Judaic Studies, Winter 2013), pages 101-106.

In “Kabbalah and Postmodern Jewish Philosophy – From Theosophy to Midrash: Lurianic Exegesis on Adam and Eve and the Garden of Eden,” in *Journal of Textual Reasoning*, [OLD SERIES] vol. 4, no. 2 (June 1995), Shaul Magid writes,

The corpus of Lurianic literature is highly complex and disorganized. Luria himself wrote almost nothing during his brief time in Safed. Most of what exists from the Safed circle is the product of various students, the most prolific and prominent being R. Hayyim Vital and R. Hayyim Ya’akov Zemah. The foundational texts in the Lurianic corpus are *Etz Hayyim* and the *Shemonah She’arim*, written by R. Hayyim Vital and edited by his son R. Shmuel Vital in Damascus. Most of Lurianic literature bearing the word *Sha’ar* in the title comes from the Vitalian school. Other texts, some of which bear the title *Sefer*, come from other members of the circle, the most prominent being R. Meir Poppers, R. Ya’akov Hayyim Zemah, R. Nathan Shapira, R. Joseph Ibn Tabul, R. Moshe Zakuto, and R. Israel Sarug.

⁶ This paper was proposed for, but not delivered at, the 36th Annual Conference of the Association of Jewish Studies, Chicago, 2004. The paper which Triguboff actually delivered at the AJS Conference in 2004 was “The Kings of Edom and the *Parzufim* in Hayyim Vital’s *Sha’ar ha-Hakdamot*.”

teachings but contributed mightily with his own ideas. The extent of Vital's contribution is not yet fully established but it appears that it might be more substantial than Luria's.

Vital's version of Lurianic teachings was arranged into *Shemonah She'arim* (EIGHT GATES), which were eventually re-edited and expanded after Hayyim's death by his son Shmuel (1598-ca.1677). These works remained in the possession of Shmuel Vital and were not copied or distributed to any extent before 1660. No part was printed until 1850.⁷

Hayyim Vital did not intend to spread—let alone print—Luria's teachings, but rather to preserve them for a small elite. The story goes, however, that while Vital lay seriously ill and unconscious, members of his family were bribed into allowing his manuscripts—which he kept under his bed—to be copied. These copies were hurried off to Europe (perhaps *via* Palestine), as *Etz Hayyim*, to become the basis of the European stream of Lurianic *kabbalah*—as opposed to the *Safed*, or *Eastern*, stream of Vital and Luria's other actual disciples.

There are a few versions of this story. One names Hayyim Vital's main pupil Rabbi Yehoshua as the one who paid Hayyim's younger brother Moshe 500 gold coins to borrow the MSS while Hayyim lay ill. R. Yehoshua then purportedly hired one hundred scribes to work for three days, resulting in over six hundred pages being copied.

An addition to this story tells that before Hayyim Vital died (1620), he ordered that all his writings, which were in manuscript, be buried with him. Sometime after Vital died, Abraham Azulai and Jacob Zemech (who is discussed below) sought Vital's posthumous permission to retrieve these writings from his grave by way of a kabbalistic ritual called *sh'eilat chalom*. These writings were then published and came to be known as “The Later Version,” *mehadura batra*, as opposed to “The First Version,” *mehadura kamma*. Disputes over which version is more reliable continue to this day.

We find that even among first-hand students of Luria in Safed, accounts of Lurianic *kabbalah* differ on some critical points. In his review of Yosef Avivi's *Kabalat ha-AR"l*, Morris M. Faienstein notes,

Avivi presents evidence for the idea that Luria had four distinct groups of disciples, each of which was taught, at a different time, different interpretations of the theory of Divine emanation, the centerpiece of Lurianic Kabbalah.⁸

JOSEPH IBN TABUL (1545-1610), “whose writings arguably reflect a closer summary of Luria's activity [than Vital's],” discusses aspects of *tzimtzum*, such as the “doctrine of

⁷ For some details of the organization of *Etz Hayyim* and *Shemonah She'arim*, see Fine, *Physician of the Soul, Healer of the Cosmos: Isaac Luria and His Kabbalistic Fellowship* [STANFORD STUDIES IN JEWISH HISTORY AND CULTURE] (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2003), pages 391-392, note 3.

⁸ “Texts of Lurianic Kabbalah: Texts and their Histories” (cited above), page 104.

infinity,” which Vital does not.⁹ Indeed, Ibn Tabul’s presentation of *tzimtzum* in *Derush Hefzi-Bah* is far more detailed than any of the accounts offered by Vital.

In contrast, another of Luria’s pupils, MOSES YONAH (fl. 1570-1590), rejected the idea of *tzimtzum* altogether and, hence, left it out of his summary of Luria’s teachings, *Kanfei Yonah* (WINGS OF THE DOVE, 1582), which reached Europe in manuscript much earlier than Vital’s works did.

ISRAEL SARUG (or Saruq, fl. 1590-1610), author of *Limmudei ’Atsilut*, claimed to have been a pupil of Luria’s, though there is some debate as to whether he ever met Luria in person. During the 1590s, he spread his version of Lurianic *kabbalah* (based on the pirated copies or on what Luria had taught him) in Palestine, which school eventually expanded along the Eastern Mediterranean—called by Ronit Meroz “the Eastern branch,” and Italy, beginning what Scholem refers to as “the Italian tradition.” Sarug’s version of Luria’s so-called “mythic”¹⁰ *kabbalah* was blended with Cordovero’s more speculative *kabbalah*.

Talmudist MENAHEM AZARYA OF FANO (1548-1620), considered himself a student of Cordovero before his encounter with Lurianic *kabbalah* via Sarug.

The differences between Vital and Sarug are numerous. Vital taught that *Adam Qadmon* was the highest level which could be comprehended; thus, his version of Lurianic *kabbalah* develops from *Adam Qadmon* down through the worlds below him. Sarug dealt with realms above *Adam Qadmon* and so covered topics (e.g., the concept of the *malbush*, the GARMENT found between *eyn sof* and *azilut*) and techniques which do not appear in Vital’s works.

Regarding Sarug and his version of Lurianic *kabbalah*, Sharron Shatil notes

In fact, Sarugian *kabbalah* is a distinct phenomenon within the *kabbalah* of the last four hundred years and is highly influential on the history of *kabbalah* and Jewish theology during this period, particularly in Europe. The line of Sarugian *kabbalists* continues up to the present day, with *kabbalists* who use Sarug’s writings or those of his immediate students [e.g., Menahem Azarya of Fano] as primary sources. Moreover, the influence of Sarugian *kabbalah* can be easily discerned in many of the prominent spiritual movements within rabbinic Judaism in the modern era, including the Sabbatean movement, the school of the GRA, and the Hassidic movement, in particular within Chabad’s unique strand of *kabbalistic* speculation. Some distinctive Sarugian elements even made it into the systems of Sefardic *kabbalists*, ever since the incorporation of a version of Sarug’s *Drush Ha-Malbush* into R. Shalom Buzaglo’s *Mikdash Melech* on the portion of *Bereshit* (Amsterdam, 1755). Thus, some of the concepts and ideas typical of Sarugian *kabbalah* are considered by most *kabbalists* since the nineteenth century to be an integral part of their *kabbalistic* universe.¹¹

⁹ Pinchas Giller, *Reading the Zohar: The Sacred Text of the Kabbalah* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2001), page 25.

¹⁰ Problems with applying the terms “mythic” and “literal” to the Safed school of Lurianic *kabbalah* will emerge as our discussion unfolds. Below, follow the comments of Menachem Kallus.

¹¹ “The Kabbalah of R. Israel Sarug: A Lurianic-Cordoverian Encounter,” in *The Review of Rabbinic Judaism* 14 (Leiden: Brill: 2011), page 159.

Sarug, whether yielding to the influence of Cordovero or to the atmosphere of Neoplatonism in Europe, added qualifying expressions (somewhat like “as it were”) into his accounts of such fundamental Lurianic concepts as *tzimtzum* and the “death of the kings,” suggesting a non-literal reading. Ronit Meroz states,

We therefore see that already in the first generation of Luria’s disciples there were those who had reservations concerning the literal understanding of Luria’s ideas about *simsum* [= *tzimtzum*]. These were disciples of Luria who joined the school of Saruq. This is particularly true of members of the Eastern branch which seem, for all we know—to have had some predilection for arguing philosophical points, although it cannot be argued that they presented their Qabbalah philosophically, as Scholem thought.¹²

This generally-assumed division is a point of some dispute. In his PhD dissertation, *THE THEURGY OF PRAYER IN LURIANIC KABBALAH* (Jerusalem: Hebrew University, 2002), Menachem Kallus presents texts (cited in his CHAPTER 2, § C) which “argue strongly for a non-literal understanding of Lurianic Kabbalah as a whole” (—*THEURGY OF PRAYER...*, page 24). In a paper delivered at the AJS Conference of 2003¹³, Kallus states

The Lurianic *kabbalah* is most often characterized in the scholarly literature as mythical. I would say in point of fact that, inasmuch as it is based on exegesis of the *Zohar*, it is in the narrative voices of the zoharic genre that we may be misled to find characteristics of first order myth, and that, in general, Lurianic *Zohar* interpretations tend to be in the case of Hayim Vital structuralist and abstract, and in the case of Rabbi Isaac Luria, or the ARI, teleological and with special interests of theodicy. For both of these Lurianic authors, the metaphoric element is prominent. Indeed, in their writings, the ARI as well as each of his direct disciples who recorded his discourses have all stated on various occasions the mythic images are not to be taken literally but are to be understood by means of close metaphorical and allegorical correspondence.

Kallus cites specific writings of Luria’s followers to support his claim. One example is from Luria himself:

In the ARI’s commentary on the *Sifre d’Tzeniuta*, where he discusses the zoharic mystical symbolism of color, we read, “Let not the proud, those destined for damnation, entice you into saying that the emanated divine realms are comprised of colors, for the waters of iniquity have washed upon them who force words of description upon the Lord of Lords, for there is no color or visual representation there that refers to Him who is exalted over all the proud, Who sees and is not seen.” Such damning language regarding anthropomorphic literalism was used by the ARI precisely because his kabbalah, following the *Zohar*, which also issues strong warnings against literalism, is so rich in this type of descriptive invocational symbolism—and nowhere does the ARI retract this exhortation.

¹² “Contrasting Opinions among the Founders of R. Israel Saruq’s School,” in *Experience et Ecriture Mystiques dans les Religions du Livre*, edited by Paul Fenton and Roland Goetschel [ETUDES SUR LE JUDAISME MEDIEVAL, tome xxii] (Leiden - Boston - Köln: Brill, 2000), page 197. The odd grammar and punctuation appear in Meroz’ article.

For indications of a more complex picture of the cross-influence between Safed and Italy, see Moshe Idel’s “Italy in Safed, Safed in Italy: Toward an Interactive History of Sixteenth-Century Kabbalah,” in *Cultural Intermediaries: Jewish Intellectuals in Early Modern Italy*, edited by David B. Ruderman and Giuseppe Veltri (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004), pages 239-269.

¹³ “Forms of Hermeneutic Creativity in Lurianic Kabbalah and Its Research,” in Session 4.9 – POST-ZOHARIC KABBALAH: MYSTICISM, AUTOBIOGRAPHY, LURIANIC HERMENEUTICS, AND SHALOM SHARABI at the Association for Jewish Studies 35th Annual Conference, December 21-23, 2003, Boston.

Some early seventeenth-century European Kabbalists, while generally accepting Lurianic teachings, continued older traditions not taken up by Luria, such as the doctrine of the *shemittot* (COSMIC CYCLES). Both “Cordovero and Luria rejected it [*i.e.*, the doctrine of the *shemittot*] as a mistaken or unnecessary hypothesis, at least in the version found in the *Sefer ha-Temunah*” (—Scholem, *Kabbalah*, page 122). Many, including Sarug and his followers, made far greater use of *gematria* (roughly, NUMEROLOGY) than did Vital—or, for that matter, Cordovero—possibly influenced by emerging trends in Christian Cabala.

Complicating matters even more, in the mid-seventeenth century, through the spread of Vital’s more “purely” Lurianic manuscripts, the Safed school met up with the more eclectic European school. Representative of this merger is *Emek ha-Melekh* (THE VALLEY OF THE KING, 1648) by NAFTALI HERTZ BEN YAAKOV ELCHANAN (*aka* Naphtali Bacharach—dates unknown, *fl.* mid-1600s) of Amsterdam.¹⁴ While this work leans more toward Sarug than toward Vital, it retains what is generally presumed to be the Safedian literal view from which Sarug seemed to back away.

In *Kabbalah* (—page 394) Scholem states, “While [Joseph Solomon] Delmedigo’s¹⁵ interest lay in the abstract philosophical aspect of Kabbalah, which he attempted to explain to himself, Bacharach [*i.e.*, Hertz] appears as an enthusiastic and fanatical kabbalist with a special flair for the mystical and non-philosophical traits of Kabbalah—in Isaac Luria’s Kabbalah as well as in the Kabbalah of the early kabbalists.” Then, does “mystical and non-philosophical” imply “literal”? Menachem Kallus asserts, “Bacharach [*i.e.*, Hertz], being a scion of Sarug’s school, did not slip into literalism.”¹⁶

Before his exposure to Sarug’s version of Lurianic teaching, Hertz studied under the renowned ISAIAH HOROWITZ (155?-16??¹⁷—probably born in Prague). Horowitz served as the rabbi of several important communities (among them Dubno, Frankfort-on-Main, and Prague), eventually ascending to the position of Chief Ashkenazic Rabbi of Jerusalem. His major work, *Shney Luchot Habrit* (TWO TABLETS OF THE COVENANT, 1620-30), is a classic of Eastern European kabbalistic ethical literature. Horowitz mixed traditional rabbinic sources with the *Zohar*, Karo, Elijah de Vidas, Cordovero, and Luria, though he only occasionally put Lurianic teachings into writing, considering them too esoteric and powerful to be directly revealed. Horowitz incorporated *kabbalah* into every-day practice.

¹⁴ Sheila Spector calls *Emek ha-Melekh* “an unacknowledged version of Sarug’s recension of Lurianic Kabbalism” [*i.e.*, *Limmudei ’Azilut*]—Spector, *Francis Mercury von Helmont’s Sketch of Christian Kabbalism* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2012), page 7.

¹⁵ Joseph Solomon Delmedigo (1591-1655). “[Delmedigo] immersed himself in the Kabbalah for two purposes: (1) To find in it solutions which philosophy could not offer, and (2) to criticize it.”—Jacob Haberman, “Delmedigo, Joseph Solomon,” *Jewish Virtual Library* (source: *Encyclopedia Judaica* © 2008), at https://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsourc/judaica/ejud_0002_0005_o_05064.html.

See Israel Zinberg, *A History of Jewish Literature*, Part Five: ITALIAN JEWRY IN THE RENAISSANCE ERA, translated from the Yiddish by Bernard Martin (Cincinnati: Hebrew Union College / New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1974): CHAPTER 6, “Joseph Solomon Delmedigo.”

¹⁶ Email from 06/30/2006.

¹⁷ Dates given for Isaiah Horowitz’ birth and death vary. For his birth, I have seen 1555, 1558, and 1565; for his death, 1626, 1628 and 1630.

Isaiah Horowitz' son, Shabtai Sheftel Horowitz (c.1590-1660), saw to the publication of both *Emek ha-Melekh* and *Shney Luchot Habrit*, in the same year: 1648, and in the same place: Amsterdam.

Another Shabtai Sheftel, namely, Isaiah Horowitz' cousin Shabtai Sheftel ben Akiva ha-Levi Horowitz (d. 1619), wrote the well-circulated *Shefa' Tal* in which he undertook to harmonize Cordovero's doctrines of *tzimtzum* with those of Luria as reported by Joseph ibn Tabul. *Shefa' Tal*, along with Israel Sarug's *Limmudei 'Azilut*, is thought to have been a source for Hertz' *Emek ha-Melekh*.

It is interesting to note that selections from *Emek ha-Melekh* appeared in Latin translation in Knorr von Rosenroth's *Kabbala denudata* (1677/1684).¹⁸

There is yet another chain which leads from Safed to Europe *via* Jerusalem: Marrano physician and student of Shmuel Vital, Jacob Zemech, whose "Kabbalistic writings follow those of R. Hayim Vital, with no trace of the influence of the Italian Lurianic kabbalists, Israel Sarug and Menahem Azariah Fano."¹⁹ Zemech codified Lurianic observances in a work called *Shulhan Arukh ha-Ari* (1660), the title alluding to Joseph Karo's famous *Shulhan Arukh* (THE SET TABLE). Zemech's student, Meir Poppers (d. 1662), not only arranged a major edition of Vital's *Etz Hayyim* (called *Peri Etz Hayyim*) but also redacted *Sefer ha-Gilgulim*, which was published in Frankfort, 1684—the same place and year that Latin translations from it were printed in TOME II of Knorr von Rosenroth's *Kabbala denudata*.²⁰

The first half of *Sefer ha-Gilgulim* (BOOK 1, CHAPTERS 1—35) is similar in content to Vital's *Sha'ar ha Gilgulim* (*i.e.*, the eighth gate of *Shemonah She'arim*); the second half (BOOK 2, CHAPTERS 36—77) includes material which is not Lurianic, *i.e.*, older *kabbalah* *via* material derived from Cordovero, Abraham Azulai, and likely Sarug.

Poppers also composed a series of diagrams depicting the unfolding of creation according to Lurianic doctrine titled *Ilan ha-Gadol* [TREE OF GREATNESS] (published in Warsaw: 1893). These diagrams form two major sets: (1) those based on Sarug, including depictions of the World of the Garment (*malbush*), and (2) those based on Vital, oriented to *Adam Qadmon* and the worlds/faces below him.

The diagrams in the *Ilan*, for the most part, match those in *Pars quarta* of *Kabbala denudata*, TOME I (1677), though they are set in a somewhat different order.²¹

¹⁸ TOME I, PARS SECUNDA, pages 150—172: THESESES CABBALISTICÆ quod est compendium Libri Emek hamMelech [KABBALISTIC THESES WHICH ARE A COMPENDIUM OF THE BOOK VALLEY OF THE KING ... in 130 Theses], Sulzbach: 1677; and TOME II, PARTE PRIMA, § 2, pages 151—346: TRACTATUS SECUNDUS: Introductio in dogmata profundiora (Libri Sohar) [INTRODUCTION TO THE PROFOUND DOGMA (OF THE BOOK ZOHAR)]... VALLEM REGIAM, R. Naphthali Hirtz, F. R. Jaacob Elchana (*i.e.*, Naftali Hirtz, Ya`akov Elhanan) [= the first six sections of *Emek ha-Melekh*], and § 4 b, pages 47—144: Commentarius generalis in Librum mysterii ÷ Synodos = §§ 130—236 of Naftali Hirtz' *Emek ha-Melekh* (Frankfurt: 1684).

¹⁹ Elisheva Carlebach, *The Pursuit of Heresy: Rabbi Moses Hagiz and the Sabbatian Controversies* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1990), pages 25-26.

²⁰ PARS TERTIA, § 2, pages 243—478: TRACTATUS SECUNDUS: De Revolutionibus Animarum [ON THE REVOLUTION OF SOULS] = *Sefer ha-Gilgulim*, attributed to Hayyim Vital.

²¹ Pages 193—255: PARS QUARTA, quæ CONTINET EXPLICATIONEM ARBORUM seu TABULARUM... [PART FOUR, A DETAILED EXPLANATION OF THE (KABBALISTIC) TREE OR DIAGRAM..., in 16 figures].

It is beyond the scope of this paper and the resources of its author to detail all of the paths which Lurianic *kabbalah* took from the sixteenth century to the twentieth. Offered here are brief descriptions of a handful of exemplars; the selection is biased toward representative sources in English.

ABRAHAM HERRERA (157?-1639) was born in Florence to Spanish, likely Marrano, parents. Herrera merged, or attempted to reconcile, the Lurianic *kabbalah* of his mentor Israel Sarug with Neoplatonic philosophy in his major work, *Puerto del Cielo*.²² This work became known in Christian Europe through Knorr von Rosenroth's *Kabbala denudata*, which included a Latin version of *Puerto del Cielo*, i.e., *Porta caelorum*, rendered from its Hebrew version, *Sha'ar ha-Shamayim* (the original having been in Spanish).²³ Rosenroth's translation is far from a fair representation of Herrera's original work, for "[Isaac] Aboab [da Fonseca, who executed the Hebrew translation,] did not just translate [Herrera's works] but also radically altered the texts according to his own interpretation."²⁴ Rosenroth further condensed the work in the process of putting it into Latin, emphasizing its philosophical passages.

Messianic sparks within the Lurianic complex ignited into the movement behind SHABBATAI ZEVI (1626-1676), the famous "False Messiah." Shabbatean dogma and myth were shaped by Nathan of Gaza (164?-1680) and Abraham Miguel Cardozo (1626-1706), both of whom drew on Lurianic doctrine and terminology. Nathan "followed the Sephardi custom and the rules laid down by the kabbalists of Safed in the middle of the sixteenth century."²⁵ Cardozo claimed to have studied *kabbalah* with Hayyim Vital's son Shmuel and Vital's pupil Hayyim Kohen.²⁶

Some kabbalists, influenced by Shabbateanism but wishing to hide the fact, held "traditional" Lurianic *kabbalah* separate from the "new revelation"—as if the two were distinct from each other. JACOB KOPPEL LIFSCHUETZ (or Ya'aqov [Lifhitz] Koppel, d.

Of the sixteen diagrams in *Kabbala denudata*, Figures 1-7 constitute Israel Sarug's "great tree" depicting the structure of *Adam Kadmon* (= PRIMAL ADAM). Figures 8-12 show a tree derived from *Emek ha-Melech* representing stages from the initial *tzimtzum* (contraction), through the emanations in the form of a wheel, to the second *Adam Kadmon* and the *parzufim* (faces). Figures 13-14 show the *sefirot* in the world of *azilut*. Figures 15-16 depict the *sefirot* brought down in various ways to the lower worlds.

Refer to my *Study of Christian Cabala in English*, ADDENDUM C, at Colin Low's *Hermetic Kabbalah*, <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/ccineb.pdf>, for a note comparing Poppers' "great tree" and the figures in *Kabbala denudata*.

²² Eisig Silberschlag's formula goes,

One of them [*i.e.*, one of the followers of Luria], Hayyim Vital, systematized Luria's oral flashes in a massive work *The Tree of Life*; another, Joseph Ibn Tabul, propagandized them; a third, Israel Sarug, transmitted them to Italian Jewry especially; a fourth, Abraham Cohen Herrera of Florence, invented an eclectic mysticism which was a combination of Neoplatonism and pseudo-Lurianism."

—From *Renaissance to Renaissance: Hebrew Literature from 1492-1970* (New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1973), page 50.

²³ TOME I, PARS TERTIA, pages 1—192.

²⁴ Krabbenhoft, *THE MYSTIC TRADITION. ABRAHAM COHEN HERRERA AND PLATONIC THEOLOGY*. (Ph.D. dissertation: New York: New York University, 1982), page 21. See *ibid.*, page 23, for a comparison of Aboab's Hebrew version and Herrera's Spanish original.

²⁵ Gersom Scholem, *Sabbatai Sevi: The Mystical Messiah* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1973), page 203.

²⁶ David J. Halperin, *Abraham Miguel Cardozo: Selected Writings* (New York – Mahwah: Paulist Press, 2001), page 29-30

c. 1740) was one such “secret Shabbatean”; his *Sha’arei Gan Eden* (GATES OF THE GARDEN OF EDEN), written in the early 1700s, gives a full summary of Shabbatean theology while denouncing it as heresy in the preface. Through his expositions on the relationship of the *tsaddik* and *messiah* (\approx *yesod* and *malkhut*), “Ya’aqov Koppel has long been considered a link between Sabbateanism and Hasidism.”²⁷

Moroccan HAYYIM BEN MOSHE IBN ATTAR (1696-1743), acclaimed Talmudist and kabbalist, is best known for *Or ha-Hayyim* (LIGHT OF LIFE), a commentary on the Torah engaging its four levels: *p’shat* - literal, *remez* - allegoric, *d’rush* - deeper “mirashic,” and *sod* - secret. This work became immensely popular among the Hasidim and was lauded by the Ba’al Shem Tov. Hayyim ibn Attar founded a synagogue in Jerusalem at the site of Isaac Luria’s birth: the Ari Synagogue, adjoining the *Or ha-Hayyim* Synagogue—which still exists on *Or ha-Hayyim* Street in the Armenian Quarter of the Old City.

In the early eighteenth century, more debate emerged over the doctrine of *tzimtzum*: Should it be taken literally or symbolically (allegorically, philosophically)? Naftali Hertz, in his *Emek ha-Melekh*, is generally considered to have taken *tzimtzum* literally, as the Safed school supposedly did; this literal view was taken up by Shabbateans.²⁸ On the other side was Joseph Ergas (*Shomer Emunim*, 1736), who, like Abraham Herrera, held that *tzimtzum* was to be understood non-literally (metaphorically, philosophically); this latter view was taken up by three major figures discussed below: Moses Hayyim Luzzatto, Elijah ben Solomon (the Gaon of Vilna, or GRA), and Shneur Zalman of Lyady.

Padua-born poet, ethicist, and mystic, MOSES HAYYIM LUZZATTO, or RaMHaL (1707-1747) is of special importance: He combined a knowledge of Luria (*via* the European stream, Herrera in particular), the influence of Shabbatean doctrines (though he publicly deemed them heretical²⁹), and revelations from a personal *maggid*. RaMHaL’s

²⁷ Page 247, Shaul Magid, “The Metaphysics of *Malkhut*: *Malkhut* as *Eyn Sof* in the Writings of Ya’akov Koppel of Mezritch,” in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Twenty-Seven, Special Issue: KABBALAH ON THE MARGINS – TRANSFORMATIONS OF KABBALAH IN ASHKENAZI SOCIETIES, edited by Daniel Abrams with guest editors Nathaniel Deutsch and Jean Baumgarten (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2012), pages 245-267.

²⁸ Upon considering his dissertation and article (both cited above) along with our discussion *via* email, I asked Menachem Kallus, “Can we conclude that the first Lurianic literalists were the Shabbateans?” His response (in the note of 06/30/2006): “It may well be that the Sabateans were the first ... it served their mythical/antinomian agenda” (Kallus’ ellipsis).

The more conventional view is indicated in the first note of Shaul Magid’s article “Origin and Overcoming the Beginning: *Zimzum* as a Trope of Reading in Post-Lurianic Kabbala,” in *Beginning/Again: Toward a Hermeneutics of Jewish Texts*, ed. A. Cohen and S. Magid (New York: Seven Bridges, 2002), which states, “The metaphorical rather than literal understandings of *zimzum* began in the Renaissance with such Kabbalists as R. Menahem Azaria da Fano and later R. Abraham Ha-Kohen Herrera,” adding, “The three Kabbalists discussed in this study, R. Moshe Hayyim Luzzatto, R. Yizhak Isik Haver Waldman, and R. Dov Baer Schneurson, are all influenced by this metaphorical rendering of *zimzum*” (—pages 195-6).

²⁹ “[I]t is clear from what Luzzatto says that Nathan [of Gaza’s activity and innovations occupied his mind and that their inner meaning was disclosed to him by the *maggid*.] ... “[A]lthough his [Luzzatto’s] writings avoid direct mention of Shabbateanism, they conceal evidence of a certain positive evaluation of the Shabbatean system.”—Isaiah Tishby, *Messianic Mysticism: Moses Hayyim Luzzatto and the Padua School*, translated by Morris Hoffman (Oxford – Portland: The Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2008), pages 227 and 256.

aim was to codify *kabbalah* and incorporate it into every-day thought and practice. However, in most of his writings, at the insistence of the leading rabbis of his day, *kabbalah* is not discussed overtly. His distinctly kabbalistic works, *Kelalut ha-Ilan* (ESSENTIALS OF THE TREE) and *Kelah Pithei Hokhmah* (138 GATES OF WISDOM), condense and systematize his “hermeneutical/visionary” interpretation of Lurianic teachings.³⁰

EZEKIEL LANDAU (1713-1793) was the chief rabbi of Prague, a position which he held for nearly forty years. He was head of the Jewish court; his hundreds of *responsa*, collected and published as *Nado biYehudah*, remain an authoritative source of Jewish law. Known for both his vast knowledge of rabbinic literature and his skill as a community leader, he was referred to as the “rabbi of the Diaspora.”³¹ Despite his frequent denials of having any involvement with *kabbalah*, Landau drew upon a mix of *Zohar*, Cordovero, and Luria (by way of *Derekh etz hayyim* and *Peri etz hayyim*, both of which were compiled by Meir Poppers) for his writings and sermons. Despite his kabbalistic interests, Landau saw the rise of the “new Hasidism” as a threat to the “traditional rabbinic hierarchy of values.”³²

Another esteemed figure, Lithuanian³³ ELIJAH BEN SOLOMON ZALMAN KREMER, the Gaon of Vilna, known as the GRA (1720-1797), while a kabbalist, rejected the emerging hasidic movement as a pantheistic heresy. His vehement call for the ex-

³⁰ The term “hermeneutical/visionary” is derived from Zvia Rubin’s article, “The Mystical Vision and its Interpretation: R. Moses Hayyim Luzzatto’s Qabbalistic Hermeneutics,” in *Experience et Ecriture Mystiques dans les Religions du Livre*, edited by Paul Fenton and Roland Goetschel [ETUDES SUR LE JUDAISME MEDIEVAL, tome xxii] (Leiden: Brill, 2000).

³¹ Sharon Flatto, *The Kabbalistic Culture of Eighteenth-Century Prague: Ezekiel Landau (the ‘Noda BiYehudah’) and His Contemporaries* (Oxford – Portland: The Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2010), pages 9-10.

³² Flatto, *Kabbalistic Culture...*, page 89.

³³ On Lithuanian *kabbalah*, see Jonathan Garb, *Yearnings of the Soul: Psychological Thought in Modern Kabbalah* (Chicago – London: The University of Chicago Press, 2015), pages 86-91, where Garb discusses the Gaon of Vilna (referred to as “Kremer”), Hayyim of Volozhin (referred to as “Iczkovitz”), Yitzhaq Haver, and Shlomo Elyashiv. This is followed by a section entitled “R. Avraham Yitzhaq ha-Kohen Kook’s Naturalistic National Mysticism” (pages 91-102).

The English abstract to Jonatan Meir’s Hebrew article, “The Eclectic Kabbalah of R. Shimon Zvi Horowitz: A Critical Note on the Term Lithuanian Kabbalah,” in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, 31 (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2014), pages 311-320, reads,

Recent years have seen the flourishing of research on Lithuanian Kabbalists in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, to the point that some scholars speak of a defined and delineated stream of Kabbalah, a school unto itself dubbed “Lithuanian Kabbalah.” Such scholars include within this stream all those who saw the Vilna Gaon as their teacher in Kabbalah (parallel to the position of the Baal Shem Tov in Hasidism) and they ascribe to it such fixed categories as its “Articles of Faith.” In their conception, this stream was part and parcel of the broader and well-known nationalist-messianic current that had its source, supposedly, in the Vilna Gaon himself; this current reached its full fruition in the twentieth century, and so too has the smaller stream within it, now a clearly defined “school,” developed in various ways until the present. As if this were not enough, scholars have joined the later ideological trend which seeks to revise the history of Jewish settlement in the Land of Israel in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries in a decidedly messianic way, presenting it in a continuous line from the Vilna Gaon to the emergence of Zionism and then to the founding of the State of Israel. Again, the Vilna Gaon is not merely presented as a “herald” of Zionism but as one who encoded within his Torah the secret of redemption, the beginning of which, apparently, we are witnessing today. The article conducts a critical analysis of the concept of “Lithuanian Kabbalah,” and uses as its case study the life and teachings of Rabbi Shimon Tsvi Horowitz.

communication of hasidic proselytizers, in particular those from the school of Shneur Zalman of Lyady, seems to contradict his otherwise self-absorbed existence. The GRA marshaled what came to be known as the *Mitnagdim*, the “opponents,” *i.e.*, opponents of Hasidism.

The GRA’s kabbalistic commentaries are characterized by their comparative academic approach, or, put another way, eclectic allegorical approach, which draws on the entire kabbalistic compass from the *Sefer Yezirah* to RaMHaL.

Elijah’s kabbalistic commentaries, like his writing on rabbinic literature, tended to focus on works he believed were of ancient origin. Elijah interpreted these sacred kabbalistic texts according to the same principles he used when emending and interpreting Talmudic literature. Just as he freely emended two-thousand-year-old Talmudic texts, uninhibited by medieval commentators, Elijah altered kabbalistic works and boldly challenged Luria’s hitherto unassailed interpretations.

The majority of Elijah’s kabbalistic works can be divided into two groups, according to their editors. The first and most authoritative group (including the earlier-mentioned works [the “magisterial commentaries to the early kabbalistic works *Sifra di-Tseniuta* and *Sefer Yetzirah*”]) was published posthumously by his family and those students whom he taught personally. The second group, published in the late nineteenth century by Shmuel Luria, includes Elijah’s commentaries to *Heikhalot*, *Ra’ayah Mehemnah*, and *Tikkunei ha-Zohar*.³⁴

Yet more than the sheer size of his oeuvre, it is the unsurpassed quality of Elijah’s work that stands out. It is distinguished by its precise and economical language; by Elijah’s full command of sources and mastery of the entire canon of rabbinic and kabbalistic literature; and, finally, by its originality.³⁵

HAYYIM BEN YITZACH VOLOZHINER, Chaim of Volozhin, or Hayyim Iczkovitz (1749-1821), “is famous for being the primary student of the Vilna Gaon, for having reinstated the concept of an international large-scale Yeshiva, and for his magnum opus, *Nefesh haChaim* (SOUL OF LIFE) ... [which is] described as nothing less than a ‘*Shulchan Aruch* of *Hashkafa*,’” roughly, *THE SET TABLE OF PHILOSOPHY*; the allusion is again to Rabbi Yosef Karo’s famous code of Jewish law, *Shulchan Aruch*. Thus, *Nefesh haHayyim* is considered “a formal presentation of how a Jew is to view and philosophically interact with the world.”³⁶

Hayyim was not so actively anti-hasidic as his mentor.

SHNEUR ZALMAN OF LYADY, “RaShaZ” (1745-1813), a descendant of Rabbi Yehuda Loew (The *Maharal* of Prague – born in either 1512 or 1522, died 1609³⁷), was the founder of HABAD Hasidism (for *Hokhmah-Binah-Da’at*, also called “Lubavitch” Hasidism after the Lithuanian town where the movement flourished for some years

³⁴ Eliyahu Stern, *The Genius: Elijah of Vilna and the Making of Modern Judaism* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2013), page 19. The publisher mentioned is not Hayyim Vital’s son Shmuel.

³⁵ *Ibid*, page 20.

³⁶ Avinoam Fraenkel’s introduction to *Nefesh HaTzimtzum*, page 29.

³⁷ The Maharal, along with being a formidable scholar of the Talmud, a philosopher, and the Chief Rabbi of Poland, was a kabbalist, though he did not believe that *kabbalah* should be studied publicly. Further, his *kabbalah* was primarily from the *Zohar*. Lurianic *kabbalah* migrated to Europe after the Maharal’s time.

in the nineteenth century). Shneur Zalman was a pupil of Dov Baer, the *Maggid* of Mezritch (1704-1772), who, in turn, was a disciple of Israel ben Eliezer, the Ba'al Shem Tov (1700-1760), founder of the hasidic movement. As mentioned, Shneur Zalman was a prime target of the anti-hasidic objections of the Gaon of Vilna.

Shneur Zalman's most influential writings are gathered in the five sections of *Likkutei Amarim* (COLLECTED DISCOURSES, 1796), called *Tanya* (the first word of the text, which means "it is taught" or "it has been taught," that is, taught in the oral law not included in the *Mishnah*). *Tanya* condenses European Lurianic *kabbalah* and the hasidic interpretations of it into a systematic theosophy and ethics "that we must teach ... to the many" (—Shneur Zalman, cited by Rachel Elijor in *The Paradoxical Ascent to God*,³⁸ page 21).

A full analysis of the paths of Lurianic teachings through various hasidic movements cannot be dealt with here, save to quote Rachel Elijor's caveat regarding the relationship between *kabbalah* and Hasidism (—*The Paradoxical Ascent to God*, pages 5-6—my ellipses and brackets):

One must not be misled by the common terminology and mistake it for identity in meaning or conceptual unity. The Hasidic movement made extensive use of the framework of the Kabbalistic tradition as a basis for the legitimization of its freedom to innovate in religious thought and as grounds for permission to formulate new spiritual priorities. ... The deep change in patterns of mystical thought in the light of the charismatic reawakening gave rise to new religious creativity occasionally disguised in the language of older prevailing [Lurianic] Kabbalistic concepts. The connection of Hasidism with Kabbalistic sources is not one of simple continuity or merely of shared terminology. Their complex relationship includes changes in principle with regard to the Kabbalistic tradition and the power of a new religious interest.

Apart from the notice above regarding Shneur Zalman, an outline of the major figures and writings representing hasidic developments of Lurianic *kabbalah* must remain a desideratum. However, there exists a vast literature on Hasidism. Within the works that have found their way into English, one can start in the early-to-mid twentieth century with the diverging impressions of Hasidism advanced by Martin Buber (1878-1965), who favored the sayings, tales, and legends,³⁹ and Gershom Scholem (1897-1982), who favored hasidic speculative writings.⁴⁰

With regard to these speculative writings, Hayyim of Volozhin and Shneur Zalman provide a most instructive contrast. The former "became the leading theoretician of the mitnaggedic world," as expounded in *Nefesh ha-Hayyim*, while the latter composed

³⁸ Rachel Elijor, *The Paradoxical Ascent to God: The Kabbalistic Theosophy of Habad Hasidism*, translated from Hebrew by Jeffrey M. Green (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993).

³⁹ See Buber, *Tales of the Hasidim: The Early Masters* and *Tales of the Hasidim: The Later Masters* (New York: Schocken Books/Farrar, Straus & Young, 1947—rpt. Schocken, 1961/1968 and subsequently).

⁴⁰ See Scholem, "Martin Buber's Interpretation of Hasidism," in *The Messianic Idea in Judaism* (New York: Schocken Books, 1971), pages 227-250.

“a methodical exposition of Hasidic doctrine,” i.e., *Tanya*.⁴¹ Both, however, based their depositions on the general scheme of European Lurianic *kabbalah*.

The core of the division is this: The Mitnagdim approached the divine as *transcendent*; Torah erudition provided the link to God and His revelation. The Hasidim viewed the divine as *immanent*, and so sought direct experience of God through mystical—even ecstatic—experience. In the wake of the Shabbatean debacle, the Mitnagdim were profoundly wary of the mystical and messianic factors they saw in Hasidism.

It is worth noting that warnings directed toward the Hasidim, specifically from the GRA, were not ignored.

A careful study of the life’s work of the founder of Habad, Shneur-Zalman of Lyadi ... reveals his conscious and unrelenting demolition of the more extreme tendencies within Hasidism. He developed his brand of Hasidism partly in response to what he regarded as the justified attacks by the Gaon (and the Misnagdim) on those more extreme tendencies, while arguing that the Gaon’s application of sanctions against the Hasidic movement generally was in his view wholly unjustified. In short: The Misnagdic movement played a major role in shaping moderate (Lithuanian) Hasidism....⁴²

Yemenite SHALOM MIZRAHI SHARABI (or Shara’abi), called the RaShaSh (1720-1777), and his school, *Bet El*, stuck closely to Vital’s *Shemonah She’arim*. Building on this, Sharabi composed *Sidur Rehovot ha-Nahar* (ORDER OF THE ROADS OF THE RIVER), a kabbalistic prayer book nicknamed “*Etz Hayyim 3*,” which emphasizes *kavvanot* (roughly, “intentions”) and mystical contemplation. Unlike the hasidic movement and RaMHaL, *Bet El* withdrew into pietistic practice, separated from the community.

In “Doctrinal Distinctions in Late Lurianic Prayer,” presented at the 36th Annual Conference of the Association of Jewish Studies (Chicago: December 2004), Pinchas Giller makes the following points in a discussion of mystical prayer in the school of Shalom Sharabi [my brackets]:

For the Ba’al ha-Leshem⁴³, the names were a more appropriate object of prayer than the images of the myth, and, when contemplating the names, the Ba’al ha-Leshem warned that the only appropriate version of *kavvanot*, then, was the version of Shalom Shara’abi because of his erudition in the use of the letters. For study, one could use the anthropomorphic images, and this view was echoed by the Hasidic scholastic R. Zevi Hirsch of Zhidachov [1763-1831], who permitted people to learn in terms of countenances [*paršufim*] for, and I quote, “Everything that a man imagines is corporeal.”

⁴¹ The quotes are from Norman Lamm’s *Religious Thought of Hasidism: Text and Commentary* (Hoboken: The Michael Scharf Publication Trust of Yeshiva University Press, 1999), pages xxxii and xliv. There are several English editions of both *Nefesh ha-Hayyim* and *Tanya*.

⁴² From David Katz’ review of Immanuel Etkes’ book, *The Gaon of Vilna: The Man and His Image*, translated by Jeffrey M. Green (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002), “The Posthumous Gaon of Vilna and the History of Ideas” (in *East European Jewish Affairs*, Vol. 35, No. 2, December 2005, pages 253-9), page 255.

“The best phenomenological understanding of the opposition to Hasidism lies in Allan Nadler’s work *Faith of the Mithnagdim*.”—Pinchas Giller, *Kabbalah: A Guide for the Perplexed* (London – New York: Continuum, 2011), page 39. “Allan Nadler’s work *Faith of the Mithnagdim*” = *The Faith of the Mithnagdim: Rabbinic Responses to Hasidic Rapture* [JOHNS HOPKINS STUDIES] (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997).

⁴³ Rabbi Shlomo Eliashev, or Solomon Eliashov, 1841-1924, author of *LeShem Shevo ve-Ahlahmah*, which is on Scholem’s list at the beginning of this essay.

The Ba'al ha-Leshem and R. Zevi Hirsch of Zhidachov may have been influenced by a similar discussion about the very nature of the uses of kabbalistic symbolism in the generations preceding them, namely the distinction between literal and figurative theorists. The figurative theorists tended to view the processes described in the Lurianic system as metaphors for processes too ineffable to explain; a few such theorists would include R. Avram Herrera's *Puerto del cielo*, R. Moshe Hayyim Luzzatto, and the Gaon of Vilna. On the other side were absolutists who believed in the empirical existence of the characters of the Lurianic myth, including the divine countenances; among such thinkers were Emanuel Hai Ricci ... and Shneur Zalman of Lyadi. Now, this topic has been addressed so far by Rachel Elijior, Elliot Wolfson, and Nisim Yosha, but certainly the idea of absolutism *vs* figurativism in the study of Kabbalah in general, I think, has some overlap into the realm of names *vs* countenances in *Beth El*.

Now, Shara'abi may be viewed as standing between the two schools. He was a figurativist, on the one hand; on the other hand, he was also the recipient of *gilui Eliyahu*, a vision from the prophet Elijah, and so he was a participant in the kabbalistic mythos. He concluded that both names and the mythos were substitutions for processes too ineffable to recount, opining as follows—and this is in his work *Nahar Shalom*: “May God forgive me, for these things are not as they simply seem, for I have used the language of the Rav (Luria) but the reality of the matter is not as it seems. But of the essential thing do we not know that no thought can attach itself to it? And were it possible to even understand, there would be not room to even ask the question.”⁴⁴

That Shneur Zalman of Lyady “believed in the empirical existence of the characters of the Lurianic myth” is not at all the impression one gets from other sources cited in the present article—or from the *Tanya*. Hasidic and late kabbalistic approaches (re: literal *vs* metaphoric) to the *parzufim* are discussed by our scholars far less than those to *tzimtzum*, but one would expect these to run parallel.⁴⁵

In the first half of the nineteenth century flourished another Lithuanian kabbalist, YITSHAK AYZIK HAVER, *aka* Yizhak Isaac Haver Wildmann, sometimes Waldman (1789-1853). Shaul Magid writes that Haver was “trained in the tradition of the GRA, writing an extensive commentary to Vital's *Etz Hayyim* entitled *Pithei Shearim* [which is on Scholem's list shown at the beginning of this paper], one of the most comprehensive and systematic kabbalistic texts in Lithuanian Kabbala.”⁴⁶ “As a student of the GRA (*via* R. [Menahem] Mendel of Sklov), Haver's Kabbala is largely drawn from the Ramhal's writings.”⁴⁷ Haver's *Pithei Shearim* was first published in

⁴⁴ Refer to the similar passages in Giller's *Shalom Shar'abi and the Kabbalists of Beit El* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008): pages 49-53, § A RETREAT INTO PURE THEORY.

⁴⁵ See, for example, CHAPTER 16, “The Doctrine of *Tzimtzum*,” in Rachel Elijior's *The Paradoxical Ascent to God: The Kabbalistic Theosophy of Habad Hasidism*, translated from Hebrew by Jeffrey M. Green (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993). Following Joseph Ergas (*or* Yosef Irgas), “Rabbi Shneur Zalman completely denied the possibility of understanding *tzimtzum* literally...” (—page 82).

⁴⁶ “Origin and Overcoming the Beginning: *Zimzum* as a Trope of Reading in Post-Lurianic Kabbala,” in *Beginning/Again: Toward a Hermeneutics of Jewish Texts*, ed. A. Cohen and S. Magid (New York: Seven Bridges, 2002), page 187.

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, page 211, note 137.

1888 and more recently republished (in Hebrew), Jerusalem: 2006. Magid notes, however, “Almost no scholarly work has been done on Haver.”⁴⁸

Certainly, the most important figure of *Bet El* in the nineteenth century was YOSEF HAYYIM B. ELIJAH of Baghdad (1832-1909), known as *Ben Ish Hai*, which is the title of his best-known work. *Ben Ish Hai*, which remains an authoritative reference among the Sephardim, combines *halakha* with *kabbalah*, drawing on a range of authorities, including doctrines and practices of the Safed followers of Luria.

Another Ashkenazi *yeshiva* devoted to the study of Lurianic *kabbalah* grew out of *Bet El* in Jerusalem, *Sha’ar ha-Shamayim* (GATE OF HEAVEN), founded in 1906 by a rather odd pair: Rabbi Hayyim Leib Yehuda Auerbach (1883-1954), a Polish Hasid, and Rabbi Shimon Zwi Horowitz, a Lithuanian kabbalist. This center based its practices and teachings on the RaShaSh but added its own unique approach to “the study and propagation of esoteric teachings among torah scholars.”⁴⁹

Lithuanian-born kabbalist SHLOMO ELIASHEV, Solomon Eliashov, or Rav Shlomo of Shavel (1841-1924), was the author of *LeShem Shevo ve-Ahlahamah*, which is on Scholem’s list of works in which “the basic tenets of Lurianic Kabbalah are systematically and originally presented.” As indicated above in the passage from Pinchas Giller, Eliashev built on Lurianic *kabbalah* from Vital through RaShaSh; however, in the manner of his Lithuanian forebear, the GRA, he also drew upon Cordovero, the Sarug stream, and RaMHaL. Most notably, Eliashev was the kabbalistic mentor to Abraham Isaac Kook (1865-1935).

The teachings of Polish-born YEHUDA LEIB HALEVI ASHLAG (1886-1955) are generally considered Lurianic, but they contain numerous variations and themes which are not from the recognized traditions of Luria, e.g., “the will to bestow/receive,” “the bread of shame.”

Ashlag is distinguished for having been the first to translate the entire Zohar into Hebrew, calling it *Ha Sulam* (THE LADDER) and embedding into it his Luria-based commentary. His other major work, *Talmud Eser Sefirot* (STUDY OF THE TEN SEFIROT, 1955), is an extensive commentary on Vital’s *Etz Hayyim* (TREE OF LIFE).

Several schools which are active today base their teachings on the writings of Ashlag. The two most prominent are (1) BNEI BARUCH WORLD CENTER FOR KABBALAH STUDIES, headed by Michael Laitman (1946-), who was a pupil of and assistant to Rabbi Baruch Shalom HaLevi Ashlag (1907-1991), son of Yehuda, and (2) THE KABBALAH CENTRE, founded by Philip S. Berg (1927-2013), who was a student of Rabbi Yehuda Tzvi Brandwein (1904-1969), considered to be Yehuda Ashlag’s “successor.” Both groups have published Ashlag’s writings along with numerous topical and

⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, page 211, note 136.

⁴⁹ Jonatan Meir, “The Imagined Decline of the Kabbalah...,” in *Kabbalah and Modernity: Interpretations, Transformations, Adaptations*, edited by Boaz Huss, Marco Pasi, and Kocku von Stuckrad (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2010), page 204ff.

See also Meir’s *Kabbalistic Circles in Jerusalem (1896-1948)* (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2016), CHAPTER 3. “Merging Traditions: The Sha’ar haShamayim Yeshivah.”

explanatory works by their current leaders, Laitman of BNEI BARUCH, and the late Philip Berg, his wife Karen, and his sons Yehuda and Michael of THE KABBALAH CENTRE. Both of these organizations have extensive multilingual websites: www.kabbalah.info and www.kabbalah.com respectively.⁵⁰

This all brings us to the latter half of the twentieth century with its flood of books, both academic and popular, on *kabbalah* and *Chassidus*—Ashlag’s, Laitman’s, and Berg’s among them.⁵¹ Two books at the end of this chain of developments, layers, and schisms are heartily recommended by contemporary *haredi* teachers for their summaries of Lurianic *kabbalah*—which, to these adherents, is *the kabbalah*:

- Kaplan, R. Aryeh. *Inner Space: Introduction to Kabbalah, Meditation and Prophecy* (Brooklyn: Moznaim Publishing Corporation, 1990).
- Bar-Lev, R. Yechiel. *Song of the Soul: Introduction to Kabbalah* [Hebrew original: *Yedid Nefesh* (1988)]; English translation (Petach Tikva: [distributed by Moznaim], 1994).

American-born ARYEH KAPLAN (1934-1983), known for advocating a return to Jewish observance, is one of the most popular writers on Jewish spirituality in English. His many books cover a range of subjects. Any well-stocked Jewish bookstore carries as many as two dozen titles by Kaplan, the best-known being

- *Sefer Yetzirah: The Book of Creation* (Kaplan bases his commentary on the “GRA version,” i.e., the version set by the Gaon of Vilna)
- *The Bahir: Illumination*
- *Meditation and the Bible*
- *Meditation and Kabbalah*
- *Jewish Meditation: A Practical Guide.*

⁵⁰ Refer to

- Einstein, Mara. “Kabbalah: Marketing Designer Spirituality,” = CHAPTER 7 of *Brands of Faith: Marketing Religion in a Commercial Age* [MEDIA, RELIGION AND CULTURE SERIES] (London – New York: Routledge, 2008), pages 147- 172.
- Huss, Boaz. “The New Age of Kabbalah,” in *Journal of Modern Jewish Studies*, VOLUME 6, NUMBER 2 (Basingstoke, Hants.: Carfax Publishing / Taylor & Francis, 2007), pages 107-125.
- Myers, Jody. *Kabbalah and the Spiritual Quest: The Kabbalah Centre in America* [RELIGION, HEALTH, AND HEALING series] (Westport – London: Praeger, 2007).
- _____. “Marriage and Sexual Behavior in the Teachings of the Kabbalah Centre” in *Kabbalah and Modernity: Interpretations, Transformations, Adaptations*, edited by Boaz Huss, Marco Pasi, and Kocku von Stuckrad (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2010), pages 259-281.

Online, find David Rowan’s articles

- (1) from the *Evening Standard*, “The Kabbalah Centre Exposed: Investigation” (2002) <http://www.davidrowan.com/2002/10/evening-standard-kabbalah-centre.html>,
- (2) from *The Times*, “Strings Attached–The Kabbalah Centre Exposed” (2004) <http://www.davidrowan.com/2004/04/times-strings-attached-kabbalah-centre.html>.

⁵¹ Add to the various Jewish approaches the eclectic Western occult versions of the *kabbalah* derived from the teachings of the Hermetic Order of the Golden Dawn in reprints of works by S. L. MacGregor Mathers, William Wynn Westcott, Aleister Crowley, Frater Achad, Israel Regardie, and Dion Fortune, along with more contemporary (1960s-1990s) works by authors like Gareth Knight, John Michael Greer, and Pat Zalewski.

Refer to my *Approaching the Kabbalah of Maat* (York Beach: Black Jackal Press, 2013), in particular pages 1-14 and the bibliography; and my paper, “The Study of Christian Cabala in English,” Part 3, online at <http://www.digital-brilliance.com/contributed/Karr/Biblios/ccinea.pdf>.

YECHIEL ABRAHAM BAR-LEV (b. 1943, Tel Aviv) has written commentaries on the Zohar and the Jerusalem Talmud, and he has translated and edited Joseph Karo's *Maggid Mesharim*. Something of an anti-academic, Bar-Lev is inspired by Cordovero, Luria, Luzzatto, the Gaon of Vilna, and Shneur Zalman. See the YEDID NEFESH (*lit.* "song of the soul") website, which is devoted to Rav Yechiel Bar-Lev and his works in English and Hebrew: www.yedidnefesh.com.⁵² The site offers excerpts of *Song of the Soul*, which is based on Luzzatto's *Kelah Pithei Hokhmah*.

⁵² ACCOUNT SUSPENDED: 9/3/2017. Each page of the YEDID NEFESH website is headed by a quote attributed to "Vilna Gaon," *i.e.*, the GRA, from *Kol HaTor* (VOICE OF THE TURTLEDOVE). This title exists in English, though the author is given as Rabbi Hillel Shaklover (or Shklober), "relative and student of the Vilna Gaon." Indeed, one of the translators of the work is Rabbi Yechiel Bar Lev, the other being K. Skaist.

LURIANIC KABBALAH: A BIBLIOGRAPHY

ARI via Hayyim Vital & other disciples of Isaac Luria from Safed

Afilalo, Raphael. *Arizal, Prince of the Kabbalists: Life and Works of Rabbi Itshak Luria* ([Montreal]: Kabbalah 5, 2016).

Contains numerous legends of the Arizal, then sections on Vital's works, *Ets Haim*, *Peri Ets Haim*, *Shaar Hagilgulim*, *Shaar Hakavanot*, *Shaar Hamitsvot*, *Shaar Hapesukim*, and *Shaar Rua'h Hakodesh*.

Bar Tzadok, Ariel. "Sefer Etz Haim – The Tree of Life: Gate 42, The Lectures of A'Be'Y'Ah'. Chapter 1, by Rabbi Haim Vital," = § I, CHAPTER 9, of *Walking in the Fire: Classical Torah/Kabbalistic Meditations, Practices & Prayers* (Tarzana: Kosher Torah Publishing, 2007), pages 160-167.

Basadeh, Dudaim (pseud.) [= MANDRAKES IN THE FIELD]. *The Flashflood: Merit and Meaning in Lurianic Lore* (Jerusalem: Caspit Press, 1986).

The book includes Dudaim Basadeh's essay, "Kabbalah and the Modern Sciences" (3rd April 1952), which offers brief chapters on astronomy, psychology, and cosmology.

Benyosef, Simcha H. *Living the Kabbalah: A Guide to the Sabbath and the Festivals in the Teachings of Rabbi Rafael Moshe Luria* (New York: Continuum, 1999).

"In Jerusalem there is a kabbalist who dedicates his life to teaching others how to search for God where He can be found, namely, at the days on the Jewish calendar where a special Divine energy is available. This is Rabbi Rafael Moshe Luria, a descendant of the father of kabbalists, Rabbi Isaac Luria of sixteenth-century Sefad, who is known as the holy Ari."
(—*Living the Kabbalah*, preface, page xiii)

Bokser, Ben Zion. *The Jewish Mystical Tradition* (New York: The Pilgrim Press, 1981).

Ch. 13. Isaac Luria: a selection from *Etz Hayyim*; passages from the writings of Luria's disciples

Ch. 14. Hayyim Vital: selections from *Sha'arei Kedushah* (GATES OF HOLINESS).

Breslauer, Don. ORALITY AND LITERACY IN HAYYIM VITAL'S LURIANIC KABBALAH. Ph.D. dissertation (New York: New York University, 1999).

Chajes, J. H. *Between Worlds: Dybbuks, Exorcists, and Early Modern Judaism* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2003).

Discusses the mystics of Safed, Luria in particular; see "The Dead and the Possessed," §: THE LURIA CASES (pp. 45-56), and "The Task of the Exorcist," §§: LURIANIC EXORCISM (pp. 71-85), and THE AFTERLIFE OF LURIANIC EXORCISM (pp. 85-90).

_____. "Kabbalah and the Diagrammatic Phase of the Scientific Revolution," in *Jewish Culture in Early Modern Europe: Essays in Honor of David B. Ruderman* (Cincinnati: Hebrew Union College Press / Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2014), pages 109-123.

Diamond, Jennifer B. A TRANSLATION AND ANALYSIS OF HAYYIM VITAL'S SHA'ARE KEDUSHAH, PART FOUR. Rabbinic thesis (New York: Hebrew Union College/Jewish Institute of Religion, 1989).

Dunn, James David. *Window of the Soul: The Kabbalah of Rabbi Isaac Luria*. Selections from Chayyim Vital, translated by Nathan Snyder, edited and with an Introduction by James David Dunn (San Francisco – Newburyport: Weiser Books, 2008).

The selections on the “Kings of Edom,” “Divine Rebirth,” “Adam among the Worlds,” and “Benedictions of the Soul” from the writings of Hayyim Vital, primarily *Peri Ez Hayyim* (FRUIT OF THE TREE OF LIFE).

NOTE: Items by Morris M. Faienstein marked with an asterisk (*) are reprinted in *From Safed to Kotsk*—listed below.

*Faienstein, Morris M. “Charisma and Anti-Charisma in Safed: Isaac Luria and Hayyim Vital,” in *The Journal for the Study of Sephardic and Mizrahi Jewry*, Volume 1, Issue 2 (October-November 2007), edited by Zion Zohar, on-line at <http://sephardic.fiu.edu/journal/> [DEFUNCT LINK: 01/07/2014]

*_____. “From Kabbalist to Zaddik: R. Isaac Luria as Precursor of the Baal Shem Tov,” in *Studies in Jewish Civilization 13: SPIRITUAL DIMENSIONS OF JUDAISM* (Omaha: Creighton University, 2003).

_____. *From Safed to Kotsk: Studies in Kabbalah and Hasidism* (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2013).

_____. “Grave Visitation by Rabbi Isaac Luria and Rabbi Menachem Mendel Schneerson,” in *Modern Judaism: A Journal of Jewish Ideas and Experience*, Volume 36, Issue 1 (Oxford University Press, 2016), pages 31-41.

*_____. “Safed Kabbalah and the Sephardic Heritage,” in *Sephardic & Mizrahi Jewry: From the Golden Age of Spain to Modern Times*, edited by Zion Zohar (New York: New York University Press, 2005).

*_____. “Traces of Lurianic Kabbalah: Texts and their Histories” in *Jewish Quarterly Review* 103 (Leiden: Brill, 2013), pp. 101-106—a review essay of Joseph Avivi’s *Kabbalat ha-Ari* (Jerusalem: Ben Zvi Institute, 2008).

Fine, Lawrence. “The Art of Metoposcopy: A Study in Luria’s Charismatic Knowledge,” in *AJS Review*, vol. XI, no. 1, ed. Robert Chazan (Cambridge: Association for Jewish Studies, Spring 1986); also in *Essential Papers on Kabbalah*, ed. Lawrence Fine (New York: New York University Press, 1995).

_____. “The Contemplative Practice of *Yihudim* in Lurianic Kabbalah,” in *Jewish Spirituality II*, edited by Arthur Green (New York: The Crossroad Publishing Company, 1987).

_____. “Maggidic Revelation in the Teachings of Isaac Luria,” in *Mystics, Philosophers and Politicians: Essays in Jewish Intellectual History in Honor of Alexander Altmann*, edited by J. Reinhartz and D. Swetschinski (Durham: Duke University Press, 1982).

_____. *Physician of the Soul, Healer of the Cosmos: Isaac Luria and His Kabbalistic Fellowship* [STANFORD STUDIES IN JEWISH HISTORY AND CULTURE] (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2003).

Physician of the Soul is the most important study on Luria in English to date. Not only is Lurianic doctrine treated but also Luria's life, his activities, and his circle of fellow kabbalists—all without succumbing to the mythology which surrounds the Ari. Oddly, Fine does not tell us how Luria actually died, just that he died “by a kiss.”

_____. “Recitation of *Mishnah* as a Vehicle for Mystical Inspiration: A Contemplative Technique Taught by Hayyim Vital,” in *Revue des Etudes juives*, CXLI (1-2) (Louvain: Editions Peeters, 1982).

_____. “The Study of Torah as a Rite of Theurgical Contemplation in Lurianic Kabbalah,” in *Approaches to Judaism in Medieval Times I*, edited by David Blumenthal [BROWN JUDAIC STUDIES, no. 54] (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1988).

_____. TECHNIQUES OF MYSTICAL MEDITATION FOR ACHIEVING PROPHECY AND THE HOLY SPIRIT IN THE TEACHINGS OF ISAAC LURIA AND HAYYIM VITAL. Ph.D. dissertation (Waltham: Brandeis University, 1976).

Fishbane, Eitan P. “Perceptions of Greatness: Constructions of the Holy Man in *Shivhei ha-Ari*,” in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Twenty-Seven (2012), Special Issue: KABBALAH ON THE MARGINS – TRANSFORMATIONS OF KABBALAH IN ASHKENAZI SOCIETIES, edited by Daniel Abrams with guest editors Nathaniel Deutsch and Jean Baumgarten (Los Angeles: Cherub Press).

Freedman, Daphne. *Man and the Theogony in the Lurianic Cabala*. [GORGAS DISSERTATIONS 12 / JEWISH STUDIES 2] (Piscataway: Gorgias Press, 2006).

“I have concentrated on the versions of the Lurianic cabala expounded by Haim Vital and Joseph ibn Tabul and have not included the predominantly linguistic innovations of Israel Sarug which merit separate treatment.” (—page 13, n. 3)

Giller, Pinchas. *Reading the Zohar: The Sacred Text of the Kabbalah* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2001).

Giller discusses how the *Zohar* was interpreted by the Safed Kabbalists, Moses Cordovero and, particularly, Isaac Luria, with special attention to developments of the *Idrot*.

Glotzer, Leonard R. *The Kabbalistic System of The Ari: The Hidden Meaning, Symbolism and Sexuality of Lurian Mysticism* (Denver: Outskirts Press, Inc., 2007).

“This book attempts to present an accurate picture of Luria's thoughts, and is based on the writings of Luria's favorite student, Rabbi Chaim Vital. ... It is said that Luria authorized only Vital from his many students to preserve his system.” (—PREFACE, p. i)

Goldish, Matt. (ed.) *Spirit Possession in Judaism: Cases and Contexts from the Middle Ages to the Present* (Detroit: Wayne State University, 2003).

§ II contains five articles on spirit possession in Safed, and there are eight appendices offering texts from this period. The predominant sources for the articles and the texts offered are the works of Hayyim Vital.

Idel, Moshe. “Ascensions, Gender and Pillars in Safedian Kabbalah,” in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, vol. 25, edited by D. Abrams (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2011).

_____. “On Mobility, Individuals and Groups: Prolegomenon for a Sociological Approach to Sixteenth-Century Kabbalah,” in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish*

Mystical Texts, Volume Three, edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 1998).

_____. “Revelation and the ‘Crisis of Tradition’ in Kabbalah,” in *Constructing Tradition: Means and Myths of Transmission in Western Esotericism*, edited by Andreas B. Kilcher (Leiden – Boston: Brill: 2010): § 6. R. Isaac Luria Ashkenazi: Revelation as Source of Kabbalah.

_____. “Italy in Safed, Safed in Italy: Toward an Interactive History of Sixteenth-Century Kabbalah,” in *Cultural Intermediaries: Jewish Intellectuals in Early Modern Italy*, edited by David B. Ruderman and Giuseppe Veltri (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004).

Ish-Shalom, Zvi. RADICAL DEATH: THE PARADOXICAL UNITY OF BODY, SOUL AND THE COSMOS IN LURIANIC KABBALAH. Ph.D. dissertation (Waltham: Brandeis University, 2013).

Jacobs, Louis. “Uplifting the Sparks in Later Jewish Mysticism,” in *Jewish Spirituality II*, edited by Arthur Green (New York: The Crossroad Publishing Company, 1987).

Jacobson, Yoram. “The Aspect of the ‘Feminine’ in Lurianic Kabbalah,” in *Gershom Scholem’s MAJOR TRENDS IN JEWISH MYSTICISM 50 Years After* [PROCEEDINGS OF THE SIXTH INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON THE HISTORY OF JEWISH MYSTICISM], edited by Peter Schäfer and Joseph Dan (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck], 1993).

Kallus, Menachem. THE THEURGY OF PRAYER IN THE LURIANIC KABBALAH. PhD dissertation (Jerusalem: Hebrew University, 2002).

Kaplan, Aryeh. *Meditation and Kabbalah* (York Beach: Samuel Weiser, 1982).

Ch. 6. “The Ari” (passages from Vital’s *Sha’ar Ruah ha-Kodesh*, GATE OF THE HOLY SPIRIT).

Klein, Aaron; and Klein, Jenny Machlowitz (translators). *Tales in Praise of the ARI*. Drawings by Moshe Raviv (Philadelphia: The Jewish Publication Society, 1970).

“Wonder tales” from *Sefer Shivchai ha-Ari* with tired “modern art” drawings.

Klein, Eliahu (trans/comm). *Kabbalah of Creation: Isaac Luria’s Earlier Mysticism* (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson Inc., 2000).

Klein offers a translation of *Sha’ar ha-Kelalim* (GATES OF PRINCIPLES), which serves as a preface to some printed editions of Vital’s *Etz Hayyim*, though it is likely written by one of Luria’s other students, Moshe Yonah. According to the introduction, “It is obvious that ‘The Gate of Principles’ is an abbreviated version of the original and complete unpublished manuscript of Moshe Jonah’s *Kanfei Yonah...*” (—page 23). The text presents a version of Luria’s system which was apparently formulated earlier than Vital’s *magnum opus*.

Krassen, Miles. “Visiting Graves,” “Vital at Abbaye’s Grave,” and “The Lurianic Adam,” in *Kabbalah: A Newsletter of Current Research in Jewish Mysticism*, vol. 3, no. 1, edited by Hananya Goodman (Jerusalem: [Fall] 1988):

<https://sce.academia.edu/HananyaGoodman>.

Krassen translates and comments on two passages from Vital’s *Sha’ar ha-Gilgulim* (GATE OF TRANSMIGRATIONS). Also in this issue of *Kabbalah* is a segment of *Sefer Etz Hayyim* on the ascent of saints translated by Eliyahu Klein.

Lenowitz Harris. *The Jewish Messiahs: From the Galilee to Crown Heights* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998): CHAPTER 6. “The Messiahs of Safed: Isaac Luria and Hayim Vital.”

Magid, Shaul. “Conjugal Union, Mourning and *Talmud Torah* in R. Isaac Luria’s *Tikkun Hazot*,” in *Daat: A Journal of Jewish Philosophy and Kabbalah*, Number 36 (Ramat-Gan: Bar-Ilan University, 1996), pages xvii-xlv.

_____. “Constructing Women from Men: The Metaphysics of Male Homosexuality among Lurianic Kabbalists in Sixteenth-Century Safed,” in *Jewish Studies Quarterly*, Volume 17, No. 1 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2010), pages 4-28.

_____. *From Metaphysics to Midrash: Myth, History, and the Interpretation of Scripture in Lurianic Kabala* (Bloomington – Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2008).

Magid argues “that the mythic world of Lurianic Kabbala is both a response to, and a construction of, the historical reality in which it lived; furthermore, its canonical status influences the way future generations understand their own historical station.” (— INTRODUCTION, page 1)

_____. “From Theosophy to Midrash: Lurianic Exegesis and the Garden of Eden,” in *AJS Review*, Volume XXII, Number 1 (Cambridge: Association for Jewish Studies, 1997).

Magid shows how Lurianic kabbalah, primarily *via* Hayyim Vital’s writings, presents itself as a “meta-text” which seeks no justification in Scripture, as its predecessor, the *Zohar*, did. This suggests that only through the Lurianic meta-text can the Torah be understood.

_____. “Jewish Kabbalah: Hayyim Vital’s *Shaarei Kedusha*,” in *Contemplative Literature: A Comparative Sourcebook on Meditation and Contemplative Prayer*, edited by Louis Komjathy (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2015), pages 197-264.

This paper includes a “partial rendering of part 4 of the *Shaarei Kedusha*” (—p. 234, n. *).

_____. “Kabbalah and Postmodern Jewish Philosophy – From Theosophy to Midrash: Lurianic Exegesis on Adam and Eve and the Garden of Eden,” in *Journal of Textual Reasoning*, [OLD SERIES] vol. 4, no. 2 (June 1995), at <http://jtr.lib.virginia.edu/textual-reasoning-vol-4-2-june-1995/>

“The texts presented here come from three collections, *Sha’ar Ha-Pesukim*, *Sefer Ha-Likkutim*, and *Likkutei Torah*, all of which are running commentaries to the Torah. *Sha’ar Ha-Pesukim* is one of the Vitalian *Shemonah She’arim*. R. Meir Poppers, in his *Derekh Etz Hayyim*, called *Sefer Ha-Likkutim* (and *Sefer Derushim*) part of the “early edition” the Lurianic corpus. This would make it part of the Vitalian school as well. We know that the first edition of *Sefer Ha-Likkutim* (published under that title) was edited by R. Benjamin Ha-Levi, a student of Vital. *Likkutei Torah*, first printed in Zolkeiw in 1775 appears to be a mosaic of various earlier material consisting largely of the second section of R. Meir Poppers’ *Nof Etz Hayyim* combined with portions of R. Ya’akov Zemah’s *Ozrot Hayyim*, *Adam Yashar*, and *Sefer Derushim*.” (—¶7)

_____. “Lurianic Kabbalah and Its Literary Form: Myth, Fiction, History,” in *Prooftexts: A Journal of Jewish Literary History*, Volume 29, Number 3 (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, Fall 2009).

Matt, Daniel C. *The Essential Kabbalah: The Heart of Jewish Mysticism* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1994).

Matt includes excerpts from various Lurianic writings.

Menzi, Donald Wilder; and Padeh, Zve. *The Tree of Life. Chayyim Vital's Introduction to the Kabbalah of Isaac Luria* [ETZ HAYYIM, Volume 1: THE PALACE OF ADAM KADMON] (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson Inc., 1999).

An English translation of the first (of seven) “palaces” from Vital’s *Etz Hayyim* with a substantial introduction.

Meroz Ronit. “Faithful Transmission vs Innovation: Luria and His Disciples,” in *Gershom Scholem's MAJOR TRENDS IN JEWISH MYSTICISM 50 Years After* [PROCEEDINGS OF THE SIXTH INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON THE HISTORY OF JEWISH MYSTICISM], edited by Peter Schäfer and Joseph Dan (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck], 1993).

_____. “Zelem (Image) and Medicine in the Lurianic Teaching (According to the Writings of R. Hayim Vital), in *Koroth*, Vol. 8, Nos. 5-6 (Jerusalem: The Israel Institute of the History of Medicine, Fall 1982), pages 170-176.

Pachter, Mordechai. *Roots of Faith and Devequt: Studies in the History of Kabbalistic Ideas* (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2004).

“[F]our studies by Mordechai Pachter on central ideas in kabbalistic thought: (1) The Root of Faith is the Root of Heresy; (2) Circles and Straightness; (3) Smallness and Greatness; (4) *Devequt* in Sixteenth Century Safed. The first study describes the most supreme point of deity revealing itself out of the depths of *Ein-Sof* (the Infinite), the point defined as faith. The second chapter goes on to the two modes of revelation and operation of all the Divine *sefirot*, the modes of circles and straightness; and the third chapter treats the *Sefirot*, namely the two lower configurations, *ze'ir 'anpin* (the Short Countenance) and *nuqva* (the Female), who are the Lurianic equivalents of the *sefirot Tiferet* and *Malkhut*, in their two states of development and growth: the state of *qatnut* (smallness) and the state of *gadlut* (greatness); the final chapter discusses the lowest point of the Divine world, the point at which man and God meet in communion, i.e. *devequt*.”

(—Cherub Press: <http://cherub-press.com/>)

Palvanov, Efraim (compiler/annotator). *Tikkun Leil Shavuot* [RECTIFICATION FOR SHAVUOT NIGHT] – *The Arizal's Torah Study Guide* (Toronto: Lulu Press, Inc./www.mayimachronim.com, 2016).

This book presents the Arizal’s original study guide, in both Hebrew and English. (p. 4)

Patai, Raphael. “Exorcism and Xenoglossia among the Safed Kabbalists” in *Journal of American Folklore*, vol. 91, no. 361 (1978); and *idem*, *On Jewish Folklore* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1983).

A summary of kabbalistic beliefs concerning the punishment of sin after death, exorcism, and spirit possession. An excerpt from Vital’s *Sefer ha-Gilgulim* is translated.

_____. from *Shivhe ha-Ari*, “On Safed Kabbalists,” in *Gates to the Old City. A Book of Jewish Legends* (New York: Avon Books, 1980): pages 504-511.

Pinson, DovBer. *Reincarnation and Judaism: The Journey of the Soul* (Northvale: Jason Aronson Inc., 1999).

Based largely on Vital’s *Sha'ar ha-Gilgulim*.

Putzu, Vadim. BOTTLED POETRY / QUENCHER OF HOPES: WINE AS A SYMBOL AND AS AN INSTRUMENT IN SAFEDIAN KABBALAH AND BEYOND (Ph.D. diss., Jerusalem: Hebrew Union College – Jewish Institute of Religion, 2015).

Chapter 6. Hayyim Vital and Lurianic Kabbalah

Rossoff, Dovid. “Arizal and His Disciples” = CHAPTER 6 of *Safed – The Mystical City* (Jerusalem: Sha’ar Books, 1991).

Samuel, Michael. “FROM MY FLESH SHALL I SEE GOD”: THE EMPIRICAL METHOD IN LURIANIC KABBALAH. M.A. thesis (Montreal: Concordia University, 1990).

Schneider, Sarah. “The Small Light to Rule by Night: The Seven Stages of Feminine Development—excerpt from *The Diminished Moon* by R. Isaac Luria (Ari),” in (idem) *Kabbalistic Writings on the Nature of Masculine and Feminine* (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson Inc., 2001), pages 53-98.

Scholem, Gershom. *Kabbalah* (articles from *ENCYCLOPEDIA JUDAICA*) (Jerusalem and New York: Keter Publishing House and Times Books, 1974; rpt. New York: Meridian, 1978; rpt. New York: Dorset Press, 1987).

pp. 128-44: “The Doctrine of Creation in Lurianic Kabbalah”

pp. 420-8: “Isaac Luria”

pp. 443-8: “Hayyim Vital.”

_____. “Isaac Luria and His School” = LECTURE SEVEN in *Major Trends in Jewish Mysticism* (Jerusalem: Schocken Publishing House, 1941; reprinted frequently by Schocken Books, New York).

_____. *On the Kabbalah and Its Symbolism* (New York: Schocken Books, 1965).

pp. 108-17: in § “Kabbalah and Myth”

pp. 149-53: in § “Tradition and New Creation in the Ritual of the Kabbalists”

_____. *On the Mystical Shape of the Godhead* (New York: Schocken Books, 1991).

pp. 228-41: in § “Gilgul: The Transmigration of Souls”

_____. *Sabbatai Sevi: The Mystical Messiah* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1973).

Ch.I.IV. “Lurianic Kabbalah and its myth of exile and redemption”

Ch.I.V. “The historical role and social significance of Lurianic Kabbalah”

Ch I.VI. “The spread of Lurianic Kabbalah until 1665”

Schwartz, Howard. *Gabriel’s Palace: Jewish Mystical Tales* (New York – Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993): *The Circle of the Ari*, pages 80-103.

Shamir, Yehudah. *The Spider and the Raven: Six Kabbalists of Sixteenth Century Safed* (Austin: I. D. A. Press, 1971).

“Transmigrations of the Souls – A Translation of Chapter Four of *Sefer ha-Gilgulim* by Rabbi Hayyim Vital” – introduction, text and notes (pages 73-95).

Silberman, Neil Asher. *Heavenly Powers: Unraveling the Secret History of the Kabbalah* (New York: Grosset/Putnam, 1998).

CHAPTER 6. “Lifting the Sparks”

Sonsino, Rifat; and Syme, Daniel B. “The Mysticism of Luria” = CHAPTER 5 of *Finding God: Ten Jewish Responses* (New York: Union of American Hebrew Congregations, 1986).

Tishby, Isaiah. *The Doctrine of Evil in Lurianic Kabbalah*, translated by David Solomon, with a foreword by Professor Yoram Jacobson (London: Kegan Paul, [forever FORTHCOMING]).

“... This book, cited by every significant bibliography in kabbalistic scholarship, is the first and only comprehensive work ever to provide a definitive description of Lurianic kabbalah. Working with an immense range of texts, Isaiah Tishby approached his discussion from one specific angle—the problem of evil. Tishby demonstrates that Luria's unique contribution to theodicy was to indicate that the source of evil is the result of a profound catastrophe that takes place deep within the Godhead itself. This idea is consistent with ancient gnostic themes but is reinterpreted by Luria to provide a uniquely Jewish response to the problem of evil. This is the first ever translation of the work into English, and represents a valuable contribution to the world of Jewish scholarship.”

– Kegan Paul description

_____. “Gnostic Doctrines in Sixteenth-Century Jewish Mysticism,” in *Journal of Jewish Studies*, vol. 6 (Cambridge [England], 1955).

Tishby's brief article deals with the Lurianic ideas of the “breaking of the vessels” and the “falling of the sparks.”

Tree 4: RA'A/EVIL, edited by David Meltzer (Berkeley: Berkeley/Tree, 1974).

- pp. 12-13: from *Etz Hayim*, Hayim Vital (*Etz Hayim*, Ch.1, translated from the Hebrew by Shani Stanley Babin).
- pp. 28-30: from *Sefer ha-Gilgulim*, Hayim Vital (translation from the German by Jack Hirschman)
- pp. 160-4: from *Sha'arei Qedusha* (Part 3, Gates 4 and 5), Hayim Vital (translated by Zalman Schachter).

Derived from these translations are those in *The Secret Garden: An Anthology in the Kabbalah*, edited by David Meltzer (New York: The Seabury Press, 1976), pages 176-198.

Twersky, Boruch (trans.) *The Life of the Arizal: True Stories from Tzefas's Golden Age* ([New York]: Menucha Publishers, 2016).

Weinstein, Roni. *Kabbalah and Jewish Modernity* (Oxford – Portland: The Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2016).

Wexelman, David M. *The Jewish Concept of Reincarnation and Creation*, based on the writings of Rabbi Chaim Vital (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson, 1999).

“...adapted and translated for the English reader directly from the original text, *Gateway to Reincarnation*, written by Rabbi Chaim Vital, z”l, as taught to him by the Arizal.”

_____. *Kabbalah: The Splendor of Judaism* (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson, 2000).

“This book ... is primarily derived from the work of Rabbi Chaim Vital called *The Fruit of the Tree of Life* [PRI ETZ HAYYIM].” (—FOREWORD, page xvii)

Wineman, Aryeh. “The Dialectic of *Tikkun* in the Legends of Ari,” in *Prooftexts: A Journal of Jewish Literary History*, vol. 5, no. 1 (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1985).

The legends of Luria’s “wondrous knowledge,” *i.e.*, unlimited access to truth.

Winston, Rabbi Pinchas (translator/annotator). *Sha’ar haGilgulim: Gate of Reincarnations*. An English Translation of the Arizal’s work on reincarnation: Volume 1 – Chapters 1-35, Volume 2 – Chapters 36-40 (Kiryat Yearim: Thirtysix.org, 2014)—English and Hebrew.

Wisnefsky, Moshe (trans. & comm.) *Apples from the Orchard: Gleanings from the Mystical Teachings of Rabbi Yitzchach Luria—the Arizal on the Weekly Torah Portion* (Malibu: Thirty Seven Books, 2006).

“The teachings in the present anthology are culled from several of Rabbi Vital’s works, chiefly *Sha’ar HaPesukin*, *Sefer HaLikutim*, and *Likutei Torah*.” (—PREFACE, page xi)

Wolfson, Elliot R. “Divine Suffering and the Hermeneutics of Reading: Philosophical Reflections on Lurianic Mythology,” in *Suffering Religion*, eds. Robert Gibbs and Elliot Wolfson (London – New York: Routledge, 2002); also in Wolfson’s *Pathways: Philosophic and Poetic Reflections on the Hermeneutics of Time & Language* (Barrytown: Station Hill, 2004).

_____. “Weeping, Death, and Spiritual Ascent in Sixteenth-Century Jewish Mysticism,” in *Death, Ecstasy, and Other Worldly Journeys*, edited by J. Collins and M. Fishbane (Albany: State University of New York, 1995).

“In the remainder of this study I would like to concentrate on one specific ecstatic technique, that of weeping, which appears a number of times in the writings of Vital” (—page 215).

Work of the Chariot [W.C. #6] *Tree of Life* (BRANCHES I – X) (Los Angeles: Work of the Chariot, 1970); Hebrew and English, with diagrams.

Vital, Chaim, also Chayim and Hayyim

_____. *Derush ha-Daat – Explanation of Knowledge*, translated by Yair Alon ([n.p.]: David Smith, LLC, 2016).

_____. *Etz Chayim – The Tree of Life* [twelve volumes: Tome 1 of 12, Tome 2 of 12, etc.] ([n.p.]: David Smith, LLC, 2016).

_____. *Ktavim Chasidim / New Writings: Brit Menucha – COVENANT OF REST / Shaarei Kedusha – GATES OF HOLINESS*, translated by Yaron Ever Hadani and Elyakim Getz (Monfalcone: Providence University, 2006).

Ktavim Chasidim contains Vital’s commentary on *Brit Menucha*, which “deals with Kabbalah Ma’asit (Practical Kabbalah) and the fourth part of *Shaarei Kedusha*, which “deals with practical ways to force Ruach Ha-Kodesh (Divine Inspiration) to descend upon us.” This work, thus, completes *Shaarei Kedusha*, listed immediately below.

_____. *Rehovot ha-Daat – Expansions of Knowledge*, translated by Yair Alon ([n.p.]: David Smith, LLC, 2016).

_____. (1572). *Sefer ‘Ets Hayyim*, separate translations by Menahem Kallus (GATE OF PRINCIPLES) and Brian Ogren (GATE OF INTRODUCTIONS), in *Early Modern Workshop: Jewish History Resources*, Volume 1 (EMW 2004): EARLY MODERN JEWRIES (Middletown: Wesleyan University, 2004), at <http://fordham.bepress.com/emw/>

_____. *Sefer ha-Peulot – Book of Operations*, translated by Yair Alon [five volumes: Tome 1 of 5, Tome 2 of 5, etc.] ([n.p.]: David Smith, LLC, 2016).

_____. *Sefer Yetzirah – Book of Formation* ([n.p.]: David Smith, LLC, 2016).

The title page of the text-commentary reads, “*Book of Formation* / Attributed to our Forefather Abraham – may the Peace be with him / According to the version of our Master and Rabbi, the Arizal / With explanations of our teacher and our Rabbi, the great light, The holy Gaon and divine kabbalist, Rabbi Chaim Vital of blessed memory / [published for the first time out of an unique manuscript in the world].”

_____. *Shaar HaGilgulim: The Gates of Reincarnation* [THE EIGHTH GATE] Translated from the teachings of Rabbi Isaac Luria 1534-1575 by Bar Chaim, Yitzchak [pseud. Rabbi Pinchas Winston] trans. (Malibu: Thirty Seven Books Publishing, 2003).

Shaar haGilgulim is the eighth gate of Hayyim Vital’s *Shemonah She’arim*. Yitzchak Bar Chaim has inserted clearly marked “personal annotations ... to help the reader” (page v).

_____. *Shaarei Kedusha: Gates of Holiness*, translated by Yaron Ever Hadani (Belize City: Providence University, 2006).

“*Shaarei Kedusha* is an inspirational work by Rabbi Chaim Vital (1543-1620), the foremost disciple of The Ari. It contains instructions and exhortations for a life of utmost holiness, which will ultimately elevate the person to the point where he will be worthy of Divine Inspiration (*Ruah Ha-Kodesh*). ... Respectful of the tradition, we will here omit the fourth part, which was published only recently for the first time in history in *Ktavim Chadashim* (THE NEW WRITINGS). We will publish its translation separately.”

—from the preface by Fabrizio Lanza, page viii

_____. *Shaar Ruach ha-Kodesh – Gate of the Holy Spirit* [three volumes: Tome 1 of 3, Tome 2 of 3, etc.] ([n.p.]: David Smith, LLC, 2016).

_____. *The Tree of Life – Volume One: THE PALACE OF ADAM KADMON* – E. Collé & H. Collé, trans. (CreateSpace Independent Publishing Platform, 2015).

An English translation of the first (of seven) “palaces” from Vital’s *Etz Hayyim* with a perfunctory introduction. This translation comes in two versions: English only and English-Hebrew.

_____. *The Tree of Life – Volume Two: THE PALACE OF POINTS* – E. Collé & H. Collé, trans. (CreateSpace Independent Publishing Platform, 2016).

An English translation of the second (of seven) “palaces” from Vital’s *Etz Hayyim* with a 12-page introduction. This translation is English only.

Other works by or about Vital

Bos, Gerrit. “Hayyim Vital’s ‘Practical Kabbalah and Alchemy’: A 17th-Century Book of Secrets,” in *The Journal of Jewish Thought and Philosophy*, vol. 4 (Harwood Academic Publishers GmbH, 1994).

Faienstein, Morris M. “Dreams and Dissonance in Rabbi Hayyim Vital’s *Book of Visions*,” in *From Safed to Kotsk: Studies in Kabbalah and Hasidism* (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2013), pp. 49-60.

_____. (trans) *Jewish Mystical Autobiographies: BOOK OF VISIONS and BOOK OF SECRETS* (Mahwah: Paulist Press, 1999).

The texts translated are *Sefer ha-Hezyonot* (BOOK OF VISIONS) by Hayyim Vital and *Megillat Setarim* (BOOK OF SECRETS) by Rabbi Yitzhak Isaac Safrin of Komarno, a 19th-century *hasid* who thought himself to be a reincarnation of Isaac Luria.

_____. “*Maggidim*, Spirits, and Women in Rabbi Hayyim Vital’s *Book of Visions*,” in *From Safed to Kotsk: Studies in Kabbalah and Hasidism* (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2013), pp. 85-94.

_____. “The Possession of Rabbi Hayyim Vital by Jesus of Nazareth,” in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume 37, edited by Daniel Abrams (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2017), pages 29-36.

On passages from Vital’s *Book of Visions*.

_____. “Women as Prophets and Visionaries in Medieval and Early Modern Judaism,” in *From Safed to Kotsk: Studies in Kabbalah and Hasidism* (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2013)

See pages 70-84, § IV, on Vital and *The Book of Visions* on the spirit possession of Raphael Anav’s daughter.

Jacobs, Louis. *Jewish Mystical Testimonies* (New York: Schocken Books, 1977).

Chapter II. “The Visions of Hayyim Vital” (five selections from *Sefer ha-Hezyonot*).

Magic, Shaul. “The Politics of (Un)Conversion: The ‘Mixed Multitude’ (*Erev Rav*) as Conversos in Rabbi Hayyim Vital’s ‘*Ets Ha-Da’at at Tov*,” in *The Jewish Quarterly Review*, VOLUME 95, NUMBER 4 (University of Pennsylvania, Fall 2005), pages 625-666.

Patai, Raphael. *The Jewish Alchemists. A History and Source Book* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994).

Ch. 28. “Hayyim Vital, Alchemist” (page 341: “Vital’s interest in magic and alchemy has been underplayed to such an extent by the historians of Jewish mysticism that one has the impression that they are embarrassed by the fact that this great Kabbalist devoted much of his attention to such subjects”).

Vital, Chaim. *Sefer Ha-Goralot: The Book of Oracles*, translated by Elyakim Getz (Belize City: Providence University, 2007).

Israel Sarug

Beltran, Miquel. *The Influence of Abraham Cohen de Herrera’s Kabbalah of Spinoza’s Metaphysics* [IBERIAN RELIGIOUS WORLD, Book 2] (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2016): pages 32-39.

Drob, Sanford L. *Symbols of the Kabbalah: Philosophical and Psychological Perspectives* (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson, Inc., 2000): § ISRAEL SARUG, pages 126-127.

Fine, Lawrence. *Physician of the Soul, Healer of the Cosmos...* (Stanford University Press, 2003): brief reference on page 3 and the extensive note 1 on page 361.

Hertz, Naftali. *Mystic Tales from the EMEK HAMELECH*, with commentary by R. DovBer Pinson (Brooklyn: IYYUN Center for Jewish Spirituality, 2015).

R. DovBer Pinson’s introduction discusses Sarug, pages 12-14.

Idel, Moshe. "Ascensions, Gender and Pillars in Safedian Kabbalah," in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, vol. 25, edited by D. Abrams (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2011).

_____. "Differing Conceptions of Kabbalah in the Early 17th Century," in *Jewish Thought in the Seventeenth Century*, edited by Isadore Twersky and Bernard Septimus [CENTER FOR JEWISH STUDIES HARVARD JUDAIC STUDIES, VI] (Cambridge – London: Harvard University Press, 1987); Sarug is discussed in § J, pages 178-183 *et passim*.

_____. "Italy in Safed, Safed in Italy: Toward an Interactive History of Sixteenth-Century Kabbalah," in *Cultural Intermediaries: Jewish Intellectuals in Early Modern Italy*, edited by David B. Ruderman and Giuseppe Veltri (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004); Sarug is discussed on pages 255-256.

_____. §§ R. ISRAEL SARUG AND HIS SOURCES [VII], THE SOURCES OF SARUG [VIII], and OTHER SARUGIAN TEXTS [IX] within Chapter 10 ("Theosophical Interpretations of the Golem") of *Golem: Jewish Magical and Mystical Traditions on the Artificial Anthropoid* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1990).

Matt, Daniel C. *The Essential Kabbalah: The Heart of Jewish Mysticism* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1994).

Matt offers a brief excerpt from Sarug's *Limmudei Atsilut* called "TRACES" on page 97.

Magid, Shaul. "The Metaphysics of Malkhut: Malkhut as Eyn Sof in the Writings of Ya'akov Koppel of Mezritch," in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Twenty-Seven (2012), Special Issue: KABBALAH ON THE MARGINS – TRANSFORMATIONS OF KABBALAH IN ASHKENAZI SOCIETIES, edited by Daniel Abrams with guest editors Nathaniel Deutsch and Jean Baumgarten (Los Angeles: Cherub Press), pages 245-267—especially page 253-254.

Meroz, Ronit. "Contrasting Opinions among the Founders of R. Israel Sarug's School," in *Experience et Ecriture Mystiques dans les Religions du Livre*, edited by Paul Fenton and Roland Goetschel [ETUDES SUR LE JUDAISME MEDIEVAL, tome xxii] (Leiden - Boston - Köln: Brill, 2000).

_____. "Faithful Transmission vs Innovation: Luria and His Disciples," in *Gershom Scholem's MAJOR TRENDS IN JEWISH MYSTICISM 50 Years After* [Proceedings of the Sixth International Conference on the History of Jewish Mysticism], edited by P. Schäfer and J. Dan (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck], 1993).

Schwartz, Howard. *Gabriel's Palace: Jewish Mystical Tales* (New York – Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993), § 43. DELIVERING A MESSAGE, pages 95-97.

Shatil, Sharron. "The Kabbalah of R. Israel Sarug: A Lurianic-Cordoverian Encounter," in *The Review of Rabbinic Judaism* 14 (Leiden: Brill: 2011), pages 158-187.

Menahem Azarya of Fano

Abrams, Daniel. “Textual Fixity and Textual Fluidity: Kabbalistic Textuality and the Hypertextualism of Kabbalah Scholarship,” in *Kabbalistic Manuscripts and Textual Theory: Methodologies of Textual Scholarship and Editorial Practice in the Study of Jewish Mysticism* (revised and expanded edition: Jerusalem – Los Angeles: The Magnes Press – Cherub Press, 2014).

Chapter 6, § 4. RE-EDITING AS A RELIGIOUS IMPERATIVE: A PSYCHOLOGICAL APPRECIATION OF THE THEURGIC JUSTIFICATION OF EDITORIAL PRACTICE, which discusses “the repeated efforts of Menahem Azariah da Fano to revise, edit and claim as his own the work known as *Kanfei Yonah*” (—p. 703).

Bonfil, Robert. “Halakhah, Kabbalah and Society: Some Insights into Rabbi Menahem Azariah da Fano’s Inner World,” in *Jewish Thought in the Seventeenth Century*, edited by Isadore Twersky and Bernard Septimus (Cambridge – London: Harvard University Press, 1987).

Busi, Giulio. *Mantua e la qabbalah / Mantua and the Kabbalah* (Milano: Skira editore, 2001). Catalogue for the exhibition of Mantuan kabbalistic manuscripts, Mantova: Palazzo della Ragione (September 2001), and New York: Casa Italiana Zerilli-Marimò Center for Jewish History (March 2002), in Italian and English.

See especially “The Mantuan Kabbalistic Workshop,” § 5. EZRA AND MENACHEM AZARYAH FANO: THE DISCOVERY OF THE LURIANIC KABBALAH.

Matt, Daniel C. *The Essential Kabbalah: The Heart of Jewish Mysticism* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1994).

Matt offers a brief excerpt from Fano’s “On the *Tehiru*” from the beginning of his *Yonat Elem*, titled SHATTERING AND GROWTH—page 96.

Mayse, Ariel. “Fano, Menahem Azariah da,” in *Encyclopedia of the Bible and Its Reception*, vol. 8 [ESSENES – FIDEISM], (Berlin: De Gruyter, 2014), cols. 863-864.

Menachem Azarya of Fano. *Reincarnations of Souls*, with additions, annotations, footnotes, and corrections called *Meir Ayin...* Yerucham Meir Lainer (trans.) (Jerusalem: Haktav Institute, 2001).

An annotated translation of *Gilgulei Neshamot*, an account of the reincarnations of figures throughout Jewish history, presented alphabetically.

Naftali Hertz Bacharach

Hertz, Naftali. *Mystic Tales from the EMEK HAMELECH*, with commentary by R. DovBer Pinson. Brooklyn: IYYUN Center for Jewish Spirituality, 2015.

“*Emek HaMelech*, besides being a profound work on Kabbalah, contains a wealth of spiritual stories embedded within the text, which the author utilizes to illustrate or animate a particular point of interest”—from the back cover.

Scholem, Gershom. “Naphtali Bacharach,” in *Kabbalah* [articles from *ENCYCLOPEDIA JUDAICA*] (Jerusalem and New York: Keter Publishing House and Times Books, 1974; rpt. New York: Meridian, 1978; rpt. New York: Dorset Press, 1987), pages 294-295.

_____. *On the Mystical Shape of the Godhead: Basic Concepts in the Kabbalah* (New York: Schocken Books, Inc., 1991).

Some brief passages from *Emek ha-Melekh* on evil (apparently influenced by Israel Sarug) appear on pages 81-82.

Isaiah Horowitz

Horowitz, Isaiah. *The Generations of Adam* [= TOLDOT ADAM], translated, edited and introduced by Miles Krassen, preface by Elliot R. Wolfson. [THE CLASSICS OF WESTERN SPIRITUALITY, #85] (New York – Mahwah: Paulist Press, 1996).

An introduction to *Shney Luchot Habrit*.

_____. *Shney Luchot Habrit*, translated and annotated by Eliyahu Munk, 3 volumes (Brooklyn: Lambda Publishers, Inc., 1999).

Newman, Rabbi Dr. Eugene. *Life & Teachings of Isaiah Horowitz* (London: G. J. George & Co. Ltd., 1972).

Abraham Cohen de Herrera

Altmann, Alexander. “Lurianic Kabbalah in a Platonic Key: Abraham Cohen Herrera’s *Puerta del Cielo*,” in *Hebrew Union College Annual*, vol. 53 (Cincinnati: 1982); and in *Jewish Thought in the Seventeenth Century*, edited by I. Twersky and B. Septimus (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1987).

Beltran, Miquel. *The Influence of Abraham Cohen de Herrera’s Kabbalah of Spinoza’s Metaphysics* [IBERIAN RELIGIOUS WORLD, Book 2] (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2016).

Herrera, Abraham Cohen de. *Gate of Heaven*, translated from the Spanish with Introduction and Notes by Kenneth Krabbenhoft [STUDIES IN EUROPEAN JUDAISM, VOL. 5] (Leiden: Brill, 2002).

Krabbenhoft, Kenneth. “Kabbala and Expulsion: The Case of Abraham Cohen de Herrera,” in *The Expulsion of the Jews: 1492 and After*, edited by Raymond Waddington and Arthur Williamson. (New York – London: Garland Press, 1994)

_____. THE MYSTIC TRADITION. ABRAHAM COHEN HERRERA AND PLATONIC THEOLOGY. (Ph.D. dissertation: New York: New York University, 1982).

_____. “Syncretism and Millennium in Herrera’s Kabbalah,” in *Millenarianism and Messianism in Early Modern European Culture*, Volume I: JEWISH MESSIANISM IN THE EARLY MODERN PERIOD [INTERNATIONAL ARCHIVES, 173], edited by Matt Goldish and Richard H. Popkin (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2001).

Necker, Gerold. “Circle, Point and Line: A Lurianic Myth in the *Puerta del Cielo*,” in *Creation and Re-Creation in Jewish Thought* [FESTSCHRIFT IN HONOR OF JOSEPH DAN ON THE OCCASION OF HIS SEVENTIETH BIRTHDAY], edited by Rachel Elior and Peter Schäfer (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2005), pages 193-207.

Yosha, Nissim, “Abraham Cohen Herrera: An Outstanding Exponent of *Prisca Theologica* in Early Seventeenth-Century Amsterdam” in *Proceedings of the Fifth*

Symposium on the History of the Jews in the Netherlands, edited by Jozep Michman (Jerusalem: Hebrew University of Jerusalem, 1993), pages 117-126.

_____. "The Impact of Renaissance Writings on 17th-Century Kabbalist Herrera," in *Accademia 3* (Paris: Société Marsile Ficini, 2001), pages 113-129.

Zovko, Marie-Élise. "Understanding the Geometric Method: Hypothetical Dialectic in Proclus, Abraham Cohen Herrera and Baruch D. Spinoza," from *Arxai: Proclus Diadochus of Constantinople and his Abrahamic Interpreters* (conference: Istanbul, December 12-16, 2012).

Accessed via

https://www.academia.edu/9366682/Understanding_the_Geometric_Method_Hypothetical_Dialectic_in_Proclus_Abraham_Cohen_Herrera_and_Baruch_D._Spinoza

Shabbatai Zevi, the Sabbatean Movement and Its Aftermath

Ash, Sholom (AKA Sholem Asch). *Sabbatai Zevi: A Tragedy in Three Acts and Six Scenes*, with a prologue and epilogue. Authorized translation from the Russian version by Florence Whyte and George Rapall Noyes (Philadelphia: The Jewish Publication Society, 1930).

The original of this dramatization was likely in Yiddish.

Baer, Marc D. "Messiah King or Rebel? Jewish and Ottoman Reactions to Sabbatai Sevi's Arrival in Istanbul," *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Nine (2003), edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press).

Bali, Rifat N. "Another Enemy: The Dönme or Crypto-Jews," *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Nine (2003), edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press).

Barnai, Jacob. "The Sabbatean Movement in Smyrna: The Social Background," in *Jewish Sects, Religious Movements, and Political Parties* [PROCEEDINGS OF THE THIRD ANNUAL SYMPOSIUM OF THE PHILIP M. AND ETHEL KLUTZNICK CHAIR IN JEWISH CIVILIZATION HELD ON SUNDAY-MONDAY, OCTOBER 14-15, 1990] edited by Menachem Mor (Omaha: Creighton University Press, 1992).

Bessemer, Paul F. "Recent Turkish Works on the Dönmes," in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Thirteen (2005), edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press).

_____. "Who is a Crypto-Jew? A Historical Survey of the Sabbatean Debate in Turkey," *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Nine (2003), edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press).

Cardozo, Abraham Miguel. *Selected Writings*, translated and introduced by David J. Halperin; preface by Elliot R. Wolfson (New York: Paulist Press, 2001).

Carlebach, Elisheva. *The Pursuit of Heresy: Rabbi Moses Hagiz and the Sabbatian Controversies* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1990).

Within this book about an eighteenth-century anti-heresy campaigner is much on the dispersal of Lurianic *kabbalah*.

Davies, W. D. "From Schweitzer to Scholem: Reflections on Sabbatai Svi," in *Essential Papers on Messianic Movements and Personalities in Jewish History*, edited by Mark Saperstein (New York – London: New York University Press, 1992).

Elqayam, Avraham. "The Horizon of Reason: The Divine Madness of Sabbatai Sevi," in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Nine (2003), edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press).

Elqayam, Avraham, and Hary, Benjamin. "A Judeo-Arabic Sabbatian Apocalyptic Hymn," in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Two (1997), edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press).

Ezra, N. E. B. *Shabbethai Sebi: The Pseudo-Messiah*. Lecture delivered before a meeting of the LITERARY CIRCLE of the Shanghai Zionist Association on Sunday, 18th November, 1906, reprinted from "ISRAEL'S MESSENGER." 30th November, 1906 (De Souza & Co.).

Faierstein, Morris M. "Women as Prophets and Visionaries in Medieval and Early Modern Judaism," in *From Safed to Kotsk: Studies in Kabbalah and Hasidism* (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2013), pp. 70-84: § V on Vital the Sabbatean movement.

Freely, John. *The Lost Messiah: In Search of the Mystical Rabbi Sabbatai Sevi* (Woodstock – New York: The Overlook Press, 2001).

Goldish, Matt. "The Early Messianic Career of Shabbatai Zvi," in *Judaism in Practice: From the Middle Ages through the Early Modern Period* [PRINCETON READINGS IN RELIGIONS], edited by Lawrence Fine (Princeton – Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2001).

Gottreich, Emily Benichou. "Of Messiahs and Sultans: Shabbatai Zevi and Early Modernity in Morocco," in *Journal of Modern Jewish Studies*, Volume 12, Issue 2 (London: Routledge, 2013)

_____. *The Sabbatean Prophets* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2004).

Halperin, David J. *Sabbatai Zevi: Testimonies to a Fallen Messiah* (Oxford – Portland: The Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2007).

_____. "Abraham Miquel Cardozo and the Woman on the Moon," in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Eight, edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2003).

_____. "Sabbatai Zevi, Metatron, and Mehmed: Myth and History in Seventeenth-Century Judaism," in *The Seductiveness of Jewish Myth: Challenge or Response?* edited by S. Daniel Breslauer (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1997).

Idel, Moshe. "On Prophecy and Magic in Sabbateanism," in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Eight, edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2003).

_____. "Sabbateanism and Mysticism" = CHAPTER SIX of *Messianic Mystics* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2001).

_____. “Saturn and Sabbatai Tzevi: A New Approach to Sabbateanism,” in *Toward the Millennium: Messianic Expectations from the Bible to Waco*, edited by Peter Schäfer and Mark Cohen [STUDIES IN THE HISTORY OF RELIGIONS, vol. 77] (Leiden – Boston – Köln: Brill, 1998), pages 173-202.

_____. *Saturn’s Jews: On the Witches’ Sabbat and Sabbateanism* (New York: Shalom Hartman Institute/Continuum, 2010): § 2, “From Saturn to Sabbatai Tzevi: A Planet that Became Messiah,” pages 47-83.

Kastein, Joseph. *The Messiah of Ismir: Sabbatai Zevi*, translated by Huntley Paterson (New York: The Viking Press, 1931) = *Sabbatai Zewi: Der Messias Von Ismir* (Berlin: Ernst Rowohlt Verlag, K. G. A. A., 1930).

Lenowitz, Harris. “Leaving Turkey: The Dönme Comes to Poland,” in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Eight, edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2003).

_____. “The Messiah of Izmir: Shabtai Zvi” = CHAPTER 7 of *The Jewish Messiahs: From the Galilee to Crown Heights* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998).

Liebes, Yehuda. “A Profile of R. Naphtali Katz from Frankfurt and His Attitude towards Sabbateanism,” in *Mysticism, Magic and Kabbalah in Ashkenazi Judaism* [INTERNATIONAL SYMPOSIUM HELD IN FRANKFURT a. M. 1991—STUDIA JUDAICA Band XIII], edited by Karl Erich Grözinger and Joseph Dan (Berlin – New York: Walter de Gruyter, 1995).

Maciejko, Paweł. “A Jewish-Christian Sect with a Sabbatian Background Revisited,” *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Fourteen, edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2006).

_____. *Sabbatian Heresy: Writings on Mysticism, Messianism, and the Origins of Jewish Modernity* [THE BRANDEIS LIBRARY OF MODERN JEWISH THOUGHT] (Waltham: Brandeis University Press, 2017).

Marriott, Brandon. *Transnational Networks and Cross-Religious Exchange in the Seventeenth-Century Mediterranean and Atlantic Worlds: Sabbatai Sevi and the Lost Tribes of Israel* (Surrey – Burlington: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 2015).

McKeon, Michael. “Sabbatai Sevi in England,” in *AJS Review*, VOLUME TWO, edited by Frank Talmage (Cambridge: Association for Jewish Studies, 1977).

Naor, Bezalel. *Post-Sabbatian Sabbatianism: Study of an Underground Messianic Movement* (Spring Valley: Orot, Inc., 1999).

Oegema, Gerbern S. “Thomas Coenen’s ‘Ydele verwachtinge der Juden’ (Amsterdam, 1669) as an Important Source for the History of Sabbatai Sevi,” in *Jewish Studies Between Disciplines / Judaistik zwischen den Dsziplinen* [PAPERS IN HONOR OF PETER SCHÄFER ON THE OCCASION OF HIS 60TH BIRTHDAY], edited by Klaus Herrmann, Margarete Schüter, and Giuseppe Veltri (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2003).

Papo, Eliezer. “‘Meliselda’ and its Symbolism for Sabbatai Sevi, His Inner Circle and His Later Followers,” *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, vol. 35, edited by Daniel Abrams (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2016), pages 113-132.

Pardo, Eldad. "Niyazi Misri: An Ottoman Sufi Contemporary of Sabbatai Cries Out against God and His False Messiah," in *Sharqīyya*, Vol. 1, No. 1 (2010), pages 30-45.

Rapoport-Albert, Ada. *Women and the Messianic Heresy of Sabbatai Zevi 1666-1816* (Oxford – Portland: The Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2011).

Rosenstock, Bruce. "Abraham Miguel Cardoso's Messianism: A Reappraisal," in *AJS Review*, Volume 23, Number 1 (Cambridge: Association for Jewish Studies, 1998).

Ruderman, David B. *Early Modern Jewry: A New Cultural History* (Princeton – Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2010); see especially § Four: "Crisis of Rabbinic Authority" (pages 133-158) and the sub-chapter "Sabbatean Syncretism" (pages 163-173).

Saban, Giacomo. "A Mid-XIXth Century Description of the Sabbatai Sevi Episode," in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Two, edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 1997).

_____. "Sabbatian Genealogical Trees," in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Four (1999), edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press).

Scholem, Gershom. "Abraham Miguel Cardozo," in *Kabbalah* [articles from *ENCYCLOPEDIA JUDAICA*] (Jerusalem and New York: Keter Publishing House and Times Books, 1974; rpt. New York: Meridian, 1978; rpt. New York: Dorset Press, 1987), pages 396-400.

Also in *Kabbalah* concerning figures of the Sabbatean movement:

- "Hayyim Malakh," pages 429-431.
- "Joshua Heshel Zoref," pages 452-453.
- "Judah Leib Prossnitz," pages 441-442.
- "Moses Zucato," pages 449-451.
- "Nathan of Gaza," pages 435-440.
- "Nehemia Hayon," pages 412-415.

_____. *Shabbatai Sevi: The Mystical Messiah, 1626-1676*, translated by R. Zwi Werblowsky [BOLLINGEN SERIES XCIII] (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1973).

Sharot, Stephen. *Messianism, Mysticism, and Magic: A Sociological Analysis of Jewish Religious Movements* (Chapel Hill - London: University of North Carolina Press, 1982): CHAPTER 7, "The Sabbatian Movement" and CHAPTER 8, "Developments in Sabbatianism."

Şişman, Cengiz. "A Jewish Messiah from Tartaria in 1671: A New Source on the Lives of Sabbatean Prophets, Sabbatai Raphael and/or Shilo Sabbatai," in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Nine, edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2003).

_____. *A JEWISH MESSIAH IN THE OTTOMAN COURT: SABBATAI SEVI AND THE EMERGENCE OF A JUDEO-ISLAMIC COMMUNITY (1666-1720)*, PhD diss. (Cambridge: Harvard University, 2004) → *The Burden of Silence: Sabbatai Sevi and the Evolution of the Ottoman-Turkish Dönmes* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013).

van der Haven, Alexander. *From Lowly Metaphor to Divine Flesh: Sarah the Ashkenazi, Sabbatai Tsevi's Messianic Queen and the Sabbatean Movement* [MENASSEH BEN ISRAEL INSTITUUT STUDIES VII] (Amsterdam: Menasseh ben Israel Instituut, 2012).

Villini, Stefano. "Between Information and Proselytism: Seventeenth-century Italian Texts on Sabbatai Zevi, their Various Editions and the Circulation, in Print and Manuscript," in *Daat: A Journal of Jewish Philosophy Kabbalah*, 82 (Ramat Gan: Bar-Ilan University Press, 2016), pages LXXXVIII-CIII.

Wolfson, Elliot R. "Constructions of the Feminine in the Sabbatian Theology of Abraham Cardoso, with an Annotated Edition of *Derush ha-Shekhinah*," in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Three, edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 1998).

_____. "Immanuel Frommann's Commentary on Luke and the Christianizing of Kabbalah: Some Sabbatean and Hasidic Affinities," in *Holy Dissent: Jewish and Christian Mystics in Eastern Europe*, edited by Glenn Dynner (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2011), pages 171-222.

_____. "Messianism in the Christian Kabbalah of Johann Kemper," in *Millenarianism and Messianism in the Early Modern European Culture: Volume I. JEWISH MESSIANISM IN THE EARLY MODERN WORLD*, edited by Matt D. Goldish and Richard H. Popkin (Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers, 2001).

_____. "The Engenderment of Messianic Politics: Symbolic Significance of Sabbatai Sevi's Coronation," in *Toward the Millenium: Messianic Expectations from the Bible to Waco*, edited by Peter Schäfer and Mark Cohen [STUDIES IN THE HISTORY OF RELIGIONS, vol. 77] (Leiden - Boston - Köln: Brill, 1998), pages 203-258.

Jacob Frank

(variously Yakov, or Ya'akov, Franck, Yankiev Leivitch, 1726-1791)

"Frank became a messiah to thousands of Jews" (—Lenowitz' preface to *Sayings of Yakov Frank*, page 3); he claimed in his early career to be Shabbatai Sevi reincarnated. However, "in his later activity Frank did not see himself as a continuator or an incarnation of Sabbatai Tsevi or Berukhiah. As he put it, Sabbatai Tsevi 'did not accomplish anything.' It was only himself, Frank, who 'came to this world to bring forth into the world a new thing of which neither your forefathers nor their forefathers heard'" (—Paweł Maciejko, *The Mixed Multitude...*, page 19).

Kraushar, Alexandr. *Jacob Frank: The End to the Sabbataian Heresy*, translated from the Polish "Frank I Frakisci Polscy, 1726-1816" (FRANK AND THE POLISH FRANKISTS) by Stanley Bergman, edited by Herbert Levy (Latham - New York - Oxford: University Press of America, 2001).

Lenowitz, Harris. "Me'ayin yavo'ezri? The Help of Jacob Frank and His Daughter Ewa," in *Holy Dissent: Jewish and Christian Mystics in Eastern Europe*, edited by Glenn Dynner (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2011), pages 281-308.

_____. *The Jewish Messiahs: From Galilee to Crown Heights* (New York - Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998): CHAPTER 8. "The Polish Messiahs: Yakov Frank and His Daughter Eva."

_____ (trans.) *Tree 6–MESSIAH/Section I/Sayings of Yakov Frank* (Berkeley: Tree/Tzaddikim, 1978).

Maciejko, Paweł. “The Peril of Heresy, the Birth of a New Faith: The Quest for a Common Jewish-Christian Front against Frankism,” in *Holy Dissent: Jewish and Christian Mystics in Eastern Europe*, edited by Glenn Dynner (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2011), pages 223-249.

_____. *The Mixed Multitude: Jacob Frank and the Frankist Movement, 1755-1816* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2011).

_____. *Sabbatian Heresy: Writings on Mysticism, Messianism, and the Origins of Jewish Modernity* [THE BRANDEIS LIBRARY OF MODERN JEWISH THOUGHT] (Waltham: Brandeis University Press, 2017): CHAPTER VII “Jacob Frank and the Frankists.”

Mandel, Arthur. *The Militant Messiah, or The Flight from the Ghetto: The Story of Jacob Frank and the Frankist Movement* (Atlantic Highlands: A Peter Bergman Book published by Humanities Press, 1979).

Rapoport-Albert, Ada. *Women and the Messianic Heresy of Sabbatai Zevi 1666-1816* (Oxford – Portland: The Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2011): CHAPTERS 6-8.

Joseph ben Immanuel Ergas

Carlebach, Elisheva. *The Pursuit of Heresy: Rabbi Moses Hagiz and the Sabbatian Controversies* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1990); see § “Joseph Ergas and the Debate over the Role of Kabbalah,” pages 137-143.

Robinson, Ira. “Keeping the Faith: The Popularization of Lurianic Kabbala in the Eighteenth Century as Reflected in Rabbi Yosef Ergas’ *Shomer ’Emunim*,” in *From Antiquity to the Postmodern World: Contemporary Jewish Studies in Canada*, edited by Daniel Maoz and Andrea Gondos (Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2011).

Jacob Koppel Lifschuetz

Magid, Shaul. “The Metaphysics of *Malkhut*: *Malkhut* as *Eyn Sof* in the Writings of Ya’akov Koppel of Mezritch,” in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Twenty-Seven (2012), Special Issue: KABBALAH ON THE MARGINS – TRANSFORMATIONS OF KABBALAH IN ASHKENAZI SOCIETIES, edited by Daniel Abrams with guest editors Nathaniel Deutsch and Jean Baumgarten (Los Angeles: Cherub Press), pages 245-267.

Hayyim ibn Attar

Feuer, Rabbi Avrum Chaim (trans.) *Light of Life: A Compendium of the Writings of Rabbi Chaim ben Attar* (North Hollywood: Newcastle Publishing Co., Inc., 1986).

Mayse, Ariel Evan. “Ibn Attar, Hayyim ben Moses,” in *Encyclopedia of the Bible and Its Reception* 12 [HO TSUN SHEN – INSULT] (Berlin – Boston: Walter de Gruyter, 2016).

_____. “Or haHayyim: Creativity, Tradition, and Mysticism in the Torah Commentary of R. Hayyim ibn Attar,” in *Conversations 13* (Oxford – Malden: Blackwell Publishing Ltd, 2012), pages 68-89.

Moses Hayyim Luzzatto

KABBALISTIC WORKS:

Luzzatto, R. Moses C. *138 Openings of Wisdom* [QL”Kh PiTKheI HoKhMaH], translated by Avraham Yehoshua Greenbaum (Jerusalem: Azamra Institute, 2005).

The first full translation of Luzzatto’s summary of Lurianic Kabbalah, *138 Openings (or Gates) of Wisdom*, from the Hebrew text of Rabbi Chaim Friedlander.

_____. *General Principles of the Kabbalah* (Research Centre of Kabbalah, 1970; distributed by Samuel Weiser, New York).

An abridged version of Luzzatto’s outline of Lurianic Kabbalah.

_____. *The Kabbalah of the Ari Z’al according to the Ramhal, Rabbi Moshe Hayim Luzzatto*, translated and commented by Rabbi Raphael Afilalo (Montreal: Kabbalah Editions, 2004).

The ten chapters of Luzzatto’s 17-page *Kelalut ha-Ilan ha-Qadosh* are the basis of this introduction to Lurianic Kabbalah of RaMHaL.

OTHER WORKS:

Luzzatto, Moshe Chaim. *Da’ath Tevunoth* (THE KNOWING HEART), English translation by Shraga Silverstein (Jerusalem: Feldheim Publishers, 1982).

_____. *Derekh ha-Shem* (THE WAY OF GOD), English translation by R. Aryeh Kaplan (Jerusalem/New York: Feldheim Publishers, 1977).

_____. *Derech Tevunoth* (THE WAYS OF REASON), English translation by R. David Sackton and R. Chaim Tscholkowsky (Jerusalem: Feldheim Publishers, 1989).

_____. *Mesillat Yesharim* (PATH OF THE JUST), English translation by Shraga Silverstein (Jerusalem: Feldheim Publishers, 1966).

The ethical treatise for which Luzzatto is best known.

_____. *Secrets of the Future Temple*, translated by Avraham Greenbaum (Jerusalem: Temple Institute / Azamra Institute, 1999).

Secrets offers a translation of Luzzatto’s *Mishkney Elyon*, DWELLINGS OF THE SUPREME, which “explains the inner meaning of the Temple services and their role of bringing *Shefa* to the souls on their level and to angels on theirs” (p. 44).

_____. *Sefer haHigayon* (THE BOOK OF LOGIC), English translation by R. David Sackton and R. Chaim Tscholkowsky (Jerusalem: Feldheim Publishers, 1995).

STUDIES:

Bindman, Yirmeyahu. *Rabbi Moshe Chaim Luzzatto: His Life and Work*. (Northvale – London: Jason Aronson Inc., 1995).

Carlebach, Elisheva. *The Pursuit of Heresy: Rabbi Moses Hagiz and the Sabbatian Controversies* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1990); see CHAPTER 7, “The Luzzatto Controversy,” and CHAPTER 8, “Revival of the Luzzatto Controversy.”

Gallant, Batya. “The Alleged Sabbateanism of Rabbi Moshe Hayyim Luzzatto,” in *Tradition: A Journal of Orthodox Jewish Thought*, Volume 22, No. 3 (New York: Rabbinical Council of America, Fall 1986).

Ginzburg, Simon. *The Life and Works of Moses Hayyim Luzzatto, Founder of Modern Hebrew Literature* (Philadelphia: Dropsie College for Hebrew and Cognate Learning, 1931; rpt. Westport: Greenwood Press, 1975).

Guetta, Alessandro. “Kabbalah and Rationalism in the Works of Moshe Hayyim Luzzatto,” = CHAPTER 9 of *Italian Jewry in the Modern Era: Essays in Intellectual History* (Boston: Academic Studies Press, 2014), pages 179-220

Hansel, Joëlle. “Philosophy and Kabbalah in the Eighteenth Century: Moses Hayyim Luzzatto, Commentator of Maimonides,” in *Studies in Hebrew Language and Jewish Culture, Presented to Albert van der Heide on the Occasion of his Sixty-Fifth Birthday*, edited by Marin F. J. Baasten and Reinier Munk [AMSTERDAM STUDIES IN JEWISH THOUGHT, volume 12] (Dordrecht: Springer, 2007), pages 213-227.

Isaacs, A. S. *A Modern Hebrew Poet. The Life and Writings of Moses Chaim Luzzatto* (New York: Office of “The Jewish Messenger,” 1878).

Jacobs, Louis. *Jewish Mystical Testimonies* (New York: Schocken Books, 1977).

CHAPTER TWELVE, “The *Maggid* of Rabbi Moses Hayyim Luzzatto,” contains a letter from Luzzatto regarding “mystical claims made on [his] behalf” (page 137).

Marmorstein, Jenny. “Gleanings from Our Tradition: Moses Chaim Luzzatto’s The Way of the Tree of Life,” in *Tradition: A Journal of Orthodox Jewish Thought*, vol. 11, no. 3 (New York: Rabbinical Council of America, 1970).

An introduction to Luzzatto’s *Kalach Pitkei Hokhmah*.

Meyer, Jakob. *The Stay of Mozes Haim Luzzatto at Amsterdam, 1736-1743* (Amsterdam: Joachimsthal’s Boekhandel, 1947).

Rosen, Shlomo Dov. “Between the Homunculus Fallacy and Angelic Cognitive Dissonance in Explanation of Evil: Milton’s Poetry and Luzzatto’s Kabbalah,” in *Evil, Fallenness, and Finitude*, edited by Bruce Ellis Benson and B. Keith Putt (Palgrave Macmillan, 2017), pages 57-75.

Rubin, Zvia. “The Mystical Vision and its Interpretation: R. Moses Hayyim Luzzatto’s Qabbalistic Hermeneutics,” in *Experience et Ecriture Mystiques dans les Religions du Livre*, edited by Paul Fenton and Roland Goetschel [ETUDES SUR LE JUDAISME MEDIEVAL, tome xxii] (Leiden: Brill, 2000).

Sclar, David. *LIKE IRON TO A MAGNET: MOSES HAYIM LUZZATTO’S QUEST FOR PROVIDENCE*. Ph. D. diss. (New York: City University of New York, 2014).

This dissertation takes a close look at *Mesillat Yesharim*, “Luzzatto’s most enigmatic work.”

Tishby, Isaiah. *Messianic Mysticism: Moses Hayim Luzzatto and the Padua School*, translated by Morris Hoffman (Oxford – Portland: The Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2008).

Wolfson, Elliot. “Retroactive Not Yet: Linear Circularity and Kabbalistic Temporality,” in *Time and Eternity in Jewish Mysticism: That Which is Before and That Which is After*, ed. Brian Ogren (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2015), pp. 15-50.

See in particular § 4, “Simsim and the Replication of Difference,” pp. 38ff.

_____. “*Tiqqun ha-Shekhinah*: Redemption and the Overcoming of Gender Dimorphism in the Messianic Kabbalah of Moses Hayyim Luzzatto,” in *History of Religions*, 36 (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1997), 289-332.

Ezekiel Landau

Flatto, Sharon. “Believing the Censor? A Response to ‘Deists, Sabbatians, and Kabbalists in Prague: A Censored Sermon of R. Ezekiel Landau,” in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Twenty-Four, edited by Daniel Abrams (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2011).

_____. *The Kabbalistic Culture of Eighteenth-Century Prague: Ezekiel Landau (the ‘Noda Biyehudah’) and His Contemporaries* (Oxford – Portland: The Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2010).

Leiman, Sid Z. “When a Rabbi Is Accused of Heresy: Rabbi Ezekiel Landau’s Attitude toward Jonathan Eibeschutz,” in *From Ancient Israel to Modern Judaism: Essays in Honor of Marvin Fox*, edited by Jacob Neusner, Ernest Frerichs, and Nahum Sarna [BROWN JUDAIC STUDIES 159] (Atlanta: 1989) volume 3, pages 179-194.

Elijah ben Solomon, Gaon of Vilna, the GRA

Bakst, Joel David. *The Secret Doctrine of the Gaon of Vilna*, Volume I: *Global Transformation and the Messianic Role of Torah, Kabbalah and Science* (Manitou Springs: City of Luz Publications, 2008).

The Secret Doctrine... is an extended commentary on *Kol haTor*, especially *Kol haTor*’s CHAPTER 5, PART II : *Sha’ar Be’er Sheva*. Bakst refers to *Kol haTor* as “possibly the most extraordinary and revolutionary book in modern Jewish history” and “certainly Judaism’s best-kept secret” (—PREFACE, page 1). Bakst notes (page 13 and page 17, note 3) that the 1994 English version (listed below under “Shaklover”) omits the *Kol haTor*’s CHAPTER 5, PART II, as well as the final page of CHAPTER 5, PART I, along with other material. Bakst provides all of this missing material—translated and annotated in English—in *The Secret Doctrine*, CHAPTER 4 (page 133-170). For more information, go to www.cityofluz.com.

_____. *The Secret Doctrine of the Gaon of Vilna*, Volume II: *The Josephic Messiah, Leviathan, Metatron & the Sacred Serpent* (Manitou Springs: City of Luz Publications, 2009).

“According to the Gaon, the four phenomena that are axiomatic in his Kabbalah cosmology are but one trunk of the same tree, the actual higher-dimensional Tree of (Dualistic) Knowledge, and its infinite branches and twigs woven together. All are fractals of one singular underlying cosmic structure. ... The Gaon’s unique interdisciplinary Torah cosmology and futuristic messianic vision presented in these four

chapters can also be viewed as corresponding to the four alphanumeric digits of the sacred formula Y-H-V-H – the name formula of the God of the Torah. These are 1) the reunion of the Twin Messiahs, 2) the resurrection of the Sacred Serpent, 3) the Feast of Leviathanic consciousness, and 4) the revelation and glory of Metatron.” (—from the PREFACE, pages 7-8). For more information, go to www.cityofluz.com.

Brill, Alan. “The Mystical Path of the Vilna Gaon,” in *The Journal of Jewish Thought & Philosophy*, volume 3, Number 1, edited by Elliot R. Wolfson and Paul Mendes-Flohr (Harwood Academic Publishers GmbH, 1993).

“In this paper, I will present three aspects of the Vilna Gaon’s own unique mystical path to God, that will evidence the need for the Gra’s writings to be addressed in scholarship. I will start with his innovation within the theory of Lurianic Kabbalah that pertain to his mysticism, then I will examine the nature of his mysticism, and finally, I will conclude with his relationship to the world of Hasidic spirituality.” (—pages 131-132)

Elijah ben Solomon. “Journey of the Soul,” an allegorical commentary adapted from the Vilna Gaon’s *Aderes Eliyahu*, in *The Book of Yonah* (SEFER YONAH) by Moshe Schapiro (Brooklyn: Mesorah, 1997).

_____. *The Vilna Gaon Views Life, EVEN SHELEIMAH, the Classic Collection of the Gaon of Vilna’s Wisdom*, translated and annotated by Yaakov Singer, Chaim Dovid Ackerman (Southfield: Targum Press / Spring Valley: Feldheim, 1992).

Also listed as Ackerman, C. D. (trans.) *Even Sheleimah: The Vilna Gaon Looks at Life* (Jerusalem: Targum Press, 1994).

Etkes, Immanuel (or Emanuel). “The Gaon of Vilna and the Haskalah Movement: Image and Reality,” in *Binah*, Volume 2, STUDIES IN JEWISH THOUGHT / BINAH: Studies in Jewish History, Thought, and Culture, edited by Joseph Dan (New York – Westport – London: Praeger, 1989).

_____. *The Gaon of Vilna: The Man and His Image*, translated by Jeffrey M. Green (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002).

“He viewed the knowledge of the Torah that he acquired by force of hard intellectual work as the most exalted expression of divine revelation...” (page 3)

Feldman, Aharon. *The Juggler and the King* (Jerusalem – New York: Feldheim, 1996).

“An exciting expansion of the Vilna Gaon’s powerful ideas on the purpose of Creation, the Jewish People and its history and destiny, and the coming of Mashiach.”—Feldheim’s description.

Glotzer, Leonard R. *The Fundamentals of Jewish Mysticism: The Book of Creation and Its Commentaries* (Northvale – London: Jason Aronson Inc., 1992).

Glotzer quotes and refers to the Gaon’s commentary on SY throughout.

Greenberg, Gershon. “Elhanan Wasserman’s Response to the Growing Catastrophe in Europe: The Role of Ha’gra and Hofets Hayim upon His Thought,” in *The Journal of Jewish Thought & Philosophy*, volume 10, Number 1, edited by Elliot R. Wolfson and Paul Mendes-Flohr (Harwood Academic Publishers GmbH, 2000).

Hofets Hayyim, or Chofetz Chaim (1838-1933), was the popular name of Yisrael Meir Kagan Poupko, a leader of the Musar movement. Martyr Elhanan (or Elchonon) Bunim Wasserman (1874-1941) was one of Hofets Hayyim’s principle followers.

In English, see Wasserman's *Epoch of the Messiah* (Brooklyn: Ohr Elchonon Publications, n.d.) and *Reb Elchonon: The Life and Ideals of Rabbi Elchonon Bunim Wasserman of Baranovich*, by Aaron Sorasky (Brooklyn: Mesorah Publications Ltd, 1982).

Jacobs, Louis. *Jewish Mystical Testimonies* (New York: Schocken Books, 1977).

CHAPTER FIFTEEN, "The Mystical Experiences of the Gaon of Vilna," offers a report by R. Hayyim of Volozhin, haGra's primary disciple.

Landau, Betzalel. *The Vilna Gaon: The Life and Teachings of Rabbi Eliyahu, the Gaon of Vilna*. [ARTSCROLL HISTORY SERIES] (Brooklyn: Artscroll/Mesorah Publications, 1994).

Magid, Shaul. "'Adonai, Open My Lips': Preparing to Pray According to the Vilna Gaon," in *Journal of Textual Reasoning: The Journal of the Society for Textual Reasoning*, Volume 5, Number 1 (Charlottesville: University of Virginia, December 2007): PRAYER AND OTHERNESS, at <http://jtr.lib.virginia.edu/volume-5-number-1/adonai-open-my-lipspreparing-to-pray-according-to-the-vilna-gaon/>

Morgenstern, Arie. *The Gaon of Vilna and His Messianic Vision* (Jerusalem - New York: Gefen Publishing House, 2012).

Morgenstern's book is "based on discoveries originating in hitherto unknown documents that were buried in archives across the former Soviet Union," namely Poland.

"These diverse collections ... recount attempts by rabbis and kabbalists to reveal the timing of the messianic redemption by interpreting codes embedded in Scripture, and records their taking various mystical actions to hasten the redemption, using 'practical Kabbala (mystical practices), searching for the ten lost tribes, and making 'aliya'—immigrating to Erez Israel." (from the PREFACE, page xi)

Nadler, Allan. *The Faith of the Mithnagdim: Rabbinic Responses to Hasidic Rapture* [JOHNS HOPKINS STUDIES] (Baltimore - London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997).

Nadler gives special attention to Phineas ben Judah, Maggid of Polotsk (fl. 1788-1820, d. 1823), as "A Paradigm of Mithnagdic Religion."

_____. "The Scholarly Life of the Gaon of Vilna," in *Judaism in Practice: From the Middle Ages through the Early Modern Period* [PRINCETON READINGS IN RELIGIONS], edited by Lawrence Fine (Princeton - Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2001).

Schechter, Solomon. "Rabbi Elijah Wilna, Gaon," in *Studies in Judaism* (New York: Jewish Publication Society of America, 1896), pages 73-98; and (*idem*) *Studies in Judaism, A SELECTION* (Cleveland: Jewish Publication Society, and The World Publishing Company, 1958), pages 298-320.

Schochet, Elijah. *The Hasidic Movement and the Gaon of Vilna* (Northvale: Jason Aronson, 1994).

Shaklover (or Shklober), Rabbi Hillel (Rabbi Hillel Rivlin of Shklov). *The Voice of the Turtledove: In the Footsteps of the Mashiach* [orig. *Kol haTor*]. A Digest of Seven PIRKEI HA-GEULAH / CHAPTERS ON REDEMPTION; principle translator, Rabbi Yechiel Bar Lev (with K. Skaist) (Petach Tivka: [n.p.], [ca. 1994]; distributed by Feldheim, New York - Jerusalem).

Rabbi Hillel Shklober (1758-1838) was a grand-nephew and student of Rabbi Eliyahu, the Vilna Gaon, upon whose teachings *The Voice of the Turtledove* is based. Note, however, that this edition is incomplete; see above under "Bakst...*The Secret Doctrine*...."

Shulman, Yaacov Dovid. *The Vilna Gaon: The Story of Rabbi Eliyahu Kramer* (New York: C.I.S. Publishers, 1994).

Stern, Eliyahu. *The Genius: Elijah of Vilna and the Making of Modern Judaism* (New Haven – London: Yale University Press, 2013).

_____. “The Mitnagdim and the Rabbinic Era as the Age of Reason,” in *Time and Eternity in Jewish Mysticism: That Which is Before and That Which is After*, ed. Brian Ogren (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2015), pp. 136-147.

Wolfson, Elliot R. “Circumcision, Vision of God, and Textual Interpretation,” in *History of Religions*, 27 (University of Chicago, 1987); also in Wolfson’s *Circle in the Square* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1995).

The Gaon of Vilna (Elijah ben Solomon Zalman: 1720-97) is “cited to illustrate the linguistic process of God’s self-disclosure” through his comments on *Sefer Yezirah* and the *Zohar*.

_____. “From Sealed Book to Open Text: Time, Memory, and Narrativity in Kabbalistic Hermeneutics,” in *Interpreting Judaism in a Postmodern Age*, edited by Steven Kepnes (New York – London: New York University Press, 1996).

Wolfson discusses the Gaon of Vilna’s commentary on the *Sefer Yezirah*.

Hayyim ben Isaac Volozhiner, OR Chaim Volozhin

Ben Zion, Raphael (trans.) “Nefesh Hahayim (THE SOUL OF LIFE), Chapter One” [§§ 1-22], in *The Way of the Faithful: An Anthology of Jewish Mysticism* (Los Angeles: [Haynes Corporation], 1945); rpt. as *An Anthology of Jewish Mysticism* (New York: Judaica Press, 1981), pages 129-204.

Bokser, Ben Zion. *The Jewish Mystical Tradition* (New York: The Pilgrim Press, 1981): Chapter 26, “Hayim of Volozhin” (excerpts from *Nefesh haHayim*, Gate 4, pages 253-258).

Eliach, Dov. *Reb Chaim of Volozhin: The Life and Ideals of the Visionary “Father of Yeshivos”* (New York: ArtScroll, 1993).

Etkes, Immanuel. “Rabbi Hayyim of Volozhin’s Response to Hasidim” = CHAPTER 5 of *The Gaon of Vilna: The Man and His Image* (Berkeley – Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2002), pages 151-208.

Finkel, Avraham Yaakov (trans.) *Nefesh Hachaim: Rav Chaim of Volozhin’s Classic Exploration of the Fundamentals of Jewish Belief* (Brooklyn: Judaica Press, 2009).

This edition has been described as “Rabbi Abraham Yaakov Finkel’s excerpted colloquial translation ... [which] left out the translations of the many sections they deemed too sensitive” (Leonard Moskowitz’ introduction to *The Soul of Life*, page ix—listed below).

Finkel’s approach seems to reflect that taken by “those Yeshivot where [*Nefesh Hachaim*] is formally studied, [where] most only focus on specific sections ... [u]sually just the Fourth Gateway and sometimes also the Second Gateway” avoiding “sensitive Kabbalistic subject matter” (Avinoam Fraenkel’s introduction to *Nefesh HaTzimtzum*, page 29 and page 29, note 2—listed immediately below).

Fraenkel, Avinoam (trans./comm.) *Nefesh HaTzimtzum: Rabbi Chaim Volozhin's Nefesh HaChaim with Translation and Commentary*, two volumes (Jerusalem – New York: Urim Publications, 2015).

This edition provides the complete *Nefesh HaChaim* in English and Hebrew, along with a wealth of supplementary material, including a “deeply Kabbalistic” tract by Rabbi Yitzchak, Rabbi Chaim’s son, known by the title *Maamar BeTzeLeM*, DISCOURSE ON THE IMAGE.

Interestingly, the description of *Nefesh HaTzimtzum* at SeforimCenter.com states

After centuries of confusion, extensive clarification is provided of the central Kabbalistic concept of *Tzimtzum*, or the secret of how an infinite God occupies a finite world. Most importantly, it unequivocally demonstrates that the key Kabbalists, including the Vilna Gaon, Rabbi Chaim Volozhin and the Baal HaTanya, all unanimously agreed on the underlying principles of the concept of *Tzimtzum* and that contrary to widespread historical misunderstanding, there was no fundamental dispute about the philosophical principles of Judaism between the Hasidim and the Mitnagdim. Based on this, “*Nefesh HaTzimtzum*” shows that both *Nefesh HaChaim* and *Sefer HaTanya* present the same methodology for serving God which is rooted in their identical understanding of the concept of *Tzimtzum*.

Jacobs, Louis. *Jewish Mystical Testimonies* (New York: Schocken Books, 1977).

CHAPTER FIFTEEN, “The Mystical Experiences of the Gaon of Vilna,” offers a report on the GRA by R. Hayyim of Volozhin.

Lamm, Norman. *Torah Lishmah: Torah for Torah's Sake: In the Works of Rabbi Hayyim of Volozhin and His Contemporaries* [SOURCES AND STUDIES IN KABBALAH, HASIDISM] (New York: Ktav Publishing Inc., 1989).

Magid, Shaul. “Deconstructing the Mystical: The Anti-Mystical Kabbalism in Rabbi Hayyim Volozhin’s *Nefesh Ha-Hayyim*,” in *The Journal of Jewish Thought and Philosophy*, Vol. 9 (Yverdon: Harwood Academic Publishers, 1999), pages 21-67.

Moskowitz, Eliezer Lipa (Leonard). *The Soul of Life: The Complete Nefesh ha-Chayyim* (Teaneck: New Davar Publications, 2012; revised edition, 2014).

Nadler, Allan. *The Faith of the Mithnagdim: Rabbinic Responses to Hasidic Rapture* [JOHNS HOPKINS STUDIES] (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1997).

Unterman, Alan. *The Kabbalistic Tradition: An Anthology of Jewish Mysticism* (London – New York, etc.: Penguin Books, 2009).

Unterman’s collection contains numerous excerpts from *Nefesh Hachaim*.

Shneur Zalman of Lyady ם HaBaD

Ehrmann, Naftali Hertz. *The Rav: A Historical Narrative of the Life and Times of Rabbi Shneur Zalman of Liady*, translated and adapted by Karen Paritsky (Jerusalem – New York: Feldheim Publishers, 1977).

Elior, Rachel. “HaBaD: The Contemplative Ascent to God,” in *Jewish Spirituality* [II]: *From the Seventeenth-Century Revival to the Present*, edited by Arthur Green (New York: Crossroad Publishing Company, 1989).

_____. *The Paradoxical Ascent to God: The Kabbalistic Theosophy of Habad Hasidism*, translated from Hebrew by Jeffrey M. Green (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993).

Etkes, Immanuel. *Rabbi Shneur Zalman of Liady: The Origins of Chabad Hasidism* [TAUBER INSTITUTE FOR THE STUDY OF EUROPEAN JEWRY] (Waltham: Brandeis University Press, 2014).

_____. "Rabbi Shneur Zalman of Lyady as an Educator," in *Continuity and Change: A Festschrift in Honor of Irving Greenberg's 75th Birthday*, edited by Steven T. Katz and Steven Bayme (Lanham: University Press of America, Inc., 2010), pages 81-103.

Faienstein, Morris M. "The Literary Legacy of Shneur Zalman of Liadi on the 250th Anniversary of His Birth," in *From Safed to Kotsk: Studies in Kabbalah and Hasidism* (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2013), pp. 177-188.

Foxbrunner, Roman A. *HaBaD: The Hasidism of R. Shneur Zalman of Lyady* (Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 1992; rpt. Northvale: Jason Aronson Publishers, 1993).

Glitzenstein, A. C. *The Arrest and Liberation of Rabbi Schneur Zalman of Liadi: The History of Yud-Teth Kislev*, translated and adapted into English by Jacob Immanuel Schochet (Brooklyn: Kehot Publication Society, 1964; rpt. 1984).

Loewenthal, Naftali. *Communicating the Infinite: The Emergence of the Habad School* (Chicago – London: The University of Chicago Press, 1990).

_____. "Contemporary Habad and the Paradox of Redemption," in *Perspectives on Jewish Thought and Mysticism*, edited by A. Ivry. E. Wolfson, A. Arkush (Amsterdam: Harwood Academic Publishers, 1998) pages 381-402.

_____. "Rabbi Shneur Zalman of Liadi's *Kitzur Likkutei Amarim* British Library Or. 10465," in *Studies in Jewish Manuscripts* [TEXTS AND STUDIES IN MEDIEVAL AND EARLY MODERN JUDAISM 14], edited by Joseph Dan and Klaus Herrmann (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 1999).

Mangel, Rabbi Nissen (trans.). *Siddur Tehillat Hashem/Nusach Ha-Ari Zal* [PRAYER BOOK IN PRAISE OF G-D/VERSION OF R. ISAAC LURIA], according to the text of Rabbi Shneur Zalman of Liadi (Brooklyn: Merkos L'Inyonei Chinuch, Inc., 1996).

Mindel, Nissan. *Rabbi Schneur Zalman of Liadi: A Biography* (Brooklyn: Kehot / Merkos L'Inyonei Chinuch, 1999).

Schneur Zalman of Liadi, Rabbi. *Lessons in Tanya* (SHI'URIM BE SEFER HA-TANYA), 5 volumes, elucidated by Yosef Wineberg; translated by Levy Wineberg; edited by Uri Kaploun (Brooklyn: "Kehot" Publication Society, 1982-7).

_____. *Likkutei Amarim—TANYA*, Bi-Lingual Edition (Brooklyn: "Kehot" Publication Society, 1984).

Schneider, Sarah. "The Messianic Vision of Equality and Beyond...*The Voice of the Bride* by R. Shneur Zalman of Liadi (*Rashaz*)," in (idem) *Kabbalistic Writings on the Nature of Masculine and Feminine* (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson Inc., 2001), pages 225-269.

Wolfson, Elliot R. "Achromic Time, Messianic Expectation, and the Secret of the Leap in Habad," in *Habad Hasidism: History, Thought, Image* [חב"ד: היסטוריה, הגות ודימוי], edited by Jonatan Meir and Gadi Sagiv (Jerusalem: The Zalman Shazar Center, 2016), pages 45-86.

Bet El, Shalom Sharabi, Yosef Hayyim b. Elijah al-Hakam of Baghdad, וְ
Sha'ar ha-Shamayim

Bar Tzadok, Ariel. “Sefer Etz HaDa’at: The Kabbalistic Parameters of Adam’s Sin – translated from Sefer Da’at U’Tevunah – Chap. 17, by Rabbeynu Yosef Haim, the Ben Ish Hai,” (with commentary) = § I, CHAPTER 10, of *Walking in the Fire: Classical Torah/Kabbalistic Meditations, Practices וְ Prayers* (Tarzana: Kosher Torah Publishing, 2007), pages 168-183.

Bension, Ariel. “The Sepharadi Mystics of Beth-El in Jerusalem” = CHAPTER XV, in *The Zohar in Moslem וְ Christian Spain* (New York: Hermon Press, 1974).

See Jonathan Meir, “Ariel Bension and the Imagined Decline,” which is chapter 1, §1 (pages 1-3), in *Kabbalistic Circles in Jerusalem*, listed below.

Giller, Pinchas. “Between Poland and Jerusalem: Kabbalistic Prayer in Early Modernity,” in *Modern Judaism*, Volume 24, Number 3 (Oxford University Press, 2004).

_____. “Leadership and Charisma among Mizrahi Modern Kabbalists: In the Footsteps of Shar’abi—Contemporary Kabbalistic Prayer,” in *The Journal for the Study of Sephardic and Mizrahi Jewry*, Volume 1, Issue 2 (October-November 2007), edited by Zion Zohar, on-line at <http://sephardic.fiu.edu/journal/> [DEFUNCT LINK].

_____. *Shalom Shar’abi and the Kabbalists of Beit El* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008).

Giller’s book is the first full-length study of *Beit El* in any language.

Huss, Boaz. “The Imagined Decline of Kabbalah: The Kabbalistic Yeshiva *Sha’ar ha-Shamayim* and the Kabbalah in Jerusalem at the Beginning of the Twentieth Century,” in *Kabbalah and Modernity: Interpretations, Transformations, Adaptations*, edited by Boaz Huss, Marco Pasi, and Kocku von Stuckrad (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2010), pages 197-220.

Jacobs, Louis. *Jewish Mystical Testimonies* (New York: Schocken Books, 1977).

CHAPTER FOURTEEN, “The Mystical Meditations of Shalom Sharabi and the Kabbalists of Bet El.”

Meir, Jonatan. *Kabbalistic Circles in Jerusalem (1896-1948)*, translated by Avi Aronsky [ARIES BOOK SERIES: TEXTS AND STUDIES IN WESTERN ESOTERICISM/22] (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2016)

CHAPTER 2. “The Kabbalah Seminaries of Jerusalem.”

CHAPTER 5. “Concealment and Revelation: The Print Revolution,” pages 140-153.

_____. “Toward the Popularization of Kabbalah: R. Yosef Hayyim of Baghdad and the Kabbalists of Jerusalem,” in *Modern Judaism* 33 (Oxford University Press, May 2013), pages 147-172.

Yosef Hayyim b. Elijah al-Hakam of Baghdad. *Between Heaven and Earth: The Ben Ish Hai on Faith, the Nature of Evil and the Final Reckoning*. English adaptation by Daniel Levy; [editor, Eliezer Shore] (Jerusalem: Yeshivat Ahavat Shalom Publications, 1995—distributed by Feldheim, 1996).

_____. *The Challenge of Wealth and Poverty: The Ben Ish Hai on Wealth, Poverty, Charity and the Torah's View of Money*. English adaptation by Daniel Levy; [editor, Shalom Kaplan] (Jerusalem: Yeshivat Ahavat Shalom Publications, 1996 / distributed by Feldheim, 1996).

_____. *Days of Peace: The Ben Ish Hai on the Coming of the Messiah, the Return to Zion and the World to Come*. English adaptation by Daniel Levy; [editor, Yosef Harari] (Jerusalem: Yeshivat Ahavat Shalom Publications, 1999—distributed by Feldheim, 1999).

_____. *The Halachoth of the Ben Ish Hai* (4 volumes) (Jerusalem: Yeshivath 'Hevrath Ahavath Shalom,' 1989—distributed by Feldheim, 1991).

_____. *In the Service of the King: The Ben Ish Hai on Repentance, Closeness to God, Holiness and the Redemption of Sparks*. English adaptation by Daniel Levy (Jerusalem: Yeshivat Ahavat Shalom Publications, 1996—distributed by Feldheim, 1997).

Yizhak Isik Haver Waldman

Magid, Shaul. "Origin and Overcoming the Beginning: Zimzum as a Trope of Reading in Post-Lurianic Kabbala," in *Beginning/Again: Toward a Hermeneutics of Jewish Texts*, ed. Aryeh Cohen and Shaul Magid (New York: Seven Bridges, 2002); see especially pages 187-191.

Tishby, Isaiah. *Messianic Mysticism: Moses Hayim Luzzatto and the Padua School*, translated by Morris Hoffman (Oxford – Portland: The Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2008); see pages 467-9 and 473-4.

Shlomo Bar Heikel Eliashiv, "Leshem"⁵³

Bakst, Joel David. *Beyond Kabbalah: The Teachings That Cannot Be Taught, Preparing for the Messianic Era and Beyond* (Manitou Springs: City of Luz Publications, 2012).

_____. *The Secret Doctrine of the Gaon of Vilna Volume II: The Josephic Messiah, Leviathan, Metatron and the Sacred Serpent* (Manitou Springs: City of Luz Publications, 2009).

Leshem is cited and quoted throughout both of Baskt's books.

Pachter, Mordechai. *Roots of Faith and Devequt: Studies in the History of Kabbalistic Ideas* (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2004).

A passage from Solomon Eliashov's *LeShem Shevo ve-Ahlahmah* ("para. 1, section 1, fol.34c") on "circles and straightness" appears on page 137.

Rosenfeld, Joey. "A Tribute to Rav Shlomo Elyashiv, Author of *Leshem Shevo v-Achloma*: On his Ninetieth Yahrzeit," at *The Seforim Blog* (Thursday, March 10, 2016): <http://seforim.blogspot.com/2016/03/a-tribute-to-rav-shlomo-elyashiv-author.html?m=1>

⁵³ At the HASHKAFA CIRCLE website (<http://www.hashkafacircle.com/>) is a series of video *shiurim* (LESSONS) by Rabbi Triebetz, one of which is "Rabbi Triebetz's introduction to the Leshem, and the Leshem's introduction to the *Hakdamos u-Shearim*."

Schneider, Sarah. "Disparities of Gender Are the Cause of Evil: Excerpt from *The Diminished Moon* by R. Shlomo Elyashev (The Lashem) = CHAPTER 5 of *Kabbalistic Writings on the Nature of Masculine and Feminine* (Northvale - Jerusalem: Jason Aronson, 2001), pages 137-169.

_____. *Evolutionary Creationism: Kabbala Solves the Riddle of Missing Links* (Jerusalem: A Still Small Voice, 1985/2005); reference to and quote from Elyashev, pages 27-9.

Winston, Pinchas. *Deeper Perceptions: A Deeper Approach to the Weekly Torah Reading*. (Kiryat Yearim: Thirtysix.org, 2015).

Winston offers commentary on the weekly portions (*Bereishis, Noach, Lech-Lecha*, etc.) which are based on the teachings of Rabbi Shlomo Elyashiv (1841-1926). The introduction states (pages xiii-xiv),

Torah is deep. How deep? Infinitely deep. Much of it can be learned on a simple level, but that is only its beginning. There are still the levels of *Remez, Drush*, and of course, *Sod*. "Pardes" is an infinite orchard. ...

Then came Kabbalah. What had previously seemed deep and profound now appeared only to scratch the surface. It was like opening a door and finding an entire universe on the other side of it. Overwhelming was, *is*, an understatement.

Then came the Leshem. What had previously seemed deep and profound, but also difficult and confusing, became serenely elegant and even deeper and more profound. What appeared abstract and distant suddenly had a message about everyday life that could benefit any spiritually growth oriented person. It could even save lives, spiritually and physically.

This created a need to share. The knowledge demanded a wider audience, albeit on a more down-to-earth level of expression.

Yehuda Leib HaLevi Ashlag, Baal HaSulam

Most of the items listed below by Yehuda Ashlag, by Yehuda's son Baruch Ashlag, and by Michael Laitman are available at BNEI BARUCH KABBALAH EDUCATION & RESEARCH INSTITUTE, at <http://www.kabbalah.info/eng/content/view/frame/2373?eng/&main>.

Ashlag, R. Yehuda. *A Tapestry for the Soul: The Introduction to the Zohar by Rabbi Yehuda Lev Ashlag*. Explanation of the text uses excerpts collated from Rabbi Ashlag's other writings, and includes suggestions for inner work, compiled by Yedidah Cohen (Safed: Nehora Press, 2010).

"This book is a study guide to a key text in Kabbalah, *The Introduction to the Zohar* by Rabbi Yehudah Ashlag, as published in English in *In the Shadow of the Ladder*." -PREFACE, page ix. See the description of *In the Shadow of the Ladder*, below.

_____. *Entrance to the Tree of Life (HAKDAMOT, Part 2)* (Jerusalem: Research Centre of Kabbalah, 1977).

_____. *Entrance to the Zohar (HAKDAMOT, Part 1)* (Jerusalem: Research Centre of Kabbalah, 1974).

_____. *In the Shadow of the Ladder: Introductions to the Kabbalah*. Translated from the Hebrew with additional explanatory chapters by Mark Cohen and Yedidah Cohen (Safed: Nehora Press, 2002).

This collection's CHAPTER 3, "Introduction to the Zohar," is a new translation of the text which appears as PART ONE of *Entrance to the Zohar*, "A Preface to the Zohar." CHAPTER 4

is another substantial piece by Ashlag, “Introduction to the Study of the Ten Sefirot.” “*The Ladder*” in the title refers to Ashlag’s Hebrew translation (with embedded commentary) of the Zohar, *Ha Sulam*, which has been translated into English and published by The Kabbalah Centre.

_____. (Laitman, Rav Michael, comm.) *Introduction to the Book of Zohar: Original Texts of Rav Yehuda Ashlag in Hebrew and English* (Toronto: Laitman Kabbalah Publishers, 2005).

- Vol. I, *The Science of Kabbalah (Pticha)* includes “The Preamble to the Wisdom of Kabbalah,” and “Preface to the Commentary of ‘The Sulam.’”
- Vol. II, *Introduction to the Book Zohar* includes “Preface to the Book of Zohar,” which is the same text as *An Entrance to the Zohar, Part Two*; AND “Introduction to the Book of Zohar,” which is the same text as *In the Shadow of the Ladder, Chapter 3*, and *An Entrance to the Zohar, Part One*. Laitman presents both with extensive commentary.

_____. *Kabbalah: A Gift of the Bible* (Jerusalem: Research Centre of Kabbalah, 1984).
A collection of essays covering a wide range of subjects.

_____. *Ten Luminous Emanations. Volume 1: TEN LUMINOUS EMANATIONS, CONTRACTION AND LINE OF LIGHT* (1969); *Volume 2: CIRCLES AND STRAIGHTNESS* (1973) (Jerusalem: Research Centre of Kabbalah).

These volumes represent the first two parts of *Talmud Eser Sefirot: TZIMTZUM AND KAV and IGULIM AND YOSHER*.

Parts 1-8 and 16 of *Talmud Eser Sefirot* in English are online at BNEI BARUCH KABBALAH EDUCATION & RESEARCH INSTITUTE, founded by Rabbi Michael Laitman, at <http://www.kabbalah.info/eng/content/view/frame/32695?eng/content/view/full/32695&main>.

_____. *The Wisdom of Truth: 12 Essays by the Holy Kabbalist Rav Yehuda Ashlag*, edited by Michael Berg (Los Angeles: The Kabbalah Centre International, Inc., 2008).

Wisdom of Truth contains all the same essays as *Kabbalah: A Gift of the Bible* (noted above); *Wisdom...* includes the Hebrew on facing pages.

Ashlag, Rav Yehuda; Ashlag, Rav Baruch; and Laitman, Michael. *Kabbalah for the Student* (Toronto – Brooklyn: Laitman Kabbalah Publishers, 2008).

Kabbalah for the Student is a vast collection of articles (some quite lengthy), prefaces, excerpts, and explanations from R. Yehuda Ashlag, with additional material from Yehuda’s son Baruch, and Baruch’s personal assistant, Michael Laitman. Many of the writings presented in *Kabbalah for the Student* have been published elsewhere before. Some examples:

- “Disclosing a Portion, Covering Two” ≈ “Revealing a Handbreadth and Concealing Two” in *Kabbalah: A Gift of the Bible* (1984)—also in *The Wisdom of Truth* (2008)
- “HaIlan” (12 diagrams) = “Sefer Ha-Ilan” in Laitman’s *Introduction to the Book of Zohar* (2005)
- “Introduction to the Book of Zohar” ≈ “Preface to the Zohar” which is PART ONE of *An Entrance to the Zohar* (1974); the same text is given piece by piece, surrounded by commentary as “Introduction to the Book of Zohar” in Laitman’s *Introduction to the Book of Zohar* (2005)
- “Introduction to the Study of the Ten Sefirot” is also Chapter 4 of *In the Shadow of the Ladder* (2002)
- “Matan Torah” ≈ “The Giving of the Torah” in *Kabbalah: A Gift of the Bible* (1984)—also in *The Wisdom of Truth* (2008)

- “Matter and Form in the Wisdom of Kabbalah” ≈ “Substance and Form in Kabbalah” in *Kabbalah: A Gift of the Bible* (1984)—also in *The Wisdom of Truth* (2008)
- “Preface to the Book of Zohar” ≈ “An Introduction to the Zohar” which is PART TWO of *An Entrance to the Zohar* (1974); the same text is given piece by piece, surrounded by commentary as “Preface to the Book of Zohar” in Laitman’s *Introduction to the Book of Zohar* (2005)
- “Preface to the Sulam Commentary” = “The Preface to the Commentary of “The Sulam” in Laitman’s *Introduction to the Book of Zohar* (2005)
- “Preface to the Wisdom of Kabbalah” = “The Preamble to the Wisdom of Kabbalah” in Laitman’s *Introduction to the Book of Zohar* (2005), surrounded by Laitman’s commentary
- “The Arvut” = “Mutual Responsibility” in *Kabbalah: A Gift of the Bible* (1984)—also in *The Wisdom of Truth* (2008)
- “The Essence of Religion and Its Purpose” ≈ “The Quality and Goal of Religion” in *Kabbalah: A Gift of the Bible* (1984)—also in *The Wisdom of Truth* (2008)
- “The Essence of the Wisdom of the Kabbalah” ≈ “The Essence of Kabbalistic Wisdom” in *Kabbalah: A Gift of the Bible* (1984)—also in *The Wisdom of Truth* (2008)
- “The Peace” ≈ “Peace” in *Kabbalah: A Gift of the Bible* (1984)—also in *The Wisdom of Truth* (2008)
- “This is for Judah” ≈ “This is for Yehuda” in *Kabbalah: A Gift of the Bible* (1984)—also in *The Wisdom of Truth* (2008)
- Appendix C. “Diagrams of the Spiritual Worlds” ≈ “Album of Drawings” in Laitman’s *Introduction to the Book of Zohar* (2005), except all of the drawings are in reverse, and *Kabbalah for the Student* adds nine diagrams

Berg, Rabbi Michael (ed/comp). *The Zohar by Rabbi Shimon bar Yohai with THE SULAM Commentary of Rabbi Yehuda Ashlag. THE FIRST EVER UNABRIDGED ENGLISH TRANSLATION WITH COMMENTARY* (Tel Aviv – New York – Los Angeles: Yeshivat Kol Yehudah, The Kabbalah Centre International, [22 volumes + index: 1 volume, 1993; completed, 2001; index, 2003]); see Kabbalah Centre’s website: www.kabbalah.com

The Zohar, paragraph by paragraph, is presented in the original Aramaic and in English. The English is a translation of Rabbi Ashlag’s *Ha Sulam* (THE LADDER), *i.e.*, Ashlag’s Hebrew translation of the Zohar containing his “embedded commentary,” which, in the Kabbalah Centre’s edition, is shown in a different typeface from the Zohar text. (*Ha Sulam* was published in Jerusalem, 1945-1955.) Most chapters are introduced by short summaries, which, starting at volume 3, are headlined “A Synopsis.” Some chapters are further set up by additional paragraphs headlined “The Relevance of the Passage.” Each volume contains a glossary of Hebrew words, including biblical names and kabbalistic terms.

Ashlag’s commentary appositively identifies many of the Zohar’s widely (wildly) ranging referents with *sefirot*, *parzufim*, and other features fundamental to Lurianic developments. Elsewhere the commentary fleshes out the Zohar’s apparent shorthand (often by simply identifying the antecedents of potentially ambiguous pronouns). In some paragraphs, the commentary overwhelms the text; in others, no commentary at all appears. Of the *Sulam* commentary, Isaiah Tishby (—*Wisdom of the Zohar*, p. 105) says, “The explanations follow the Lurianic system and are of little help in clarifying the literal meaning of the text.”

Garb, Jonathan. *The Chosen Will Become Herds: Studies in Twentieth-Century Kabbalah* [= *Yehide ha-segulot yihyu la-‘adarim* (Jerusalem: 2005)], translated by Yaffah Berkovits-Murciano (New Haven – London: Yale University Press, 2009).

CHAPTER 4, “Psychological Notions of Power,” § THE ASHLAG CIRCLE, pages 52-58.

Hansel, David. “The Origin in the Thought of Rabbi Yehuda Halevy Ashlag: *Simsum* [= TZIMTZUM] of God or *Simsum* of the World?” in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Seven, edited by Daniel Abrams and Avraham Elqayam (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2002).

Laitman, Rav Michael. *The Zohar: Annotations to the Ashlag Commentary* (Toronto – Brooklyn: Laitman Kabbalah Publishers, 2009).

“This book offers a semantic translation of *The Zohar* itself, Rabbi Ashlag’s *The Sulam* commentary, and my own explanations. The book also contains the first part of *The Book of Zohar—Hakdamat Sefer Sefer HaZohar (Introduction of the Book of Zohar)*.” —*The Zohar*, page 18.

Schneider, Sarah. “Constriction Precedes Expanse: The Woodgatherer Was Tslafchad – R. Yehuda Ashlag’s Commentary on *Zohar* 3:157a,” in *Kabbalistic Writings on the Nature of Masculine and Feminine*. (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson Inc., 2001), pages 99-135.

Zagoria-Moffet, Adam. THE COMMUNIST KABBALIST: THE POLITICAL THEOLOGY OF RAV YEHUDAH ASHLAG (MA Thesis, New York: Jewish Theological Seminary, 2017).

LEVI ISAAC KRAKOVSKY, A STUDENT OF ASHLAG:

Krakovsky, Rabbi Levi Isaac. *Kabbalah: The Light of Redemption*. Brooklyn: The Kabbalah Foundation, 1950; rpt. Jerusalem/New York: Research Centre of Kabbalah (Yeshivat Kol Yehuda), 1970.

Krakovsky, a student of R. Yehuda Ashlag, presents a detailed summary.

Krakovsky, Rabbi Levi I. *The Omnipotent Light Revealed: Wisdom of the Kabbalah* (Hollywood: Kabbalah Culture Society of America, 1939; rpt. Brooklyn: Yesod Publishers, n.d. [ca. 1970]).

Meir, Jonatan. “The Beginnings of Kabbalah in America: The Unpublished Manuscripts of R. Levi Isaac Krakovsky,” in *Aries: Journal for the Study of Western Esotericism*, Volume 13, Number 2 (Leiden: Brill, 2013), pp. 237-268.

Other items of interest

Bar Tzadok, Ariel. “Comparative Kabbalistic Systems” [AUDIO TAPE] (Chicago: Yeshivat Benei N’Vi’im, 1995-2003).

Busi, Giulio. *Mantua e la qabbalah / Mantua and the Kabbalah*. Milano: Skira editore, 2001. Catalogue for the exhibition of Mantuan kabbalistic manuscripts, Mantova: Palazzo della Ragione (September 2001), and New York: Casa Italiana Zerilli-Marimò Center for Jewish History (March 2002), in Italian and English.

See, in particular, “The Mantuan Kabbalistic Workshop,” § 5. EZRA AND MENACHEM AZARYAH FANO: THE DISCOVERY OF THE LURIANIC KABBALAH, and “The Visual Kabbalah,” § 3. THE MANTUAN MYSTICAL DIAGRAMS.

Chajes, J. H. “Jewish Exorcism: Early Modern Traditions and Transformations,” in *Judaism in Practice from the Middle Ages through the Early Modern Period* [PRINCETON READINGS IN RELIGIONS], edited by Lawrence Fine. (Princeton – Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2001).

Cole, Peter (trans.) *The Poetry of Kabbalah: Mystical Verse from the Jewish Tradition* (New Haven – London: Yale University Press, 2012).

Contains passages from Shelomoh Alkabetz, Yitzhak Luria, Shabbatean hymns, Moshe Hayyim Luzzatto, and Shneur Zalman, among many others.

Dan, Joseph. “Manasseh ben Israel: His Attitude toward the Zohar and Lurianic Kabbalah,” in *Dan’s Jewish Mysticism IV* [GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS AND COMPARATIVE STUDIES] (Northvale: Jason Aronson, 1999).

_____. “Manasseh ben Israel’s *Nishmat Hayyim* and the Concept of Evil in Seventeenth-Century Jewish Thought,” in *Jewish Thought in the Seventeenth Century*, edited by Isadore Twersky and Bernard Septimus (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1987); and in *Dan’s Jewish Mysticism III* [THE MODERN PERIOD] (Northvale: Jason Aronson, 1999)

Drob, Sanford L. *Kabbalah and Postmodernism: A Dialogue* (New York: Peter Lang Publishing, Inc., 2009).

_____. *Kabbalistic Metaphors: Jewish Mystical Themes in Ancient and Modern Thought* (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson, Inc., 2000).

_____. *Symbols of the Kabbalah: Philosophical and Psychological Perspectives* (Northvale – Jerusalem: Jason Aronson, Inc., 2000).

Eichenstein, Zevi Hirsch. *Turn Aside from Evil and Do Good. An Introduction and a Way to the Tree of Life* [SUR ME-RA’ VA-’ASEH TOV, originally published in 1832, a year after the author’s death], translated, introduced, and annotated by Louis Jacobs (London – Washington: The Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 1995).

Derived primarily from Vital’s *Etz Hayyim* and *Peri Etz Hayyim*, *Sur mera va’aseh tov* “is unique in its blending of classical kabbalah with the approach of Beshtian Hasidism” (Jacobs’ PREFACE).

Fine, Lawrence. “Contemplative Death in Jewish Mystical Tradition,” in *Sacrificing the Self: Perspectives on Martyrdom and Religion*, edited by Margaret Cormack (Oxford – New York: Oxford University Press, 2002).

_____. “Pietistic Customs from Safed,” in *Judaism in Practice from the Middle Ages through the Early Modern Period* [PRINCETON READINGS IN RELIGIONS], edited by Lawrence Fine. (Princeton – Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2001).

_____. “Purifying the Body in the Name of the Soul: The Problem of the Body in Sixteenth-Century Kabbalah,” in *People of the Body: Jews and Judaism from an Embodied Perspective*, edited by Howard Eilberg-Schwartz [SUNY Series, THE BODY IN CULTURE, HISTORY, AND RELIGION] (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1992).

Finkel, Avraham Yaakov. *Kabbalah: Selections from Classic Kabbalistic works from Razi’el HaMalach to the Present Day* (Southfield: Targum Press, Inc., 2002).

Contains passages from Cordovero, Luria, Vital, Avraham Azulai, Shalom Sharabi, Luzzatto, the Vilna Gaon, Chaim Volozhin, Shneur Zalman, Ben Ish Hai, and Yehudah Ashlag, among many others.

Garb, Jonathan. "Alien' Culture in the Circle of Rabbi Kook," in *Study and Knowledge in Jewish Thought*, edited by Howard Kreisel (Beer Sheva: Ben-Gurion University of the Negev Press, 2006), pages 253-264.

_____. "Powers of Language in Kabbalah: Comparative Reflections," in *The Poetics of Grammar and the Metaphysics of Sound and Sign*, edited by S. La Porta and D. Shulman [JERUSALEM STUDIES IN RELIGION AND CULTURE, vol. 6] (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2007), pages 233-269.

_____. *Shamamic Trance in Modern Kabbalah* (Chicago – London: The University of Chicago Press, 2011).

See in particular CHAPTER THREE, "Empowerment through Trance" (pages 47-74), which discusses, among others, Hayyim Vital and Moshe Hayyim Luzzatto.

_____. "The Psychological Turn in Sixteenth Century Kabbalah," in *Les mystiques juives, chrétiennes et musulmanes dans l'Égypte médiévale (VII^e-XVI^e siècles)*, sous la direction de Giuseppe Cecere, Mirielle Loubet, et Samuela Pagani [RECHERCHES D'ARCHEOLOGIE, DE PHILOGIE ET D'HISTOIRE, tom. 35] (Cairo: Institut Français d'Archéologie Orientale, 2013), pages 109-124.

_____. *Yearnings of the Soul: Psychological Thought in Modern Kabbalah* (Chicago – London: The University of Chicago Press, 2015).

Giller, Pinchas. "Nesirah: Myth and Androgyny in Late Kabbalistic Practice," in *Journal of Jewish Thought and Philosophy*, VOLUME 12, NUMBER 3 (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2003).

Gutwirth, Israel. *The Kabbalah and Jewish Mysticism* (New York: Philosophical Library, 1987).

Brief discussions of topics and personalities, including "The Holy City of Safed, Cradle of Kabbalah," "Ari the Saint: A Star That Shone with a Light of Its Own," "Rabbi Chaim Vital: The Faithful Disciple of the Ari Hakodosh," "Rabbi Yeshayahu Halevi Horvitz: Shela the Saint" and "Rabbi Joseph Caro: Compiler of the *Shulhan Arukh*."

Hoffman, Edward (ed.) *The Kabbalah Reader: A Sourcebook of Visionary Judaism* (Boston – London: Trumpeter Books, 2010).

"Contributors" of brief passages include Joseph Karo, Moses Cordovero, Chaim Vital, Judah Lowe, Shalom Sharabi, Moses Chaim Luzzatto, Elijah ben Solomon, Schneur Zalman, Chaim Volozhin, Ben Ish Hai, and Yehudah Ashlag, and many others.

Idel, Moshe. "Emanuel Stein: An Unknown Kabbalist – A Preliminary Presentation," in *Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts*, Volume Twenty-Seven, Special Issue: KABBALAH ON THE MARGINS – TRANSFORMATIONS OF KABBALAH IN ASHKENAZI SOCIETIES, edited by Daniel Abrams with guest editors Nathaniel Deutsch and Jean Baumgarten (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2012).

_____. "Jewish Kabbalah and Platonism in the Middle Age and the Renaissance," in *Neoplatonism and Jewish Thought*, edited by Lenn E. Goodman (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1992).

_____. “Major Currents in Italian Kabbalah between 1560 and 1660,” in *Essential Papers on Jewish Culture in Renaissance and Baroque Italy*, edited by David B. Ruderman (New York: New York University Press, 1992).

_____. *Messianic Mystics* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2001); see CHAPTER FIVE “From Italy to Safed and Back.”

_____. “‘One from a Town, Two from a Clan’—The Diffusion of Lurianic Kabbala and Sabbateanism: A Re-Examination,” in *Jewish History*, Volume 7, Number 2 (Haifa: Haifa University Press, Fall 1993).

_____. “Ta’anug: Erotic Delights from Kabbalah to Hasidism,” in *Hidden Intercourse: Eros and Sexuality in the History of Western Esotericism* [ARIES BOOK SERIES, vol. 7], edited by Wouter J. Hanegraaff and Jeffrey J. Kripal (Leiden – Boston: Brill, 2008); see especially § DELIGHT IN ECSTATIC KABBALAH (pages 123-130).

Jacobs, Louis. *Jewish Ethics, Philosophy and Mysticism* [CHAIN OF TRADITION SERIES, volume 2] (New York: Behrman House, Inc., 1969).

The section on Jewish mysticism includes passages—with Jacob’s comments—from Cordovero, Vital de Vidas, Azikri, and several others.

_____. *Jewish Mystical Testimonies* (New York: Schocken Books, 1977).

Texts and introductions: Rabbi Joseph Karo, Rabbi Hayyim Vital, Rabbi Moses Hayyim Luzzatto, the Gaon of Vilna, Shalom Sharabi, along with many others.

_____. “The Uplifting of Sparks in Later Jewish Mysticism,” in *Jewish Spirituality II*, edited by Arthur Green (1987).

Katz, Jacob. “The Dispute between Jacob Berab and Levi ben Habib over Renewing Ordination,” in *Binah*, vol. 1: STUDIES IN JEWISH HISTORY, edited by Joseph Dan (New York: Praeger Publishers, 1989).

_____. “Halakhah and Kabbalah as Competing Disciplines of Study,” in *Jewish Spirituality II*, edited by Arthur Green (1987).

_____. “Post-Zoharic Relations between Halakhah and Kabbalah,” in *Jewish Thought in the Sixteenth Century*, edited by Bernard Dov Cooperman (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1983).

Liebes, Yehuda. “Myth vs. Symbol in the Zohar and in Lurianic Kabbalah,” in *Essential Papers on Kabbalah*, edited by Lawrence Fine (1995).

Magid, Shaul. “Origin and Overcoming the Beginning: Zimzum as a Trope of Reading in Post-Lurianic Kabbala,” in *Beginning/Again: Toward a Hermeneutics of Biblical Texts*, edited by Aryeh Cohen and Shaul Magid. (New York: Seven Bridges Press, 2002).

McLean, Adam. “Kabbalistic Cosmology and Its Parallels in the ‘Big Bang’ of Modern Physics,” in *The Hermetic Journal*, Issue Number 39, edited by Adam McLean (London: The Hermetic Research Trust, Spring 1988).

Meroz, Ronit. “Faithful Transmission versus Innovation: Luria and his Disciples,” in *Gershom Scholem’s MAJOR TRENDS IN JEWISH MYSTICISM 50 Years After*, [PROCEEDINGS OF THE SIXTH INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON THE HISTORY OF

JEWISH MYSTICISM], edited by P. Schäfer and J. Dan (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr [Paul Siebeck], 1993).

Mopsik, Charles. "The Masculine Woman," in *idem*, *Sex of the Soul: The Vicissitudes of Sexual Difference in Kabbalah*. (Los Angeles: Cherub Press, 2005).

Novak, David. "Self-Contraction of the Godhead in Kabbalistic Theology," in *Neoplatonism and Jewish Thought*, edited by Lenn E. Goodman (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1992), § 4. "Finalization and Freedom," pages 307-312.

Necker, Gerold. "The Female Messiah: Gender perspectives in Kabbalistic Eschatology and Christian Soteriology," in *Envisioning Judaism: Studies in Honor of Peter Schäfer on the Occasion of his Seventieth Birthday*, edited by Ra'anan S. Boustan, Klaus Herrmann, Reimund Leicht, Annette Y. Reed, and Giuseppe Veltri, with the collaboration of Alex Ramos, Volume 2 (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2013), pages 837-856.

Popkin, Richard. "Jewish-Christian Relations in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries: The Concept of the Messiah," in *Jewish History*, Volume 6, Numbers 1-2 (Haifa: Haifa University Press, 1992).

Posy, Arnold. *Mystic Trends in Judaism* (Middle Village: Jonathan David, 1966; rpt. 1994).

Sketches of Cordovero, Luria, Herrera, Luzzatto, and others.

Ruderman, David B. *A Best-Selling Hebrew Book of the Modern Era: THE BOOK OF THE COVENANT of Pinchas Hurwitz and Its Remarkable Legacy* [SAMUEL AND ALTHEA STROOM LECTURES IN JEWISH STUDIES] (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2014).

Pinchas Hurwitz (1765-1821) touted *Book of the Covenant* (*Sefer ha-Brit*) as a commentary on Hayyim Vital's *Sha'are Kedusha* (GATES OF HOLINESS). More, it appears to be an attempt to reconcile *kabbalah* and science.

Schochet, Jacob Immanuel. *Mystical Concepts in Chassidism. An Introduction to Kabbalistic Concepts and Doctrine* (Brooklyn: Kehot Publication Society, 1979).

Schwartz, Eilon. "Response. Mastery and Stewardship, Wonder and Connectedness: A Typology of Relations to Nature in Jewish Texts and Traditions," in *Judaism and Ecology: Created World and Revealed World*, edited by Hava Tirosh-Samuelson. (Cambridge: Center for the Study of World Religions, Harvard Divinity School, 2002).

Schwartz offers four models of the Jewish approach to the natural world: (1) the rational, (2) the biblical, (3) the "radical amazement model" highlighted by Abraham Joshua Heschel, and (4) the "holy sparks model" of Lurianic Kabbalah developed by later Hasidim.

Shokek, Shimon. "Creation and *imitatio dei*: Lurianic Kabbalah and Hasidism," in *Kabbalah and the Art of Being* [THE SMITHSONIAN LECTURES] (London - New York: Routledge, 2001), pages 38-60.

Torchinov, Evgeny A. "The Doctrine of the Origins of Evil in Lurianic and Sabbatean Kabbalah and in the 'Awakening of Faith' in Mahayana Buddhism," in

Kabbalah: Journal for the Study of Jewish Mystical Texts 5, edited by D. Abrams and A. Elqayam (Los Angeles [Culver City], Cherub Press, 2000).

Unterman, Alan. *The Kabbalistic Tradition: An Anthology of Jewish Mysticism* (London – New York, etc.: Penguin Books, 2008).

“I have concentrated on the three main areas of Kabbalistic creativity: the literature of the Zohar, the Lurianic corpus as expressed by Chaim Vital and parts of the Chasidic mystical tradition.” (page xlii)

Thus, there are snippets not only of Vital, but of Moses Jonah, Joseph Irgas, Moshe Chaim Luzzatto, Abraham Azulai, Chaim of Volozhin, and others.

Wineman, Aryeh. *Ethical Tales from the Kabbalah* (Philadelphia: The Jewish Publication Society, 1999).

“Fifty-four charming and evocative tales... [which] form the important transitional link between the esoteric mystical teachings of the sixteenth-century kabbalists and the populist tales of the eighteenth-century European Hasidim.” (back cover)

Sources include *Emek haMelekh* (Naphtali Bacharach), *Or haYashar* (Meir Poppers), *Reshith Hokhmah* (Elijah de Vidas), *Sefer Haredim* (Eliezer Azikri), *Shulhan Arukh shel haAri* (Jacob Zemah), and many other works.

Zinberg, Israel. *A History of Jewish Literature, Part Five: ITALIAN JEWRY IN THE RENAISSANCE ERA*, translated from the Yiddish by Bernard Martin (Cincinnati: Hebrew Union College / New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1974).

See CHAPTER 5, “The Decline of the Renaissance Era; Leo de Modena,” and CHAPTER 6, “Joseph Solomon Delmedigo.”